

**REGULAR COUNCIL MEETING
OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF BROOK PARK, OHIO
TO BE HELD ON TUESDAY, APRIL 21, 2015**

The meeting was called to order by Council President Patten at 8:16 p.m., the clerk called the roll and the following Members of Council answered:

D'AMICO, TROYER, SALVATORE, MENCINI, BURGIO, POWERS, HIGGINS

Also in attendance were Mayor Coyne, Finance Director Cingle, Service Director Cayet, Safety Director Byrnes, Recreation Director Fields, Engineer Piatak, Law Director Jamison, Building Commissioner Hurst.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PRECEDING MEETINGS:

1. Public Hearing held on March 24, 2015.

Motion by Mr. Higgins, supported by Mr. Mencini, to approve as printed. Members of Council voted AYE. The motion carried.

2. Special Council meeting held on March 24, 2015.

Motion by Mr. Mencini, supported by Mr. Burgio, to approve as printed. Members of Council voted AYE. The motion carried.

REMARKS FROM THE AUDIENCE (ON ANY SUBJECT):

Rudolph Viol
15550 Paulding Blvd.

Mr. Viol read a manifest into the records that is on file in the Council office.

Joan Markusic
13911 Bellbrook

Ms. Markusic thanked Mr. Jamison for answering the questions from last meeting and thanked the clerk for the public records information. Ms. Markusic asked for an explanation as to why with all road work needed in the city that the city is spending money helping to repair West 130th Street from Brookpark Road to Lorain Avenue, instead of using those monies in the city repairing city streets. At the last meeting I stopped the Mayor on his way out because he made a comment that started me thinking a little bit. The Mayor said that he would like \$115.00 from each resident to help with the budget and I was wondering if that was each personal resident or each household. I would also like to know why when the whole tax and everything was going on why none of that...I remember getting all those flyers and papers and other mail but never actually saw that in any of the information received; I think better

Remarks from the Audience on any subject: cont.

public relations may have helped in making that go further and maybe stopped the services and layoffs that have happened. I would also like to know about the budget and Mr. Cingle did a really good job at explaining things to me but I noticed when I'm sitting in the audience and there is talk amongst Council. The Mayor is talking about the budget and how the city needs money and I have no problem with any of that. I know that the city hasn't had a tax increase in quite a few years and understand all of that but what I want to know is why the Mayor is up there playing bad cop and all the Council Members and everybody else just sits there and not supporting him its kind of like you become oblivious; that's what it looks like to me. I understand financial issues everybody has them but if I received a piece of paper in my mailbox delivered or handed to me saying do vote for this; don't vote for this. If somebody would have said \$115.00 more per household in the City of Brook Park considering there hasn't been a tax increase in this many years will help the city's budget and bring the city up to where it needs to be, create minimal layoffs and keep our seniors programs that are needed. I would have said that's a good point but nobody said that to me, none of you and I'm really ticked off because right now this city is in this crisis and all we here about is all this bad news. When if somebody would have came to the doors of the residents' in the City of Brook Park and said we have not had a tax increase in this many years we need \$115.00 per household to get the city back up and running in a comfortable living zone that everybody in the world wants. I am sure every single resident would have been behind you and I'm very angry and I'm very disappointed that not one of you had the guts to stand up and say that to me or anybody else in this city. Because if you would have said it to one person, like to me, I would have been door to door and telling everybody and I'm angry at all of you.

Ray Peterlin
5811 Wengler Drive

Mr. Peterlin stated I'd like to know why it is that before we had the senior program we paid \$15,000 a year, spent \$10,000 for snow removal and now budgeted \$80,000 and if you figure the \$15,000 that we did before that'd be \$95,000. Why are we going with private contractors instead of hiring seasonal workers? If you don't want to pay the employees the city has get seasonal workers in; the post office does it, the airport does, the Cleveland Indians and Cleveland Browns do it and it's done all over the world including the military brings in seasonal workers. At \$95,000 you have approximately 9,000 man-hours that would buy to do the snow removal. You'd have enough monies for the seniors; you'd have enough monies to do the sidewalks if there was only ¼" of snow out there; why are we insisting that we use private contractors. Is there a conflict of interest somewhere that we don't know about? Why the change you put \$80,000 in the budget roughly-approximately \$40,000 per person that is a senior; I'd like it explained because I don't understand.

REPORTS FROM STANDING COMMITTEES:

Aviation & Environmental Committee – Chairman, Higgins

Mr. Higgins stated no report this evening.

Finance Committee – Chairman, D'Amico

Mr. D'Amico met earlier this evening and approved 22 items.

Legislative Committee – Chairman, Troyer

Mr. Troyer stated the Legislative Committee has one item on tonight's agenda.

Parks & Recreation Committee – Chairman, Burgio

Mr. Burgio stated Parks & Recreation has one item on tonight's agenda.

Planning Committee – Chairman, Mencini

Mr. Mencini stated the next meeting will be held on May 4th.

Safety Committee – Chairman, Salvatore

Mr. Salvatore stated the Safety Committee has nothing on tonight's agenda.

Service Committee – Chairwoman, Powers

Mrs. Powers stated Service Committee has nothing on tonight's agenda.

Board of Zoning Appeals – Chairman, D'Amico

Mr. D'Amico stated the next Board of Zoning Appeals meeting will be May 4th providing applications are made.

REPORTS FROM SPECIAL COMMITTEES:

Southwest General Health Center – Trustee, Salvatore

Mr. Salvatore stated no report this evening.

Berea Board of Education – Representative, Mencini

Mr. Mencini stated Superintendent Sheppard spoke to the Ohio House of Representatives Finance and Appropriations Committee on April 18th and submitted testimony on the concerns of ending the Tangible Personal Property Tax Reimbursements to school districts. Berea Schools went from \$8.7 million dollars down to \$5.4 million dollars, the highest to lowest in tangible personal reimbursements taxes. Property values for the Berea City School District since 2008 have dropped \$2 million dollars and expenditures have been cut by consolidating of buildings; reducing staff and combining services. Mr. Sheppard asked the House of Representatives to leave the tangible personal property tax at its current levels or return them to the levels promised when the tax was phased out. The second item is the State School Board voted on April 13th to eliminate the so-called five-of-eight rule which is the minimum number of school nurses, librarians, counselors, and teachers. The Berea City School District will be able to do as many as they see fit for the district, which is a tough call. The 23rd Annual Distinguished Alumni Hall of Fame will be held on April 30th with eight former students and staff will be inducted.

REPORTS FROM BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS:

INTRODUCTION OF RESOLUTIONS OF COMMENDATION:

REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE MAYOR:

