

**REGULAR COUNCIL MEETING
OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF BROOK PARK, OHIO
TO BE HELD ON TUESDAY, MAY 5, 2015**

The meeting was called to order by Council President Patten at 8:00 p.m., the clerk called the roll and the following Members of Council answered:

D'AMICO, TROYER, SALVATORE, MENCINI, BURGIO, POWERS, HIGGINS

Also in attendance were Service Director Cayet, Safety Director Byrnes, Finance Director Cingle, Mayor Coyne, Recreation Director Fields, Engineer Piatak, Building Commissioner Hurst, Law Director Jamison.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PRECEDING MEETINGS:

1. Regular Council meeting held on April 7, 2015.

Motion by Mr. Higgins, supported by Mr. Mencini, to approve as printed. Members of Council voted AYE. The motion carried.

REMARKS FROM THE AUDIENCE (ON ANY SUBJECT):

Ray Peterlin

5811 Wengler Drive

Mr. Peterlin thanked the residents' who called him after the Town Hall meeting and the city is in full-blown war over the budget and vision of the city's future. We're at a turning point and some of our problems as fixed costs such as the Recreation Center though there are variables there too. Other items are very different our roads have a cost of \$10 million to \$50 million dollars. Why such a big difference it depends on the maintenance, let me make it perfectly clear that we have very good employees working hard on the streets but they can only follow their marching orders from the city. If a tornado hit Brook Park and tore off roofs all around the city and the city came and put a few shingles on each home the roofs would still leak. That is what we did last year to our roads and had spring, summer and fall to patch the holes, cracks and seals the roads. Our residents' last year watched city personnel fill one hole and leave forty in front of them and forty in back of them; example Snow Road. We seemed to be doing exactly the same this year. We're using the old tools that take four to six men and still on a good day can only patch forty holes plus there is no air compressor to blow out the holes, water and the dirt before putting the patch; in cold weather they have no torch to heat the hole for proper bonding. The new road-killing machine used in Brunswick, Cleveland and other cities takes only 90-seconds per hole and can do 200-plus holes a day and the machine checks its work and only one person is required who does not have to get out of the vehicle. Yes there is a cost but look what you would get for the money.

Remarks from the audience on any subject: cont.

Whichever method used we must above everything else completely seal all, not just some of the roads, before the winter approaches. If we get the job done properly we'll save \$40 million dollars and if not we lose the war. We chose to purchase a street sweeper because it would work harder to keep our sewers in working order. Last year and this year we had a choice for lawn waste removal and if we would use the blue cans for lawn waste there would not be three to four cans per house to pick up and we would only need one person. The machine would not file Workmen Compensation claims, call in sick or take vacation or ask for a pension; the robot would do the job in half the time. That person not assigned to yard waste could pick up and be reassigned to road work. We need more taxes, yes, but will our people support this. If the vote was today the people has said because of the Town Hall meeting that no changes in latitude, or changes in attitude, quoted from Jimmy Buffett, at this time does not look promising. What will it take to start with the seniors and I will do the math, the arithmetic, real slow. The old way of 1,500 seniors at \$10.00 a piece = \$15,000. Private snow contractor 1,500 homes times \$450.00 = \$675,000. Grass contractors at 1,500 homes at \$450.00 - \$675,000; for a total of \$1.35 million that you're asking from the seniors to pay their own way times ten years that's \$13.5 million dollars from the seniors. What could have been done with the money; furnaces, air conditioners, windows, driveways, roofs, dental, medical and wheelchairs. Seniors could have afforded above if the senior programs were reinstated and would vote for the tax in the fall if they had the senior programs reinstated. I'm sure we can find a way to call a truce and reunite this beautiful city.

Joan Markusic
13911 Bellbrook Drive

Ms. Markusic at the Mayor's public speech he said that we need to privatize trash and yard waste because we need to have those men to get our streets up and running. Then about ½ hour or so after the Mayor was into his speech he said that the streets in Brook Park are so bad that has to be contracted out. What I want to know is are the streets so bad that they need to be contracted out or can us privatizing, which is a bad idea in my opinion, going to be able to repair the streets that we have. This goes back to a meeting about two or three months back when I said that I don't mind you telling me what needs to be done and don't mind you telling me what its going to cost or I don't' mind if you tell me that I need to have the city get a tax increase. All I want you to do is stop the double-talk, I want you to give me the facts. I don't want a whole article one sentence that I need to know I just want you to tell me what you're going to do, what you need, what's going to be done, how it's going to be done and what kind of guarantee the residents' in this city have to get the city back up and running.

Remarks from the audience on any subject: cont.

Matthew Wright
13885 Brookdale

Dear esteemed Council Members even though I've been unable to attend the last few council meetings I have tried to listen to them. It seems to me that there's still some confusion about the fire department minimum manning. First I want to again express to all of you that all of our surrounding cities have minimum manning most are done by policy ours happens to be done by contract. Rest assured that in every city there is always a minimum manning to handle the emergency calls that are received just as there are a minimum number of police officers on duty everyday. As Councilman Mencini can attest to when he spent time with the fire department and rode along with us on calls. The day after Mayor Coyne closed Station No. 2 it was decided to lower the minimum manning to five. After just that one day it was determined that five was too low and not sufficient enough to handle the city's emergencies. From that day forward it was determined between the fire chief, safety director and Mayor that the minimum manning would be six. At that time each shift consisted of ten members and this staffing level is what led to the severe reduction in overtime. Currently our shifts have been reduced to nine members per shift and with the voters voting to reopen Station No. 2 our minimum manning went back up to seven; with the current number of personnel this causes a significant increase in overtime. It was not our choice to reduce the staffing it is clearly the Mayor and safety director's choice that they have decided to staff the fire department with overtime; instead of maintaining the same staffing level as last year. Minimum manning levels are not just numbers that are pulled out of thin air and as I stated all of our surrounding cities have minimum manning levels whether it's set by policy, by contract or by verbal understanding. These numbers are there in an attempt to cover a city's emergency without having to wait too long for help to arrive if there are other emergency situations happening simultaneously. Due to economics most cities have dropped their minimum manning levels to historic lows. The fire chief has told me that he has gone to the Mayor and safety director and advised them of the need to keep the staffing level to at least ten per shift to reduce the overtime but this seems to fall on deaf ears; it seems that there is an attempt to make it appear that your fire department is failing. This puts people's lives at risks ours by not having enough personnel on scenes and also our citizens. Mayor Coyne has stated numerous times that when he closed Station No. 2 he reallocated resources to a centralized station but the reality is that he only did that for one month before he started threatening the first round of layoffs and reducing the fire department personnel and he then laid off five firefighters at the beginning of the year. We have lost seven positions after the closing of Station No. 2. that is not relocation that is reduction. In the Mayor's quest to get his way and keep Fire Station No. 2 closed he chose to vilify your fire department employees by calling us greedy along with other false accusations. How can this be true when the members of this department have taken zero percent raises in four of the last six years along with a zero raises last year and each member of this department also gave up \$4,000 to \$5,000 in concessions. Mr. Cingle and the safety director came up with a figure of approximately \$600,000 as a cost of reopening Station No. 2. I requested a copy of that worksheet that was used to come up with these figures back on April 23rd and have still yet to receive that. Just by looking at the budget numbers in 2014 the fire departments' total budget was \$3.4 million dollars with regular salaries being \$2.59 (million dollars) and overtime set at \$76,000. In the first half of 2014

Remarks from the audience on any subject: cont.

we had 34 firefighters including the chief and assistant chief. Contracts with the 2015 fire department budget which is \$3.6 million dollars with regular salaries at \$2.48 million and overtime increased to \$410,000. In 2015 we started the year with 27 firefighters and we are now at 30 after the rehiring of three laid-off employees. These numbers clearly show the city is choosing to use overtime to staff the fire department instead of maintaining staffing levels. When Mr. Cingle and the safety director came up with the cost of reopening Station No. 2 did they take into account that having three less firefighters greatly impacts the amount of overtime? Last year's overtime numbers clearly show that ten members per shift is the right number by looking back at the daily fire department assignment sheets. During that time that the fire station was closed over 50% of the time there were at least seven firefighter personnel on duty. This shows me that if the fire department still had ten members per shift their overtime calculation would easily be cut in half; proper staffing has always been a key to controlling overtime costs. I can tell you that the members of your fire department would much rather be properly staffed then work overtime. There's another thing I want you to be aware of when we go through the entire process of getting hired by a city it is the beginning of a 25 to 30 year career; firefighter jobs are not just handed out. To be hired here in Brook Park we already have to be certified firefighters and paramedics, then finish high enough on a competitive test and then make it through an extensive interview and background check process. After going through this whole process most firefighters do not leave within five to ten years unless there are job security issues or family changes. Since Mayor Coyne took office we have lost five firefighters losing over ten years of knowledge and experience and dedicated service to Brook Park. Mayor Coyne's constant attack on your fire department has caused this loss; his constant threat of layoffs, closing fire stations, bringing in part-time employees, eliminating positions and his favorite threat of privatizing EMS. All these threats have caused us to lose this experience and I can tell you that one more of our firefighters with more than seven years experience is leaving for another city and yet one more is in the second part of the hiring process to get hired, yet, in another city; this second individual has served the City of Brook Park for more than 16 years. Our employees are being snatched up by other cities that are thrilled to be able to hire them; cities like Rocky River, Highland Hts. Cleveland Hts. and Avon Lake. There are even more of your firefighters currently testing to get hired by other cities. Our people are leaving because of Mayor Coyne and Safety Director Byrnes' constant threats to our job security. These people cannot be replaced overnight it takes time to go through the hiring process and if they're not from Brook Park they need to learn our city streets, our rules and our processes. In the Mayor's last two community meetings it has been stated over and over again that it is the fire department overtime that is causing this city's woes. It is clear that the way to severely reduce that number is proper staffing. If 2014 staffing levels are restored you will see a cost-savings from this year's budget. There is a need to hire off of our current civil service list and to give another test since the current one is close to expiring to be able to reduce that overtime. To make it clear again, the union does not determine the staffing levels and we are tired of taking the blame for the overtime costs. We would all rather just work our regular hours and go home to be with our families. Mayor Coyne we have shown that we are more than willing to try to work through these difficult times; we are willing to stay tonight after the meeting if you would like to have more discussion. We are not here seeking more

Remarks from the audience on any subject: cont.

money or a bigger budget we are here asking our leaders to spend the existing budget smarter; pay salaries instead of overtime and also reap the operational benefits of sometimes even having eight or more firefighters on duty. Thank you again for your time and if you have any questions please give me a call.