Mayor Coyne stated Mr. Viol it's always a pleasure to have you come and inform us of issues that we have in the city. Council President and I are west-enders and if we only saw one deer in our yard we'd kind of be grateful. You're experience with the salad I had 13 of my Aphrodite's eaten a year ago and didn't know what to do. Went online and was made aware of a service that cost \$200.00 every year to spray my bushes with two coatings. The person that comes out looks like ghost busters and comes out and puts one on making them sick when they eat it and one to deter it; so we're aware of your situation believe me. The only thing that scares deer when coming home from a Council meeting is the garage door opener; they have no fear of being around anyone. The Mayors are trying to get something together to address this problem and there are a lot of rules and regulations in our way. So it's not that we don't know about it and the Council doesn't know about it what do we do about it? We have enough hunters in Brook Park if we could have an open season here the problem would be taken care of except for siding, picture windows and everything getting shot up by people that miss. So again, we're aware of it and hear you and believe me there are areas of the city, for instance, the cemetery has population problems as well, but we'll keep plugging at it. Joan the nicest thing that was said about me in a long time I'm playing the 'bad cop' and tonight you'll probably see some Council Members playing the 'bad cop' because they're not too happy with the Mayor this evening. I would beg the differ with you on a couple of things Greg Cingle and I published very thorough reports, we had a campaign committee that put out very clear what the needs of the city are and how they have to be addressed in the future and will probably have some discussion this evening. It is clear that we've done a yeomen's job on this budget and are down to about 140 employees and, unfortunately, when you say no it comes back to the 'bad cop' and I have to deliver the services to you and no one wants their service cut. Not the seniors, not the young people, not a myriad of things that we have and I have them for you and will give you some. We put in there, Jimmy Mencini always like to say this, what kind of city do you want to live in? The second part of the equation is how much are you willing to pay for it because those workers that were once at the Ford Plant that provided all of this to us are gone and probably never coming back again. It's important that folks here this and I'll give you an example and you'll read in a publication or see on these posts Ford lands 200 jobs at Brook Park, Ohio. We did an analysis and are so grateful to have those jobs. Those jobs as Dennis will tell you as a former Ford official there are going to be paid \$15.49 an hour and in doing the calculations with the tax department the city will take in out of those new jobs \$48,000. We're grateful to have the \$48,000 but it's nowhere near what the city needs to deliver the services that we want. I'm sure that many of you received a publication talking about how we're going to have to charge how yard waste and bulk waste are going to be picked up in the city and I'm sure we'll have a great debate on that up here. In order for us to make it on the operating side we have to change the way we deliver services to the town and no one wants to talk about outsourcing or privatization; if we don't do this we're not going to survive. Mr. Peterlin talked about

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

the seniors and where he gets his calculations from I have no idea because I haven't seen anything close to them. We want to help our seniors live here, I'm a senior and while I don't need the help we want to do that, we've always done that, but how could we do that? We certainly didn't charge you, Joan, you made a point the last time there was an increase in the city income tax was 1999. We're going to have a town hall on April 30th and I want to have a discussion about these issues, a frank discussion, no literature, not publications, no people hiding behind anonymous names or committee or anything else. Because this community has to have that discussion and quite frankly I'm disappointed that folks aren't up here asking for my head, 1,000 of them, I'm disappointed in that. Because that's the kind of discussion that we have to have up here, an honest and frank discussion, by elected officials telling you what the facts are. If we change the way we operate in privatizing some of our services within the existing budget with minimal growth, if we stay around 140 full-time employees we can make it; but as Joan pointed out we want to do a little more than that; we want to a little bit more than that; so we asked you. You talked about it was \$115.00 it was an average on the property tax. What was that for, what was it for? The Recreation Department and the senior services and some people, who cares about recreation, a lot of people do. A couple of thousand senior families in this town that care a lot about it. There's a couple of thousand recreation families that care about it, so what happened? You're going to hear this statement the Mayor is closing the Recreation Center room by room. We were able to lease out two portions of that center to generate rent for us and the third one didn't work. We have a proposal coming before Council on energy-savings and we might be able to have the money through this savings program to pay for redoing the roof at Recreation Center and redo all of the heating units. Because I'll tell you this if we cannot do it, you're going to hear it first, if we can't provide heat and cooling to the recreation center we cannot keep it open. That's why we're looking at consolidating everything and these are discussions that you don't see granted but that's what is going on as we're moving around here. I hope that more folks come and talk about at the forum that we're going to have because, again, you need to read what we send you because it's important and we did the newsletter in the beginning of the year; everything that I'm talking about was in that newsletter. Evaluating various things that we need to do and these are truthful there's no magic number. I have a Councilman that asked me and I have an anonymous person ask me what did I do with the \$1.6 million dollars that I saved? It's not in the drawer anymore we're not deficit spending with that money and we painstakingly went through these things. Our greatest problem up here and I respect all my colleagues, I believe all of them have the goodwill of the city at heart, but it's very difficult to run for election when you're not giving anybody anything and this election it cannot be that way. You have to help give to us, you have to help us, you have to look in the mirror and say what do I want from my town? Look at the streets anybody proud of the streets that they're driving down, anybody out there tonight, I don't think so. We need just a quick perusal right now to fix and generate the streets in the town, I wish we just

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

had potholes we don't, is about \$10 million dollars with the engineer, service director and I walking around the town. We can't do that in this budget or the limited growth we're going to have in this budget for the next decade. The citizens of Brook Park if nothing else, they're going to have to come to the plate and I will talk to Council about putting on this November an increase in the city income tax for capital improvements only. Not for my inflated double, triple dipping salary, not for my three to five to \$2 million dollar that does not exist, not all of this crap. The reality is for this city we need to have this because if you won't do that, if you won't help me and this Council, we're just spinning our wheels and wasting your money and quite frankly wasting our time. We need to attack this problem and if you will help up and you will support this it's the perfect measure. So when someone is coming to your door any problems or complaints, wait a minute, what do you think? Do you think we need the money to fix the streets and you say no as a candidate well how are you going to do it? How do you propose to do it? That's our problem here no one wants to deal with this and you have groups of folks, that have the right to express what their opinions are, they happen to be dead wrong and whose going to pay for that in end; you are. You just heard Jimmy Mencini give a report from the schools how those evaluations are going besides the cutting of things like that. We are cutting our own throats in this town because our salvation only belongs with us. There's nobody else that's going to come here and help us out. So I hope that you come on the 30th, I hope that we have this discussion, I would like Council and us to argue about a lot of things because we have fundamental differences probably about how we're going to do it. The wonder years of Brook Park is gone and it's never coming back again and I think you heard me say this \$3 million dollar number. We need \$160 million dollars in payroll investment in this town to really what is really needed all over the place so that we can continue to have the wonder year's service. Ladies and gentlemen take a look around you even the communities that have done well, or seemed to surpass us, are all outsourcing things because of the cost. Our major problem was why we're proposing changing doing things is because we're not going to have those employment numbers anymore. Even if we grow a little bit with some jobs we can't afford to have those kinds of numbers delivering services but we can if we change and do combinations. Finally, Mr. Peterlin let me address this question. I believe that we can deliver to our seniors by a voucher program through private contractors because it costs less. When you raise these seasonal people that should be for all the unions not just the service workers, not just the service workers. Finally let me say this, my difference about this why I suggested that we outsource this was for a couple of different reasons. Number one I believe long-term on the capital side where our problems are will save us a lot of money. It won't save us any money this year because we've already cut the employees but how many times, every single day, we can't fix the catch-basins, we can't clean the sewers, we can't keep our parks clean. We have to be able to deploy with existing people we have left where the needs of the city is. So I hope we have this debate because it's healthy that you hear this so that you see what decisions are made. Everyone has

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

great ideas at the end of the day the 'bad cop' has to deliver services to this town and that's what I'm elected to do and that's what I'm going to do as long as I'm here. I thank you for coming and hope that you come on the 30th and hope they read those notices.

Mr. D'Amico stated to the Mayor we talked about two points here. I understand with the capital improvements we still have to go through and we talked about that when we did the original budgets. When we spoke of privatization, you and me originally a while ago, I gave you my opinion about privatization. One of the great things as your story is that you were a rubbish man, became a Councilman and then became Mayor. One of those things discussed is I told you as the person I am that I didn't want to let these great jobs in the city go and think that the service would be inferior and people would notice at the time; you had a difference of opinion, granted, and we talked about that a little bit more. Now it comes down to the yard waste, at this point in time, we had the discussion about privatization but did not have the discussion on yard waste and I received the mailer in my mailbox just like everybody else did; granted you had it at the luncheon and I apologize I couldn't make it at that time. Otherwise, we balanced the budget, we cut the deficit and put programs in place and went ahead and placed money in Economic Development and had money that we don't spend on reserves like we all know in six years. We moved monies to the sanitation and placed in money to bring back some service department workers and as of June 1st we're not going to pick up the yard waste anymore. So I guess I want to know how this came about and why we can't do what we're doing when we gave money and the tools to do the job at the time. Continue to do it that way rather than changing it abruptly without us knowing or no discussion. Also, my opinion, it may be wrong because I don't know the service department like Brian Higgins and Dennis Patten, but place the grass in the blue containers and place the recyclable refuse on the lawn like we used too and try to get this trough this until we could figure out a better plan.