REPORTS FROM STANDING COMMITTEES:**Aviation & Environmental Committee – Chairman, Higgins**

Mr. Higgins stated no report this evening but as some of the Council Members are aware I do sit on the NOACA (Northeast Ohio Area Coordination Agency) which is a five-county agency that does good work with the infrastructure around the city. I also sit on the sub-committee which is the Planning of Progress Committee and last month we did for a favorable recommendation for the executive meeting to be held in June. For a number of road projects one which includes Snow Road for 2016 and I believe the amount was \$1.6 million dollars; so I'm looking for that vote in June.

Finance Committee – Chairman, D'Amico

Mr. D'Amico stated the Board of Control met earlier and approved 29 items.

Legislative Committee – Chairman, Troyer

Mr. Troyer stated no report this evening.

Parks & Recreation Committee – Chairman, Burgio

Mr. Burgio stated Parks & Recreation has legislation on tonight's agenda.

Planning Committee – Chairman, Mencini

Mr. Mencini stated the Planning Commission met on May 4th approved two ground signs for Rock N Roll City Harley Davidson located at 4985 West 150th Street. The commission also approved a new 120' wireless communication tower at 16935 Hummel Road for Southwest Cab. The commission also tabled the request for a utility pole in the public right-of-way for the purpose of mounting wireless communication equipment at the following locations: 19147 Snow Road, 17993 Sylvia Drive, 5017 and 5269 West 137th Street.

Safety Committee Chairman, Salvatore

Mr. Salvatore stated the Safety Committee has legislation on tonight's agenda.

Service Committee – Chairwoman, Powers,

Mrs. Powers stated the Service Committee has legislation on tonight's agenda.

Board of Zoning Appeals – Chairman, D'Amico

Mr. D'Amico stated the Zoning Board met on May 4th and nine variances were granted to Rock N Roll Harley Davidson located at 4985 West 150th Street for wall signs that will greatly help aesthetically that area. The board denied a fence request and approved a ground sign for All Ohio Cremation and Burial Society located at 16150 Brookpark Road. Mr. D'Amico continued that he has the plans for the Harley Davidson if anyone would like to view them.

REPORTS FROM SPECIAL COMMITTEES:**Southwest General Health Center – Trustee, Salvatore**

Mr. Salvatore stated the board met on April 29th and Jeffrey Peters of University Hospitals was appointed to the Southwest Health Center Board. A nominating committee was formed from the Cities Strongsville, Middleburg Hts. and Brook Park for the rest of this year. In 2014 the hospital received numerous awards and 2015 is starting off the same way with awards received from the American Heart and Stroke Association; Best Hospital for Cancer Care was received and for the fourth year in a row the health center has received the Leap Frog Award which is excellence in delivery of service. With all the remodeling taking place at the health center new furniture was purchased and the old furniture was donated through the Med-Wish Foundation for a total of 11,984 pounds of furniture that will be used in a health care organization in Honduras. The week of May 6th through May 12th is Nurses' Week.

Berea Board of Education – Representative, Mencini

Mr. Mencini stated the board met on May 4th and this week will be celebrated as Staff Appreciation Week. The Berea City Schools will be having a summer day camp from June 15th through August 2nd from 9:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. at Ford Intermediate School; Camp one is for K-3rd grades, Camp two is for 4th-7th grades registration forms are available at the district website or by calling the Communication office at 216-433-0808. The Treasury Department recently won two prestigious awards for excellent in recording keeping and budget presentation. The district's annual art show will take place from May 18th through the 21st in the Student Activity Center at Baldwin-Wallace University from 3:30 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. each day. The board will be having a special meeting on May 11th at 5:30 p.m. in Staff Room 1 at the Board of Education office for discussion purposes of using Special Education Funds, this meeting is open to the public and input is welcome.

REPORTS FROM BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS:**INTRODUCTION OF RESOLUTIONS OF COMMENDATION:****REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE MAYOR:**

Mayor Coyne stated I provided you with information on the live streaming of Council meetings so residents will be able to view the meetings at home and I'd just like Council's verbal approval to put about \$3,000 in the Capital Budget when it is sent over to you. We will have somebody come and made a presentation but you can see the operational costs are minimal so if Council would at least put this in your budget and that way its allocated will be very helpful in informing our citizens. Just a couple of comments here; Mr. Peterlin thank you very much for the Jimmy Buffett way of observations that you had your figures always challenge me a little

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

bit but the fact of the matter is. I think that it will be good for the community to have a dialogue about these issues that are important to them and I tried on a couple of different occasions to spell those out; sometimes those measures have to change. To Ms. Markusic comments about spelling out exactly what things are for I did that; those were rejected and that's why we have to have a serious conversation about these streets and we should recognize we're trying to allocate our work force. Now with some measures our service workers can do and you keep bringing up Snow Road. Literally a whole lane of Snow Road is going to have to be planed because the potholes are rolled up in the asphalt that are rolled up on the curb from the trucks that come down. If you drive around the town and your figure \$10 million dollars, as I said most of our city streets are 60 years old, and we don't have the provisions to take care of them. Short of the residents' giving us more money on the capital side where I believe that money should go and make sure that no one can spend it on anything else. Having said that in the short term I have about \$10 million dollars worth of work and I went to our borrowing advisors and will present that to Council. Literally borrowing that money short term-long term with obliterate most of what we have available we have available for capital improvement, right now, which is only about 20% of the revenue that comes into the city and 26% of that is already allocated for debt that we have right now. Finally, I will address my favorite subject and that is the members of the local 1141; I never said that they're the reason that our city has problems. They seem to think that I cause all of their problems and we have many Members of Council up here that have sat on negotiating teams and negotiations are tough. The old adage is that both sides come away feeling that they are angry and didn't achieve all that they want; they say that, good. I have to tell you that the presentation this evening and at least I want to congratulate Firefighter Wright for having a better demeanor here then he had the other evening. Because I think your representation by folks in the community, whether they like me or not, was not well received and didn't speak well of you; that's just a personal observation. Let me say this to you we have tried in every way to make them work and every city employee here including the firefighters have not received a pay raise. Do I like that and do I think it's fair, do I think they're overpaid. No, I do not and it's been an age-old argument about overtime as opposed to hiring people and in the years that I've spent here as Mayor. I said the first time I walked into the firehouse in 1982 and I said the same thing the day that Jim Astorino retired when I came back here. I want us with the right number of firefighters in one location servicing our people and our folks should be the highest compensated in this region; and for most of the time I was Mayor you were; everybody, the elected officials, Mayor and city workers. Those days are over and the reality that I have to deal with is a building that is abandoned down there and the ramifications of that; maybe you're tired of hearing it but that's a fact. So I haven't changed one bit and it worked my first 20 years here and I'll work now to achieve that particular situation. Now, part time firefighters I'm sure there are many members of our force right now that work part

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

time in other cities and there may be others that work for private ambulance carriers. As a matter of fact we had one of our officials move to the town very close to the person that owns a private ambulance service. So Mayor Coyne didn't create the creature that has changed in the country and every single union and association in the United States of America has had a change in their industry. Some caused by NAFTA (North American Free Trade Agreement) and you can see on record that my whole career I've opposed every one of them and I will oppose the current Asian Treaty right now because it's destroyed the American worker manufacturing in this country and our President believes that we're not going to do those things anymore. So to get up here and act like everything is just honky-dory the Mayor is a mean SOB and he hates the firefighters; nothing could be further from the truth. When you make proposals to me that you offered and put in front of me talking about an issue; indicating that this manning issue to act like that is now important. I'm sorry everyone who's been in elected office in this town for a long, long time knows that is the crucial issue. How it first started with the terrible Mayor and most of the great things you have in your contracts that we now have to talk about changing because of economics was granted by Mayor Coyne and some of the people sitting up here on City Council; so you've never been treated improperly. There's no discussion you won't have any discussion about part-time people and you don't want to have any discussion about the reduction in positions that we think are unnecessary and as far as the chief is concerned he hasn't talked to me really about anything since we consolidated that; or we went back to two stations. I think Mr. Wright pointed out properly in most cases it's not in the union contract; we've had two elections in this town to keep it in the union contract and keep that manning and why was that changed? Because of dynamics of providing services and the cost of providing services and I'm unaware that you asked for something and didn't get it because the more information you have, believe me, I'm happy that you have. So, therefore, I'm certain that what is costing us will cost us the same in hiring more people and I think as at the meeting before I was rudely interrupted there was discussing about this region needing to have this discussion. I know your concerns about mutual aid and it's gotten to the point anymore that I'm wondering if any city knows what they really have in terms of their ambulance and firefighters anymore. What do we have we're moving people all around who has the real capabilities. We have ambulances in Middleburg Hts. picking up our people and Brook Park is picking up people in Berea; these issues need to be talked about and I'm on your side about that. Because the fact of the matter is that is really the people's understanding of what it costs to deliver the kind of service that we want. Basically, none of us have a real fire department so some changes can make that possible. Will I stop talking about it just because you don't like it? No because if I'm aware of a situation that will provide service to the people of this town at a more reasonable cost; I have to tell you fee for service my goodness its unbelievable and I have to tell you. It took a long time of painstaking thought process for that to come out of my mouth but the fact of the matter is. Those