Mayor Coyne responded thank you, Councilman, to my knowledge Council made no appropriation for additional employees in the service department; it's the same number. The fact of the matter is this we can find a lot of different ways around it and clearly I have a profound respect for people who pick refuse because I understand what it is. The reality is that there is not a city around us that is picking refuse up with their own crews; everyone is outsourcing it. From my standpoint, again, we had discussion and one of the things I will say is this is the kind of things we should have in a much longer meeting. You heard me say then that we would not have the personnel to do this and, to my view and maximizing service, and we're looking at the total service department a work that has to be accomplished. The best thing for us is to move forward and privatize this service; it will have no effect on the people of this city and it will have everything. The other issue is on the capital side had I been here as Mayor before and never left I was going to privatize the

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

rubbish collection like everybody else around us and utilize that service personnel to do other work; we've already laid them off and I have no indication that I'm bringing anybody back. Because to me that's a short-term solution to a long-term problem that we need to address. So the fact of the matter is we had a short discussion about this, I want a lot of discussion about this but I raised to you my concern about picking up the yard waste, I very clearly did. As a matter of fact even in the newsletter going back to the beginning of the year talked about how the way we have to change the way of delivering services. This thing about me coming up through the ranks and all those kinds of things is a wonderful story but it's not going to exist anymore today. Again, unless you have a main influx and if we had money I would still make the recommendation that we outsource this work because long term cost-effective to the city on the capital side. Right now those trucks, Service Director Cayet will speak in his report, about what we had to put into them this year on the one-arm bandits and what we have dealing with the older trucks that we have that are failing. So this year alone by making the outsource deal we relieved our capital fund of \$250,000 and that to me makes sense because the longer we put this on, Councilman, we're going to have to buy a truck or two here in a year so that's another \$50,000 you're going to have spread out there for five years. So, to me, from the capital side and the operating side particularly when we can redeploy city employees to do much needed work here; to me, makes the most sense.

Mr. D'Amico stated we did put monies into the budget to deploy two people to be brought back, you did not know that?

Mayor Coyne responded no sir, you never had a discussion with me and I'm not bringing them back.

Mr. D'Amico continued you do know we put monies in there?

Mayor Coyne interjected I did not have any idea because you had no discussion with me about it whatsoever.

Mr. Higgins stated I did have a discussion with the Mayor in regards to privatization on behalf of Council as the Pro-Tem. First let me address a remark that Joan (Markusic) made, unfortunately, \$115.00 is what the Mayor is referring to maybe the average home might pay for a levy, I question in the first place, that most cities that want to pass a levy they put a safety levy on or they put a police or fire levy on; they don't put a recreation levy on. I had discussions with the Mayor and disagreed with the strategy of that but I'm not sure what the Mayor's strategy was at that time. Second of all on the same ballot was an income tax increase from 2% to 2 ½% which I support, to this day I support, it's obvious that this community needs more revenue and I've never shied from that but having said that. It was not just one thing it was both things so it wasn't just \$115.00 it might have been \$115.00 to

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

some people, but maybe not to others. As far as Mr. Peterlin goes there's contracts that the Laborers 1099 has so you can't just bring in seasonal workers when you feel like it and when there are laid-off members they have to come back before even able to bring in seasonal workers. This Council did put a couple of laborers back into the budget when we took the privatization out. The Mayor did put privatization of rubbish in the budget that was brought forward to Council and had about three weeks to pass this budget. After polling Council I asked the Mayor to take a back seat to privatization and get the budget passed and take a look at in the future. I told him that, at this point in time, to make some rubbish changes in this community after everything else that we've around here such as HomeDays not having rides and what I'm hearing through the rumor mill the Mayor will have rides to me; the Mayor has not communicated that to me but we're having HomeDays, we're not having HomeDays. The same with senior snow plowing maybe vouchers; senior bus rides taken away and given back; close a fire station, open a fire station. We talked about privatizing paramedics and now we're not going to privatize paramedics, closing the pool and opening the pool and now the pool is closed and maybe Euphoria is going to come in here. I'm not going to criticize the Mayor for all that because he's got a job that, quite frankly, I didn't run for. So having said that here we are today where we're at but this Council asked the Mayor to take a step back and let's get the budget passed then we'll take a look at the privatization. We had a couple of week period to pass this budget and nobody took a good look at Republic's numbers. I run the community of Parma and we've had Republic over there for 4 ½ years and I think Republic is over in the community that Mr. Patten works at but you also have to remember when looking at revenues this city, and I will agree with the Mayor 100%, has been longstanding somewhat spoiled because of our Ford Motor Company revenues. The community I work in has a police levy, they have a fire levy, they have a front-footage fee for sewer assessments and they have a 2 ½% income tax. Over in Parma Hts. they have a 3% income tax and charge for rubbish pickup and I'm not sure if they have levies in that city. These are the differences of our communities and sooner or later we're going to have to pay for some of these things if we want to have a nice community to live in and I think that's the goal to everybody. I am disappointed with the Mayor this yard waste stuff; by the way Mr. Mayor I've never received a flyer. I patiently waited every single day hoping to get mine and if no one knows where I live; I live on Elmdale and my backyard faces Park and Settlement Acres. So I figured once I received the flyer my phone would be ringing off the wall from Park and Settlement Acres residents' because they have big yards and would have to make multiple trips to what I look at as a failed plan of people taking stuff down to the service garage; I have addresses of people that have called me. The plan is ridiculous, the plan is not doable and I've looked at this as something that the Mayor's hid from this Council until the day of his State of the City on the 13th he mentioned it there. I read it on Cleveland.com. later on that afternoon and the flyers hit the mail the next day. So this, I think, a move by the

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

Mayor to bring people out in arms like he said he's disappointed that people are not hanging out this door so he can have a forum to address our deficiencies in the budget for the city. Where I can applaud for that, Mayor, trying to get people out so you can have your forum I think you went about it the wrong way with this yard waste because, quite frankly, that program is not doable.

Mr. Burgio stated I wanted to touch on that subject also I received numerous calls from residents' and many of them were seniors; I think all of them were seniors. They are concerned, upset and frustrated and many are asking how am I going to do this? Some of them don't even drive so my take on this it's a real hardship but it's unfairly a disappointment affecting seniors and I think that's what I have the most problem with. I'm willing to take a look at privatizing at a later date but I thought if we can get through four months helping the seniors I'd prefer that. So I'm hoping we can accomplish that and I think the money is in the budget, I talked to Greg, the other day and think its there. I don't have all the numbers but I think we can do that and would like to see this happen to give the seniors a break. This came on so abruptly that nobody had time to think about how they're going to do it and I think it's going to be a hard time for them, that's my comments.

Mr. Mencini stated that's where I came from (service garage) of my 30 years probably rubbish 20 years. One of my former co-workers here Mark Morgano and Mark like me was a dedicated worker and on the aspect of that we went the extra mile and would do it again. My only concern is while other cities do Republic and like I told people that called me, I feel bad for some of the seniors that might have to take their rubbish down, but they're making contingency plans; these people told me that mulch and whatever should be thrown in the rubbish. My point in what if this Republic doesn't work necessarily just for Brook Park. I thought the Mayor said one thing that was important that maybe this should have been discussed a little more, gone into length a little more but it was a heck of a service and we're proud to get it. I also agree that we have other issues too like sewer; I get tree lawns calls, snow plowing calls and many calls. Street calls I covered with questions to the Mayor the last two Council meetings that the streets are terrible and the Mayor said he needs \$10 million dollars and I said I need \$20 million dollars in my ward. It's a good service and maybe it's something like my colleague, Carl Burgio said, may need to be discussed a little more until we get it rectified and get it right.