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

kinds of changes are coming to the service that you deliver whether you like it or not. So while I disagree with you I've never disparaged you and I have issues with the heads of your union, I do and I made clear. If you read anything that I wrote out there you can see that and I've consistently said this. I don't have a problem with our folks when they come to our people's doors it's how we get there, I have a problem with. So we can move a long way by embracing what the facts are but to act like minimum manning isn't your holy grail is very disingenuous and it must be addressed. So if anyone wants to take that out of the contract and let us establish policy I have a problem with the unions dictating the daily operations of this city in any department. So I'm going to come over and visit Matt Wright tomorrow and understand he's on duty and him and I can have, hopefully, a nice friendly discussion amongst us both with our collective group of people in there to get some of these things out of the way. Maybe, just maybe, if we stick our heads above ground and start hunkering down in retrievable positions that's not going to do anybody any good we're going to keep spinning our wheels; and you're not going to get further ahead and certainly the city isn't going to get farther ahead. The fact of the matter, is if we have to fight to get there then we will and I don't choose to sit up here and have the little grievances that we have to deal with on a daily basis; that quite frankly wouldn't shed great light on you. I've never been that way and I'm not going to be there now. My problem has always been logistical operations because I believe even under our current conditions that if we are consolidated into one firehouse we can provide adequate service. Finally, I'm going to say this I think we proved it over a period of time and we are observing and I don't know from a true situation that we're operating out of two stations currently, to be very candid with you. We will have some discussions about that and that's all I'm about and that's all I've ever been about and if you're mistaking that for what I said at the meeting that I truly believe in is the people of this city have to look in the mirror and decide what they're going to do because I don't care who sits up here. We don't have a spending problem I read these blogs, there's not a spending problem in this town and nobody is wasting any money. You may challenge for a constituency that thinks what they have is more important than you whether it's senior or recreation. We need revenue to operate and what I said at that meeting and I'm saying tonight and have talked to Council. If you will give me the tools to make the changes that I need to make from the operational side will get us on the right track, the right size, on the right number of employees and get that moving forward on the capital side. If our people don't dig in their pockets for us then we're going to continue to have the problems that we have of the appearance of the infrastructure of the town.

Mr. Burgio stated to Mayor Coyne talking about the capital expenses you mentioned at the town hall of proposing a tax levy. I would like to know how much was that proposed for and have you talked to the finance director to see how much it would cost the average homeowner.

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

Mayor Coyne responded we're working on that right now and the first thing I want to do is have a discussion with City Council about it. It would be ½% and believe it would generate about \$5 million dollars a year. You can't have the exact science of who pays what taxes because we're not allowed to know that but we can give you an idea. What I can tell you is that retirement incomes are not taxed and we will try and put a list of what cities have this and/or that. So we are in the process of working on that and will give it to Council because only Council can put it on.

Mr. Burgio stated to Mayor Coyne it has been mentioned by both you and me about the yard waste. It is still a problem for a lot of the seniors dealing with that and you mentioned that it may be extended; I'm hoping you can extend it to the end of summer. Is there any date in mind for this program to end.

Mayor Coyne responded there needs to be a frank discussion about that before I do that and that's just putting things down the line. Talking to people that evening they thought they were going to be assessed for it and they're not. So, therefore, I'm willing to sit with Council and talk about that to get an issue done in the short term; so long term we can move forward. As you can see and right now with all of you going out there walking and sending memos for grinding of stumps, to cutting trees and taking care of this; you're not going to have the personnel to do the job. So I think when the people understand that they're not going to be charged anymore these jobs have already been eliminated and they'll come back through attrition; I don't see what the issue is of us not moving forward to be very candid with you. Particularly I think Mr. Peterlin raised the issue about the capital costs; we looked at that. We have to buy two more trucks and the cans that they have out there. So should we make millions of dollars in capital costs, which I happen to believe, is inevitable that this service is going to be outsourced like it is for every other city. I wish it wasn't so but I believe that it is so we can have that discussion and I think we should have a meeting about it.

Mr. Burgio stated this came up at the town hall meeting if you would take a lie detector test.

Mayor Coyne responded yes, again, I haven't lied to anybody about anything. They might not like the facts, they might have a difference of my opinion I don't have a problem with that and anyone that wants to prove that I challenge you to do so.

Mr. Mencini stated Mayor as you know nobody sends you more memos than me and the service department is where I come from and we took a lot of pay freezes; there's a lot to be done here absolutely. My question is I would like to have that meeting with Council as soon as possible to start moving ahead to see what can be done to get some income and getting things done.

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

Mayor Coyne concurred.

Mr. Troyer stated I'm not going to ask you about the \$2 million dollars again because the last three or four times...

Mayor Coyne interjected \$1.6 million.

Mr. Troyer continued I asked you about it you wouldn't answer clearly. So what I would like to ask you about tonight is with Mr. Peterlin mentioned about the blue cans and this came up last year, earlier in the year. Because I was told that with our recycling people are doing what they can but they just don't have that much and we are picking up twice a month and the cans are only ¼ full, which is kind of an issue. At that point I suggested that why don't we do yard waste...no actually at first I suggested why don't we do it once a month. Then after we started with the yard waste issues in the spring last year I suggested that we use the blue cans and then pick up the recyclables in bags which is very light. In fact, I'm no proposing this but it would be a lot easier for the residents to bring up recyclables to a bin then it is for yard waste; so have we considered anything like that.