Mrs. Powers stated this nice neat flyer that the Mayor put out, we had our last meeting April 7th and these came to Council on April 8th and then a day or two later I started getting phone calls. Both of these men talked about the seniors and senior means anyone over 55 or 60. What about the people that are living alone and are over 80 and 90? How are they going to get their rubbish down to the service garage because some of them are in wheelchairs, walkers and so forth. Not only that but what about the working people the hours are 7:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m., Monday

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

through Friday and three hours on Saturday. If you're working Monday through Friday daytime hours these people can't get their rubbish there unless taking hours off of work and they cannot get there on Saturday in that three hour window because how many people do we have working in the city, possibly 5,000. Can you imagine having 5,000 people lining up to deliver the rubbish to the service garage on Saturdays; it's totally ridiculous to even think of it. Mrs. Powers asked Finance Director Cingle what would it cost approximately just for yard waste pickup?

Mr. Cingle responded to privatize?

Mrs. Powers stated no, you gave a breakdown last winter of what it would cost for seniors snow plowing and had a figure for that. Do you have a figure for what it would cost just for yard waste pickup?

Mr. Cingle responded I don't have a breakdown for yard waste pickup.

Mayor Coyne interjected can I answer that for you, you're talking about six men everyday plus the landfill disposal costs and if I can't address you in particular I want to address my fine friend, Brian Higgins, in a little while. I think it's ridiculous too because the reality is a simple solution to this issue is to outsource this work. It's cost-effective and as a matter of fact under this proposal that I made. Republic who we take our rubbish too now will buy the city's trucks and cans. You wouldn't know the difference and it wouldn't be an assessment; that a lot of people think this is. It wouldn't cost one dime and we can pussyfoot all the things but the reality is we need to change the way we deliver that service, period. So it's not simply hiring two guys and I think Council should understand in this budget we have a one-time little infusion here of some sound insulation monies that allows us to do some things; next year you're going to be facing the same thing. So to call back workers unless through attrition that number will go back again but we shouldn't be in the garbage business and many folks sitting up here know that and the community should know that; nobody's in it anymore. The issue that Mr. Mencini raised about what happens I don't know of a city, that I'm aware of, since the 1970's that went away from privatization. Finally, let me say this I have a great deal of respect for Brian Higgins and I think I had some role in him being in public life as he is and maybe that's why he's aggravated with me, I don't know. I don't need a ploy to do anything, Brian, the reality is as you know this you have to have a notification thing. I think one thing where I'm going to agree with Councilman Troyer, possibly, that maybe we should have one meeting a month that's a Caucus only because there's a lot of things up here that we do pretty fast but my thrust is I'm disappointed. Because I thought more people would read it and come up here and could here, I hope they all come on the 30th so that we can discuss all these issues; safety, service, the operations of this city, what revenues we need and how because you need to know that. There is one thing that I forgot we're going to live-stream that meeting and

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

Council has been after me since I came back here to get our meetings on form of media so people can watch the meetings. Brandon Reynolds is here today and if anyone watches it online he's the one who puts it on there. There is a box that the city is buying at a cost of \$500.00 and there's a WI-FI issue in this building here but for the price of purchasing that box and two small cameras we can stream these meetings live in the amount of somewhere between \$250.00 and \$300.00 a month, where people can watch from their homes that I think will be more helpful to everybody and I think it's important that we have these differences and these debates. All I can bring to you is my personal experience and what I'm trying to do here I take very seriously. So I'm not trying to have a ploy with anybody and I try to put out as much information that I can and, quite frankly, I thought we would have more discussion...I did have a lengthy discussion with Brian and thank you for that about this when we were looking at privatization. Quite frankly, all we have was one very short meeting because no one seemed to want to talk about it. So we want to look at this and I have legislation that will be introduced tonight and hopefully it will be properly assigned so that we can talk about all of these things.

Mrs. Powers stated some of us have only been here a little over a year, but in 2013 all city services were intact, the streets didn't look so bad, the rubbish was being picked up. In 2014 the rubbish was being picked up and the first half of the winter the snow was plowed. Now it's 2015 and we have about \$500,000 less in this budget than last year and saved almost a \$500,000 in PERS (Public Employee Retirement System) payments and the lay off 17 people. So with all those layoffs and with not having that expense to PERS anymore there is practically the same monies in the budget so I cannot understand why we cannot fund grass cutting and the rest of the services; because it just isn't grass cutting. Yard waste means that residents' have to haul tree branches and everything else to the service garage. Back to the dollars and cents if there was enough money to do this in 2013 and 2014 and now it's 2015 and the city has more money and fewer people there should be enough monies to do it. Also now that the pool is closed this city had 17 lifeguards that are not getting paid anymore and I think Finance Director Cingle mentioned that last year that snow plowing would cost about \$70,000 and we assume that grass clippings would cost around \$70,000. Any of those lost employees or the loss of all those lifeguards that were paid \$7.50 to \$15.00 per hour and we have 44 basketball/athletic helpers. So I don't want to take anything away from the children or the seniors but with this money that we have and the fewer employees I don't think we should have to take anything away.

Mayor Coyne stated it's not an addition to the \$1.6 million dollars is not an addition to it's reducing expenses. You don't realize how much money we cut out of the operation of the Recreation Center; can you read your budget? Several hundred thousand dollars so, therefore, in order us to get into condition...I'm not going to leave this community without its reserve intact, without delivering services within a

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

reasonable growth amount; if we have growth at all. So you made it through one year with all of these things and they were mostly done with layoffs and as I told you we don't have the personnel to do this. We can deliver services at a reasonable amount with quality by making some changes; I've said that since the day I walked in here. That's where we need to get but in order to do that we can't convince the public if we're not convinced ourselves. I don't think you believe a thing that I say, I don't think you believe a thing that the finance director says, that's not my fault. All I'm saying to you is this if we don't change this problem is not going to go away it's going to resurface next year and we separate the capital side of this. With the capital side I don't think there is anything that I can do or Council can do to generate the kind of money needed on the capital side. So I'm willing to keep doing things progressively, we have to get out of this 1990 mode and get into the 21st Century.

Mr. Higgins stated along the way you used the words argue and debate I think that's where part of the problem comes in here. I'd rather use the terms discuss and share ideas. So I guess one of the questions I have for you, Mayor, why is it that it was such a big secretive thing. This informational brochure that was going out that it wasn't shared with any Council Members including when Mr. Burgio asked our service director the week before about yard waste pickup. Mr. Cayet's response was for sure it 's coming out but no one mentioned about it's not a insignificant change it's a pretty major change to the way we're doing business around here; why wasn't any of that shared with us? You had your State of the City on April 13th, that flyer hit the mail on the 14th that means those rules were printed up, at the printer, at the mail house all ready to go. Why the big secret, Mayor?

Mayor Coyne stated there's no secret whatsoever and you more than anybody else should understand what this situation is. Refuse collection should be outsourced and you know it. The fact of the matter the change in any operations of the city when the flyer was done, as a matter of fact there's a mistake, it supposed to be 7:00 a.m. to 7:30 p.m. Having said that we need to talk about a real...and I agree with you I haven't had...I'm talking about the people of the city discuss this because we have all kinds of people out there debating things. We have never had a debate since I've been up here with all of you, we've discussed our issues and will continue to do so. If we can find a better way I'm all for it but I'm just saying to you I don't want to waste time, waste effort and waste money not getting to the end result; there is an evidently about some of the things that we have to do, is all I'm saying to you.

Mr. Troyer stated Mr. Mayor this is going to sound redundant but I'm taking it a little bit further this time. You mentioned quite a few times you saved \$1.6 million dollars in reducing payroll. We also know that we saved \$432,00, I believe, off of not having PERS payments. That comes to over \$2 million dollars and our budget last year, at the end of the year, was \$20.3 million and had the \$80,000 surplus at the end of last year. The budget we passed that we passed this year was roughly about

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

that same about \$20.3 million. So the question is where did the \$2 million dollars go if you cut \$2 million dollars how is the budget the same? Actually your budget would have been \$20.8 million dollars.

Mayor Coyne responded the expenditures are just about level, the only unknown is how do we get the \$80,000 from the year before; mostly by the contribution of the employees to their health care and there were no raises given. So the expenditures are basically flat so our goal was to get to \$3.7 million in reserve; spend what we're taking in and provide some programs to the city. In my view us spending parking tax money to operate is still wrong; so that's all part of the equation. So the fact is that's how we arrived to where we are today and we're still short in our reserve policy. Let's put it this way there are still issues out there that you're not going to agree with me about that I thought we'd saving another \$500,000 on consolidation of fire services in this city. Therefore, there's a lot more to be done here and these are discussions that need to be had with this community going forward. At the end of the day we have to take the direction from them whether we agree with or not. So you are under some thought process that this \$1.6 million or \$400,000 is in a drawer someplace it is not, it is not, and my original proposal to the Council was that we privatize these services because we had reduced the numbers and we should not increase those numbers. If the unions will entertain some part-time and I mean all of them not just one of them; I'd be willing to take a look at that short-term. But I'm still telling you that at the end of the day, particularly in the service situation, the city should outsource that and put in a central in a unique situation in our city for fire service. I think Mr. Higgins brought up about the privatization I'm 100% behind it and I've had discussions with Council Members about it and usually I have a pretty good reading and the reason I did what I did is so we get the budget passed and we need to continue to have that discussion. Because that is still a very large chokehold on the operation of this city and has been for quite sometime of centralizing city services. So there are still discussions to have and in my view there are still very weak budget considerations that we are doing for reasons, right now that don't make a lot of sense to me but enable us to go forward.

Mr. Mencini stated Mayor, two quick comments and a question; when I made that statement about when you can't go back and you said that trucks cost \$1.25 million dollars. If we go to Republic and years down the road we want to go back and its \$1.25 million dollars now with the cost of living and everything imagine what the trucks would be; that's why a lot of cities can't even look at. I am open for discussion on any issue to move this city forward just so you know and that applies to all. The one question I do have is you mentioned that the service garage on the layoffs and through attrition and people leaving for whatever reasons such as Workmen's Compensation or work disability and the people laid off would be called back first, does that still stand true?

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

Mayor Coyne responded yes, we have an agreement with the union and the fact is that all of our people are been placed except one because we have good people. That is our plan and that is the agreement that I have with the union. I can remember this back when I worked for the service department what's going to happen? Who knows what's going to happen at the end of the day you could lease trucks and get equipment back. This equipment because of its use and while its not relatively old we still have five years to pay on the trucks and the fact of the matter is that's going to be a cost; they're going to have to be replaced. I believe that this Council and this Mayor, maybe not us, but somebody is going to move to that area because it makes the most sense. Your sensitivity to employees, believe me I have, and no one...

Mr. Mencini interjected they're not all happy where they're at they'd like to be here.

Mayor Coyne continued no one likes the success story of Brook Park better than me. I had Grant Segal talking to me today when we lost the Marines and he wanted to know why the community responded the way it did. We are a city that was built by Veterans' on the GI Bill and I'm part of it that's how I came here and I understand their emotions. As the Mayor of this city along with many Members of this Council we provided more services to our seniors and our children than any city in America; and it's painstaking for me not to be able to do that anymore in the fashion that we used to be able to do it. We can do it again if we think smart and do right, that's what we have to do. Can we ever be again? I don't see that growth I just don't see it; that example to Ford Motor the city is getting two hundred more employees. I was over in that plant and telling Council President Patten how many workers used to be involved in the assembly of those engines and to see those small pods with the robots broke my heart. Then we have to argue with our Senate and President that wants to sign another trade deal that won't only hurt the American worker but hurt Ford Motor Company because of the manipulation of the currency. These are all things and Brook Park is a little town and what happens in the world affects us so much on a given day. NASA Glenn everyone thinks this is great in talking with the director and while they are maintaining the budget there will be no increase in employment so that means a flat revenue source for the city. If you heard me talk before why this is important of \$50... or \$100... because when you look at the minimal amount generated by 200 pretty good paying jobs with benefits what do you think one snowstorm could cost us? What do think one flood could cost us? Why are we trying to help people with their cross-connections because some of it is their own fault. No, it's not its part the city's fault and it's part their fault. This city is at the end of the line for building all the sewers that this city can. I want and Council wants every person to be able to leave their homes on a weekend when it rains and hopefully not have water in their basement; everyone wants that up here. Our sidewalk program you're in violation well, who cares, it's the city's tree. We have to

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

keep doing these things or this city is going to fall behind and where does that money come from? So I hope that all of you came here tonight that are aggravated can see that we have good people up here that really care, we have differences. This community has to make a decision to help us make decisions; what are you going to do to help us out? That's the point that we are at now everyone wants to avoid but we can't avoid it anymore.

Mr. Higgins stated still under the Mayor's report I'd be remiss if I didn't thank Rudy Viol and Estelle for coming tonight and as far as the deer go. One of the biggest problems happens to be ourselves because you wouldn't believe up in the neighborhood where I live and Estelle lives how many people feed the deer. I don't usually call the animal control officer on people I'd rather knock on the door and explain to them what they're doing to their neighborhood. By giving a feed-source the animals will come back on a regular basis to feed. The one resident on Franklyn actually stopped feeding the animals and leaving a water dish out instead she put the hose in the driveway having a stream of water to water them, I couldn't believe it. Our own worst enemy with the deer is the residents' and neighbors' that are feeding them. Second of all Mayor under your report, I know you were in some negotiations with, I believe, Euphoria about leasing space at the Recreation Center; are you still in negotiations Mr. Mayor?

Mayor Coyne responded no, he figured it out it would cost him about \$100,000 a year to lease the space and I don't know of a health club that can afford that. We're not giving up we're trying to find people that have needs and stuff like that.

Mr. Higgins stated if there is anything that you think this Council can do maybe put a committee together to start doing some searching, I'd be glad to help out.

Mr. Troyer commented I also think that feeding wild animals is against city ordinances.

Mr. Patten stated to Mayor Coyne I also received a lot of communications while out talking to a lot of residents' that are frustrated with this change. The city has shrunk and we've all gone through a downturn in money but you have to stay competitive if you're going to stay in business, Mayor. Local 1099 did have seasonal part-time workers in their agreement and you guys negotiated that out. Those were put in there to keep them competitive so that we could continue this service. Republic does a good job, don't get me wrong, but it's not apples to apples to what you have in this community. What you have is first-rate service and I'm telling you I wouldn't give it away, we'll move the agenda.

**REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM OTHER DEPARTMENTS,
COMMISSIONS, PUBLIC OFFICIALS:**

Engineer Piatak

Mr. Piatak stated the Smith Road Sanitary Sewer Project is progressing and is currently at the Sylvia Drive intersection and heading south; there are probably less than 1,000 feet of mainline sewer to go in and maybe three manholes to install. Mr. Piatak stated to Ms. Markusic comments about the West 130th Street Project. Brook Park is only responsible for the share of that project within our corporate limit which is basically from Brookpark Road to the south side of I-480; on the west side of the road. It is a very small portion of the project that Brook Park will be participating in and the county is running this project which is being funded by license plate tax dollars that the county collects and I don't believe the city can access those dollars for local roads anyway. There is no line item in the budget for the West 130th Street Project.

Motion by Mr. Higgins, supported by Mr. Mencini, to go out of the Regular Order of Business to letter N 1 – Introduction of Resolutions and Ordinances: (Second Reading): Members of Council voted AYE. The motion carried.

1. RESOLUTION NO. 7-2015, HONORING THE BEREAMIDPARK'S ACADEMIC CHALLENGE TEAM AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY. Introduced by Councilman Salvatore and Council Members Troyer, Mencini, Powers, Higgins, Burgio, D'Amico, Council President Patten and Mayor Coyne

Motion by Mr. Higgins, supported by Mr. Mencini, to suspend.