Mayor Coyne responded yes we did as a matter of fact Councilman Burgio looked at having smaller cans for residents' and looking at it you need two more trucks to do that. Because you try to pick up yard waste in Brook Park once a month and you have no idea the problem that entails. So if you had two more trucks and I even looked at maybe we should drill holes because the yard waste must be vented and when we looked at the cans that came out they have like a grid on top that is open and vented. So you would have to buy two more trucks and you would have to buy those cans and by that time these trucks will need to be replaced, there's a lot of work being done. So to make the capital investment for a program that, in my view, sooner or later has to be contracted out doesn't make a lot of sense. We'd have to buy more yard waste containers or adapt those but the fact of the matter is right now you have four days a week that they're picked up on rubbish day. So logistically it's a problem and a capital cost that quite frankly would eliminate most of what you have. About the only road being done this year is Leslie and Sylvia. So the capital costs is where we're having problems right now that is what you don't have and to me that's what was the striking thing of proposing privatizing and outsourcing of the rubbish. The other issue is this while our workers work very hard it's not a young man's job and how did we gain the \$1.6 million dollars that you can't find or you want me to bring to you in a box or something. It's because we reduced people and the most of employees that were reduced was the service department across the board. So what I'm saying to you is that you would have to buy two more trucks to do this work; outsourcing they will purchase our trucks and cans and we get that capital liability off the books which is about \$250,000 a year for the next four years so you're talking \$1 million dollars. So to me it made the

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

most sense to outsource that work and our residents' wouldn't know the difference. The thing that I heard for real rejection of this matter is that they thought they were being assessed for it and we had those discussions early on and also outsourcing the sewer to the county engineer, which is now called public works and many of the surrounding cities do. My comment to you is I would rather have in our hands our sewer operations because anybody can pick up rubbish with an automated truck and in particular the yard waste is a problem for us. So it was in that vein that I made the proposal to Council that we outsource this and, therefore, we would pick up these workers that are already on our payroll to perform other duties.

Mr. Troyer stated correct me if I'm wrong did you just say that we're having a lot of problems with these automated rubbish trucks that are only 3 ½ years old.

Mayor Coyne responded no, what I'm saying to you is they have costs we just...

Mr. Troyer interjected did we get a warranty on these?

Mayor Coyne responded yes, you did, but there are some things that at some point in time you have to do maintenance on them. So what I'm saying to you is you have these three and we're paying for four more years one of those is going to have to be replaced over that time. So that's going to be a constant and if you buy two more double what your annual cost is going to be because one of those trucks is going to have to be replaced every second or third year.

Mr. Troyer continued so we were able to get a loan or a lease on these trucks that we have to be paying on longer than the trucks are functional.

Mayor Coyne responded that's usually true there's maintenance when you lease a car unless you get an all inclusive, I mean just listen to the statement you just made. Have you ever leased a car?

Mr. Troyer responded yes I have.

Mayor Coyne continued therefore, there are some things included in your lease unless you get the all inclusive that they pay for all the maintenance you have to get tires, brakes we have to do the same thing, it's no different.

**REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM OTHER DEPARTMENTS,
COMMISSIONS, PUBLIC OFFICIALS:**

Engineer Piatak

Mr. Piatak followed up with a question that Councilman D'Amico had at the last meeting regarding the quiet zone on Holland Road. I spoke with Economic Development Commissioner Dolan who passed along correspondence that he had from CSX officials. Some of this correspondence indicates some confusion as to what entity files certain paperwork with the (FRA) Federal Railroad Administration and it's my understanding that in January, 2015 the FRA updated their train horn rule; so I think CSX might be a little confused as to who files certain paperwork to get some of these forms up to date. So we're working with CSX to get try and get that clarified but until that paperwork is filed and cleared up the trains will continue to blow the horns on Holland Road between Michael and Middlebrook. The Smith Road Sewer Project Phase III has mainline installation north of the Holland Road intersection and the service connection crews have been mobilized to work currently north of Snow Road. This coming Monday morning the Holland Road intersection will be closed to thru-traffic and the left turn lane movements in order for the contractor to install piping and manholes to make some of those connections. A meeting is set up for tomorrow with the police chief and fire chief to go over some of these closures to make everyone aware of what routes will be open and not open. A sewer collapsed on Gallatin Blvd. just west of Westbrook and two contractors submitted a price, two contractors were too busy. On tonight's Board of Control there was an item passed and the hope is to have a crew out there on Thursday or Friday to begin the repair work. The Leslie-Sylvia Drive Reconstruction Waterline Project is currently scheduled to advertise on May 12th and 19th in the newspaper and bids will be opened on May 26th.

Mr. D'Amico thanked Engineer Piatak for the Holland Road update and in talking to residents' near Haviland Drive in Ward 1 regarding the crossing between Foseco and Route 237; is the city in negotiations with the City of Berea.

Mayor Coyne interjected the answer to that question is yes.

Mr. D'Amico stated so negotiations are being taken to make that crossing a quiet zone.

Mayor Coyne concurred.