ROLL CALL: AYES: Higgins, Mencini, Burgio, Powers, D'Amico, Troyer, Salvatore

NAYS: None. The motion carried.

Motion by Mr. Higgins, supported by Mr. D'Amico, to adopt.

ROLL CALL: AYES: Higgins, D'Amico, Troyer, Salvatore, Mencini, Burgio, Powers

NAYS: None. Res. No. 7-2015, has passed under Suspension of the Rules. Adopted.

Mayor Coyne presented the Resolution to Brandon Jack. Ben Baldwin and David Tyler and congratulated them on their continued success.

Brandon Jack stated that he plans on attending Northwestern University, Ben Baldwin plans on attending Georgetown University and David Tyler plans on attending Case Western University.

Mr. Patten thanked the boys for waiting and stated this is part of the educational process as well.

Motion by Mr. Higgins, supported by Mr. Mencini, to go back to the Regular Order of Business. Members of Council voted AYE. The motion carried.

Reports and Communications from other Departments, Commissions, Public Officials' cont.**Engineer Piatak: cont.**

Mr. D'Amico stated to Engineer Piatak at the railroad crossing on Holland Road April 15th was the deadline and the signs have been posted for 'No Horns' but the horns continue to blow.

Mr. Piatak responded I haven't heard anything and will follow up tomorrow.

Mr. Mencini stated to Mr. Piatak he concurs with the train horn noise and understand what Law Director Jamison has said about this but sometimes an excess is a little too much; safety is first no doubt about that but it does get out of hand. How is the Smith Road Project moving along?

Mr. Piatak responded the contractor is moving forward the boring machine is back on their property with tests being run so I hope to see it back onsite for service connections.

Mr. Mencini stated that it seems that traffic is moving better and also thanked Engineer Piatak for his assistance with the resident on Eavenson.

Mr. Burgio stated to Engineer Piatak with the Smith Road Sewer Project that some complaints have been received, especially one that you're aware of, with the trucks turning around on Green and on Sylvia and left deep ruts in the tree lawn. One of the residents tried to tap it down and fill it in but the next day it happened again. Mr. Burgio thanked Engineer Piatak for his promptness in getting that matter resolved.

Mr. Troyer asked Engineer Piatak about the Sylvia-Leslie Watermain Project how does it look; is it still on schedule and when is it going to be started?

Mr. Piatak responded as my last response I anticipate this project going out on the street for bids later this month or early next month and we are still on schedule for that.

Mr. Mencini stated to Engineer Piatak that there was a huge rut on Sylvia and Paulding that was taken care of right away.

Service Director Cayet

Mr. Cayet stated the department has been continuing the pickup of yard waste and flyers have been sent out and calls have been received, just like everyone else. After the Memorial Day holiday there will be roll-offs at the service garage for residents' to bring their yard waste to the garage. There is currently a roll off for contaminated waste only that consists of stuff pulled out of the sewers and streets

Reports and Communications from other Departments, Commissions, Public Officials' cont.**Service Director Cayet: cont.**

and people are coming down when they shouldn't be there dumping their yard waste into that container. Please let them know that signs are posted to not do that and they could be prosecuted if that is done; those roll offs are about \$900.00 to take to the certified dump that handles contaminated waste. Service crews have continued to patch some streets and the sewer crews haven't been using the Vactor in a while because the yard waste program started and that takes six of my men at this time. This week the street sweeper will not be out because of the men doing yard waste. We're doing sewer lateral repairs and it seems like when one gets done there are two or three more that come in so those three men are keeping busy. The water breaks are getting caught up and once all of those are done those men can start repairing the dozens of catch-basins in the city that need to be repaired. This week no one is on vacation and I finally was able to get one man to start cutting grass and yesterday the ball fields were cut. Mr. Cayet addressed Mrs. Powers' question regarding what the cost is for the city to do yard waste. Back in March when Mr. Kidder was here from Republic I passed out a report to all Members of Council and those numbers were included. Mr. Cayet addressed Mr. D'Amico's comment about putting yard waste in the blue can that is a good idea and we thought about that. But if we were to automate yard waste if we went out and brought two more automated trucks and brought another 7,500 containers for yard waste which probably for some homes wouldn't be enough and some homes would one too many because not everybody does yard waste. We have some homes that put out 1/2 dozen cans and there are some homes that put out 20 cans and that cost with the existing lease payments the city currently has would be \$1.85 million dollars; and the city has already put \$20,000 into those trucks as far as tires, repairs and the three-year maintenance plan that needs to be done on those trucks.

Mr. D'Amico stated to Mr. Cayet I guess what I was getting at was when we changed over to the blue can was to take that existing can that we have today, not purchasing new ones. Putting the grass in the blue cans and do the recycling like the city used to when service crews picked up off the lawn; so I wasn't looking at adding costs did you think so?

Mr. Cayet responded the Mayor, a committee from Local 1099 and I searched every aspect that could be done to make this better and keep the city services that we have; so we did look at all avenues on that.

Mr. D'Amico commented just so you know it wasn't an added cost that I was talking about.

Mr. Mencini stated with the yard waste being taken to the garage on Saturday from 7:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m., somebody will be on duty?

Reports and Communications from other Departments, Commissions, Public Officials' cont.**Service Director Cayet: cont.**

Mr. Cayet responded there is a weekend crew basically for sewer calls and one of the members on the weekend is a specialist on the lift stations so we do have seven-day coverage of the lift stations; especially during the growing season.

Mr. Mencini thanked Mr. Cayet for all the assistance to residents' provided this past week with different situations.

Mr. Troyer commented I thought we had to put memos to the Mayor to get things done...

Mr. Mencini interjected well, I did.

Mr. Troyer continued a scenario if the automated trucks going down the street on a windy day and somebody puts a big can up against a telephone pole to try and hold it up; how would the drivers be expected to handle that?

Mr. Cayet responded it depends on how its leaning against the telephone pole is it the backend, side or what?

Mr. Troyer commented the backend with the cover open.

Mr. Cayet clarified with a bungy-cord around it?

Mr. Troyer concurred.

Mr. Cayet continued that the drivers can't really see that can when they pick it up they are using cameras and the can is behind the drivers that have a screen. If it's a black bungy-cord wrapped to a pole the driver doesn't see it, he doesn't see it.

Mr. Troyer stated you would figure that the drivers would get out and move the can away from the pole.

Mr. Cayet responded that drivers got out of the trucks a lot of times today because there were a lot of cans laying on the side.

Mr. Troyer stated there is a rule that all recyclables should be put in bags and then placed in the recyclable container. So where there is a windy day and recyclables aren't placed in the bags the container goes over and city streets are full of plastics flying down the street; so maybe that should be expressed in the next mailer that all recyclable should be placed in a plastic bag and placed in can.

Reports and Communications from other Departments, Commissions, Public Officials' cont.

Service Director Cayet: cont.

Mr. Cayet commented that I'm guilty of not doing that.

Mr. Patten stated to Mr. Cayet that you mentioned that the street sweeper hasn't been out lately because of the manpower. What does the city pay for that street sweeper?

Mr. Cayet responded with state purchasing I think it was like \$213,000.

Mr. Patten asked did you look at contracting that out before purchase of the street sweeper?

Mr. Cayet responded yes I did.

Mr. Patten asked what was the cost for that?

Mr. Cayet responded I think you had it contracted at one time with...

Mr. Patten interjected I had numbers.

Mr. Cayet commented well, it was double, \$16,000 a sweep.

Mr. Patten stated I would appreciate if you could forward those to Council.

Safety Director Brynes

Mr. Brynes stated no report this evening.

Mr. Mencini thanked Mr. Brynes for the professional advice given for the situation on Smith Road and the residents' were able to talk amongst themselves to get this problem worked out.

Law Director Jamison

Mr. Jamison stated no report this evening.

Recreation Director Fields

Mrs. Fields stated that city employee, Andre Gonzalez was hospitalized and has been out for two weeks and I'm very happy to say that all the baseball teams were drafted and selected with practices beginning this week. On May 2nd the department will be having an event called 'Spring into your Park' and we are asking all residents' to come out voluntarily to plant flowers and weed. The starting point will be the Recreation Center from 9:00 a.m. to 1:00 p.m. and please bring shovels, rakes, and gloves.

Reports and Communications from other Departments, Commissions, Public Officials' cont.**Finance Director Cingle**

Mr. Cingle stated to answer a few questions asked of me at the April 7th Council meeting. Councilman Salvatore asked for the savings of the animal shelter that recently moved into the former building department and that savings is estimated at approximately \$17,200. Mr. Cingle stated that Councilwoman Powers asked the question as to the cost for the reopening of Fire Station No. 2 and with the help of Safety Director Byrnes and Assistant Finance Director Healy who assisted with the workup of those figures. The cost for this year which is a 10 ½ month period when the station was opened through the end of the year; the cost is roughly \$576,500 and that cost annualized over a 12-month period is roughly \$659,000. That cost includes the bringing back of two firefighters/paramedics, plus the overtime and plus the increased cost in utilities. Mr. Cingle continued that the Tax Department did a very good job this past tax season processing tax returns and working with very long lines of individuals filing their tax returns on April 14th and 15th.

Mr. Troyer stated to Finance Director Cingle how many more years are left on the automated rubbish truck payments?

Mr. Cingle responded the fourth payment will be made this year of a seven-year lease.

**OTHER COMMUNICATIONS, PETITIONS, AND VERBAL APPROVAL:
(INTRODUCTION OF NEW LEGISLATION):****New Legislation:**

1. An Ordinance authorizing the Director of Public Service to prepare specifications and advertise for bids and further authorizing the Mayor to enter into a contract with the lowest and/or best bidder for the collection of solid waste, yard waste, recyclable materials and bulk materials and declaring an emergency. Introduced by Mayor Coyne. **Placed in Service Committee**
2. An Ordinance authorizing the Mayor to enter into an agreement with Greater Cleveland Auto Auction, public auctioneers, for the purpose of disposing of obsolete city vehicles and declaring an emergency. Introduced by Mayor Coyne. **Placed in Finance Committee.**

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS (APPOINTMENTS, CONFIRMATIONS):

INTRODUCTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND ORDINANCES: (FIRST READING):

1. RESOLUTION NO. 9-2015, ACCEPTING THE RECOMMENDATIONS AND APPROVING THE MINUTES OF THE HOUSING COUNCIL ON THE CITY OF BROOK PARK'S COMMUNITY REINVESTMENT AREA (CRA) AGREEMENTS AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY. Introduced by Mayor Coyne

Mr. Troyer stated I'm on this committee and this is for tax abatements that the city has on certain properties. Every year the building department has to inspect these properties making sure that they are in compliance in order for the Housing Council to continue the tax abatements.

Motion by Mr. Troyer, supported by Mr. Burgio, to suspend.

Mrs. Powers asked this is tax abatement that are given to people who have improved their properties and receive abatement on their real property taxes for a certain period of time?

Mr. Troyer responded yes, either improvement or new building of some sort.

Mrs. Powers read the tax abatements into the record as follows: Archer Realty at 15601 Brookpark Road has received tax abatement. State of Ohio Highway Patrol located at 5225 West 140th Street, Kathleen Horchy located 5171 West 148th Street not sure what improvements have been done to this property to a receive tax abatement. Sanwil located at 15523 Snow Road is Reddi's Pizza and Vinus LLD – liability company is the Holiday Inn and VWI, Inc is for Humenik Funeral Home. So the residents' of this community are paying our taxes but are giving these companies tax breaks. I think the American way is if you're going to build a company then you build the company and I see no reason why these companies should receive tax breaks.

Mr. Mencini clarified that tax abatements are given for an addition or a new building.

Mayor Coyne concurred.

ROLL CALL: AYES: Troyer, Burgio, Mencini, Higgins, D'Amico, Salvatore

NAYS: Powers. The motion carried with a 6-1 vote.

Motion by Mr. D'Amico, supported by Mr. Troyer, to adopt.

Mr. Salvatore stated one question under adoption because that's where all the questions should have been asked in the first place but I'll let that go. Mr. Salvatore asked Mr. Troyer if he went out and inspected these properties and they were all in compliance.

Mr. Troyer responded no I did not, a few of them I did, but I took the word of the Building Department who said they inspected them and everything was good.

Mr. Burgio commented I inspected all these properties and they were all in compliance.

Introduction of Resolutions and Ordinances: (First Reading): cont.

ROLL CALL: AYES: D'Amico, Troyer, Salvatore, Mencini, Burgio, Higgins

NAYS: Powers. Res. No. 9-2015, has passed under Suspension of the Rules with a vote of 6-1. Adopted.

2. ORDINANCE NO. 9964-2015, AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO A DEMOLITION PROGRAM AGREEMENT WITH THE COUNTY OF OHIO AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY. Introduced by Mayor Coyne

Motion by Mr. Salvatore, supported by Mr. Mencini, to suspend.

ROLL CALL: AYES: Salvatore, Mencini, Burgio, Higgins, D'Amico, Troyer

NAYS: Powers. The motion carried with a vote of 6-1.

Motion by Mr. D'Amico, supported by Mr. Troyer, to adopt.

ROLL CALL: AYES: D'Amico, Troyer, Salvatore, Mencini, Burgio, Higgins

NAYS: Powers. Ord. No. 9964-2015, has passed under Suspension of the Rules with a vote of 6-1. Adopted.

INTRODUCTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND ORDINANCES: (SECOND READING):

1. RESOLUTION NO. 7-2015, HONORING THE BEREA-MIDPARK'S ACADEMIC CHALLENGE TEAM AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY. Introduced by Councilman Salvatore and Council Members Troyer, Mencini, Powers, Higgins, Burgio, D'Amico, Council President Patten and Mayor Coyne

Note: Item number one was moved by motion to earlier during the meeting.

2. RESOLUTION NO. 8-2015, IN SUPPORT OF HOUSE BILL 60, 'DICK GODDARD'S ACT' AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY. Introduced by Councilman Burgio and Council Members Troyer, Mencini, Powers, Higgins, D'Amico, Salvatore, Council President Patten and Mayor Coyne

Motion by Mr. Salvatore, supported by Mr. D'Amico, to suspend.

ROLL CALL: AYES: Salvatore, D'Amico, Troyer, Mencini, Burgio, Powers, Higgins

NAYS: None. The motion carried.

Motion by Mr. Salvatore, supported by Mr. Mencini, to adopt.

Mrs. Powers stated I voted yes on suspension because I do admire what Dick Goddard is doing and am in agreement with it. I read the bill extensively and the sad thing is that our animal shelter in Brook Park is in such deplorable condition that it wouldn't meet the standards that Dick Goddard sets in his proposal.

Mayor Coyne stated how can you make a statement like that?

Mrs. Powers responded because I have seen....

Mayor Coyne interjected have you been to the animal shelter since it was moved to the old firehouse on Smith Road.

Introduction of Resolutions and Ordinances: (First Reading): cont.

Mrs. Powers responded I haven't been to the new one but I've been to the old one.

Mayor Coyne stated then why are you making a statement like that, what I'm saying to you is this is a project that we worked on together, I thought. Therefore, you haven't been to the city's new facility yet.

Mrs. Powers responded no, I've heard about it.

Mayor Coyne commented why don't you and I go there.

ROLL CALL: AYES: Salvatore, Mencini, Burgio, Powers, Higgins, D'Amico, Troyer.
NAYS: None. Res. No. 8-2015, has passed under Suspension of the Rules. Adopted.