Mr. Mencini stated with the Smith Road Project between Hummel and Snow Roads there are three merchants that are curious when Smith Road will be two lanes.

Mr. Piatak responded I would anticipate sometime in June and can get you a better timeframe as we move forward; there is a new connection crew and they are slow

Reports and Communications from other departments, commissions, public officials: cont.

starting and anticipate them picking up the pace and being able to knock out the connections.

Mr. Mencini stated the overlay will be done sometime in August.

Mr. Piatak responded the project has a completion date of early September and is on schedule with no delays being expected. The mainline installation is just about complete and that's where most of the unforeseen conditions and/or issues would be found.

Mr. Mencini stated with the train noise and many people have told me its getting better; does the city deal with Norfolk Southern as well as CSX; Norfolk Southern are the tracks that run along Route 237, correct?

Mr. Piatak responded Norfolk Southern is the triple track along Route 237 and CSX is the single track on the east side of the town and CSX also has a double track by the Service Department and Ford Motor Company.

Mr. Troyer stated to Engineer Piatak I'm going to make a statement and you can answer rather quickly. I appreciate you providing an update on the Sylvia-Leslie Project that I've been waiting to get done for a long time. Then I hear that the Norfolk-Southern tracks quiet zone that I've been begging for a year and four months and couldn't get anywhere; in fact I believe I asked for legislation to be drawn up to create a quiet zone there. Are we looking into this?

Mayor Coyne stated first of all it takes years to get a quiet zone so you can pass the legislation that you want. There has been an increase problem with the trains primarily idling and from time to time the horns because they don't have enough engineers to move the trains so they store them. There is a gentleman that calls me all the time that told me I'm praying for you to get this accomplished. Economic Development Commissioner and I talked with the City of Berea to see if they are interested and this is primarily our problem and doesn't affect any residential neighborhoods in the City of Berea who are open to it. So the dialogue has begun but it's not as simple as saying we want to have them and history will show that the resources for that is allocated largely of what was done of a past trip to Washington. There was talk about making the Eastland and Route 237 a quiet zone but I don't think that will happen due to the many tracks and logistics. That's how the city received the monies to provide for the quiet zones so we might be talking about this subject right not and possibly four years down the line it may come to fruition; so no one is stalling your abilities to do anything and this has been discussed and now if we have a partner this will move along faster.

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

Mr. Troyer stated I think the first quiet zone on Holland Road took about ten years to get in place.

Mayor Coyne interjected remember the railroad has a lot of control.

Mr. Troyer commented in the meantime if we just get them to not blow the whistles.

Service Director Cayet

Mr. Cayet stated I attended a pre-construction meeting at ODOT (Ohio Department of Transportation) for Route 237 repair and resurfacing. ODOT wanted to start yesterday but there is not a signed contract with the contractor to date. Since our last meeting the street sweeper picked up 60+ tons of debris from city neighborhoods. The sweeper hasn't been on Brookpark, Snow, or Smith Roads because with service crews on yard waste I'm very limited as far as what I can do. If there is an extra person he could be put on the street sweeping and there were six guys off today; one on vacation and two for personal days and two guys off and wasn't able to put a patch crew together because I didn't have enough people. There were crews repairing catch-basins for Mr. Mencini.

Mr. Higgins reminded the Mayor and Service Director that Council budgeted for two laborers in case a couple of laid-off guys need to be brought back to get to some of the work that you can't get to.

Mr. Burgio stated to Service Director Cayet that he has seen the street sweeper out quite a bit. One resident did ask me why the street sweeper went down the same street within two days of each other. I assume that it's because the street sweeper didn't finish sweeping and had to come back the next day, that's my guess.

Mr. Cayet responded I don't know Councilman, I can't answer that. What street was it and what time was it?

Mr. Burgio responded it was Claudia last Thursday.

Mr. Cayet responded Claudia and some other streets are that bad that they have be done twice.

Mr. Burgio continued I know you have less personnel and so forth and are doing a lot more with less people but how are the baseball fields at this point in time.

Mrs. Fields responded service crews work diligently on the fields and they look really good and children have been out practicing.

Reports and Communications from other departments, commissions, public officials: cont.

Mr. Mencini stated when I get calls I tell people exactly how it is and appreciate the service crews' efforts with the memos that are sent. At this time of year sometimes the street sweeper has to go over streets once or twice to pick up all the debris. Potholes are bad in the city and I know it is the department's effort is to get at a few potholes each day.

Mr. Cayet responded service crews spent a week and half on Sylvia Drive and it was mind boggling as to how bad the street was. Mr. Cayet stated to Mr. Peterlin service crews do pick out the old asphalt they just lay it over and that pothole killer does not do that there still has to be crews out there to pick up the old stuff out; otherwise it's like painting over rust. Since I've been Service Director the department purchased one hot box and one recycler and materials can be heated up to over 300 degrees if wanted to so blow torches don't have to be used. Service crews do sweep out the potholes and the Vactor was up on Sylvia Drive because the joints were so disintegrated it was just powder; so the Vactor was used to suck out the powder of the joints to allow the new asphalt to hold and give us a few years.