THIRD READING OF RESOLUTIONS AND ORDINANCES:

1. ORDINANCE NO. 9961-2015, AMENDING SECTION 1313.04 OF THE BROOK PARK CODIFIED ORDINANCES ENTITLED 'GENERAL RESIDENTIAL BUILDING PERMIT FEES' AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY. Introduced by Councilman Mencini

Mr. Troyer stated I have an issue with the raising the residential building permit because anything the city does to raise the cost of the permits to residential buildings is going to go right to the residents'. I don't want to do anything that raises costs to homeowners and some of these increases go from 20% to 150% increases. Also in the original proposal we were going to eliminate the free permits and absolutely would not want to do both of those; that was in the original proposal not in this legislation. We want the residents' to be able to fix up their homes and not make it more costly, therefore, I will be voting no on adoption of this legislation.

Mr. Mencini stated to Mr. Troyer that I did not know that we were eliminating the free permits on the original proposal.

Mayor Coyne interjected there are two separate pieces of legislation that I think has been explained about 100 times....

Mr. Troyer stated no there were two pieces of legislation proposed in one proposal....

Mr. Patten stated one at a time.

Mayor Coyne stated it's not in the body of this legislation. There are two distinct issues...

Introduction of Resolutions and Ordinances: (First Reading): cont.

Mr. Troyer interjected I already said that...

Mayor Coyne continued so therefore that is not related to this at all.

Mr. Mencini stated the City of Brook Park is still below most of the surrounding suburbs from a ratio of five to 20 miles, this city is still below on costs.

Mr. D'Amico stated I also wanted to add that the whole thing, if you remember, with all the privatization being talked about. The Building Department and Mr. Hurst, I commend him with the Mayor and working through this together came about with these proposals to go ahead and self-sustain. So I think it's a good thing that this legislation needs to be passed.

Mrs. Powers stated I agree with Councilman Troyer that it is just an extra burden on the homeowner and if you are going to encourage people to fix up their homes. Why burden them with an extra expense and we are not other communities; we are Brook Park and do not need to compare ourselves with other communities by saying that they have higher fees. Brook Park is a unique city; we are a good city and as Mr. Troyer said some of these have quadrupled in the amount of the permit. So if someone were going to put in new windows or an awning to improve their property they might decide not to do it with the increased fee.

Mr. Mencini stated to Mrs. Powers are you sure of quadruple or more; you're sure they're quadruple or more?

Mrs. Powers stated you didn't question Mr. Troyer when he gave the numbers that went from \$20.00 or more...

Mr. Patten stated to Councilman Mencini that you introduced this piece.

Mr. Mencini concurred.

Mr. Patten stated to Mrs. Powers I would say that Mr. Mencini would be the ones that the questions get directed to because he is the Councilperson that drafted the legislation.

Mr. Mencini stated as far as with other cities when I brought this legislation forward what I said is and I know the Mayor stated something after me. Are we going to keep all the city's fees low and I remember going into \$20.00 Recreation Center passes and so many other things that this city is so low for so long. I would like to ask Mr. Hurst when was the last time that these permits were raised? My point is sooner or later we have to start budging up a little bit and get back to reality in 2015.

Introduction of Resolutions and Ordinances: (First Reading): cont.

Mr. Hurst responded the last time the city's fees were raised I wasn't here and I've been here 12 years so it was before that.

Mayor Coyne stated 'Point of Clarification' to the public this is something that the city does periodically. There are fees that have to be addressed and in our case we read about another community saving \$100,000 by outsourcing their building department, I don't know if that's correct or not. We challenged Building Commissioner Hurst and one of the things that he made me and Finance Director Cingle aware of is that these fees haven't been adjusted since the last time that I was Mayor. So, in reality, by addressing this particular issue we will have the resources for the Building Department to be on the plus side, than rather on the subsidy side. It's not a massive thing and when the city does the free permits for June, July and August, I think it was Mr. Salvatore and I, that started that during the months of June, July and August residents' didn't have to pay for permits and we're going to talk about the dynamics of that. Basically, this is not a money gouging item it's to upgrade the city's operations that haven't been upgraded in a decade, nothing more, nothing less.

Mr. Salvatore stated to summarize this is now on Third Reading and there has been plenty of time to discuss this and it has been debated and the building department commissioner was challenged to what they could do to keep from privatizing their departments. Mr. Hurst did an excellent job coming up with these suggestions and a lot of thought that went into this and I'm kind of disappointed that this legislation has gone three readings and not at one time were any amendments brought forward to reduce the costs in any of these departments. I commend Mr. Mencini for putting this legislation out and of course some people are going to ask why are you raising the fees. The fees that are being raised haven't been raised in many years and nobody wants to see the building department privatized and Mr. Hurst went out and found ways to keep this department alive and under control of the City of Brook Park. I think this is very necessary to do and I want to thank Mr. Mencini for bringing this legislation forward and thank Mr. Hurst and his staff for all the hard work that went into this.

Mr. Troyer stated looking at the legislation it says it was last changed in August, 2009 and 150% is too much.

Motion by Mr. Higgins, supported by Mr. Salvatore, to adopt.

ROLL CALL: AYES: Higgins, Salvatore, D'Amico, Burgio, Mencini

NAYS: Troyer, Powers. Ord. No. 9962-2015 has passed under Third Reading with a vote of 5-2. Adopted.

2. ORDINANCE NO. 9962-2015, AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT BETWEEN BREWER-GARRETT COMPANY AND THE CITY OF BROOK PARK AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY. Introduced by Mayor Coyne.

Mr. Troyer stated Council whether the vote on this of yes or no on adoption was a tough decision on one hand this is a six month contract that goes from January through June, 2015. On one hand this should have been brought forward last year

Introduction of Resolutions and Ordinances: (First Reading): cont.

and I believe it should have been a no-bid contract...It is a no bid contract and I believe these contracts should go out to bid. Then on the other hand this company has been working for the city for almost four months with no contract and they need to get paid. They have been working without protection of a contract and I think we have a moral and ethical responsibility to see that this company gets paid and I've been back and forth on this.

Mrs. Powers stated the city had the original agreement back in 2002 and this company needs to get paid but I cannot vote for a contract to continue this service. Because if it is just a maintenance agreement and the city is paying \$10,000 a month for maintenance on a system that we keep hearing is falling apart; I don't think we should continue with this and if we do it should not be on an annual basis; there's not timeframe. So if we are going to do this it should be on a month-to-month basis for May and June and starting the first of May we should put this out for bids not RFQ's (Request for Qualifications). Put this in the paper so that any company out there that does this kind of business has the opportunity to bring in a bid, which would be the fair way to do this. If you look in the Sun News or the Plain Dealer on a weekly basis the Sun News has advertisements' for bids; so I think it's time we started advertising for bids instead of doing these no bid contracts.

Mr. Mencini stated I don't know about other cities but I do know that the City of Brook Park has been working with Brewer-Garrett for a long time and they do a pretty good job. To me two months is a short timeframe and I definitely concur with my colleague, Mr. Troyer that this company definitely needs to get paid.

Mr. Higgins commented I find it quite ironic that Councilwoman Powers is comparing us with other cities when just with the last piece of legislation she said we shouldn't compare us to other cities.

Motion by Mr. D'Amico, supported by Mr. Burgio, to adopt.

ROLL CALL: AYES: D'Amico, Burgio, Mencini, Troyer, Salvatore

NAYS: Powers, Higgins. Ord. No. 9962-2015 has passed under Third Reading with a vote of 5-2. Adopted.

There being no further business to come before this meeting Council President Patten declared this meeting adjourned at 10:16 p.m.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED *Michelle Blazak*
Michelle Blazak
Clerk of Council

APPROVED *May 19, 2015*

THESE MEETING MINUTES APPROVED BY BROOK PARK CITY COUNCIL ARE A SYNOPSIS, NOT TRANSCRIBED IN THEIR ENTIRETY, ALTHOUGH ACCURATE.