Safety Director Byrnes

Mr. Byrnes stated the memos sent from Council to the Mayor I think all of them have been addressed since the last meeting. The Mayor usually sends them to me to have the matters addressed; most of them are for the police for traffic problems and also the animal warden, who have been very busy the last few weeks. With the nicer weather police presence has been stepped up in city neighborhoods to try and keep speeding down and it seems to be working. We have had a problem with vandalism in the city parks and auxiliaries are patrolling the parks and did catch a couple of juveniles the day before yesterday; but there is still damage being done at night.

Mr. Mencini stated I've seen the police out in the neighborhoods and there were a bunch of children under the bridge and when the officer drove past the children didn't think he saw them but then the officer turned around and stopped. If I could get a copy of that report on Sylvia Drive because what I was told and what we discussed differs tremendously.

Mr. Byrnes responded I will have that report for you.

Law Director Jamison

Mr. Jamison stated no report this evening.

Reports and Communications from other departments, commissions, public officials: cont.**Recreation Director Fields**

Mrs. Fields stated the department started a Mentoring Program called IMPACT (Inspiring Many People Across the Community Together) is having their first youth fun day this Friday from 5:30 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. with a variety of activities; and then from 7:00 p.m. to 10:00 p.m. the department will be hosting the monthly youth dance.

Mr. Mencini asked Recreation Director Fields how the signups are coming for Recreation Center memberships compared to last year?

Mrs. Fields responded we're basically at the same pace as last year and as the department is gaining more members because of charging less; instead of the \$20.00 or \$40.00 a month; the department is charging \$10.00 or \$20.00 a month the revenue is still down.

Mr. Mencini stated that it's nice to see that members are coming back and looking forward to Friday.

Finance Director Cingle

Mr. Cingle stated April monthly reports will be distributed in the next few days. At the last meeting Councilwoman Powers asked at the last meeting what the cost was to provide yard waste service in the community. The department prepared an analysis and this is only estimated but roughly the total cost for yard waste service is \$125,000 a year and again this is an estimated figure. To address Mr. Wright's comments from earlier in the meeting his request for the cost to reopen the Ruple Road Fire Station was not made directly to me but I do have a copy of the analysis that was put together for Council and will provide that copy to Mr. Wright tonight. I just ask in the future if Mr. Wright or anyone from the fire department or anyone in general has a request from the Finance Department to make that request directly to me via email or interoffice mail.

**OTHER COMMUNICATIONS, PETITIONS, AND VERBAL APPROVAL:
(INTRODUCTION OF NEW LEGISLATION):****New Legislation:**

1. A Resolution designating the month of July as Parks and Recreation month in the City of Brook Park and declaring an emergency. Introduced by Councilman Burgio Placed in Recreation Committee

Other communications, petitions and verbal approval: cont.**Introduction of New Legislation: cont.**

2. A Resolution honoring SAMANTHA ROCCO, for being accepted into the Junior Statesmen of America summer school program at Princeton University and declaring an emergency Introduced by Councilman Salvatore Placed in Legislative Committee
3. A Resolution honoring Jan Skinner for being nominated as 2015 Citizen of the Year and declaring an emergency Introduced by Councilman Salvatore Placed in Legislative Committee
4. A Resolution honoring Kathi Stautihar for being nominated at 2015 Citizen of the Year and declaring an emergency Introduced by Councilman Salvatore Placed in Legislative Committee
5. A Resolution honoring Don and Holly Rutti on celebrating two golden anniversaries and declaring an emergency Introduced by Councilman Salvatore Placed in Legislative Committee
6. An Ordinance providing for the submission to the Electorate of an amendment to Article IV, Section 4.01 of the Charter of the City of Brook Park, Ohio, and declaring an emergency Introduced by Councilmen D'Amico, Patten, Higgins, Burgio and Salvatore
7. An Ordinance providing for the submission to the electorate of an amendment to Article IV, Section 4.05 (b) of the Charter of the City of Brook Park, Ohio and declaring an emergency Introduced by Councilmen D'Amico, Patten, Higgins, Burgio and Salvatore Placed in Finance Committee
8. An Ordinance providing for the submission to the electorate of an amendment to Article IV, Section 4.08 of the Charter of the City of Brook Park, Ohio and declaring an emergency Introduced by Councilmen D'Amico, Patten, Higgins, Burgio and Salvatore
9. An Ordinance providing for the submission to the electorate of an amendment to Article IV, Section 4.09; of the Charter of the City of Brook Park and declaring an emergency Introduced by Councilmen D'Amico, Patten, Higgins, Burgio and Salvatore
10. An Ordinance providing for the submission to the electorate of an amendment to Article 15.02 (b) of the Charter of the City of Brook Park, Ohio and declaring an emergency Introduced by Council Members D'Amico, Patten, Higgins, Burgio and Salvatore

Other Communications, petitions and verbal approval: (Introduction of New Legislation) cont.**New Legislation: cont.**

11. An Ordinance providing for the submission to the electorate of an amendment to Article XVI, Section 16.01 of the Charter of the City of Brook Park, Ohio and declaring an emergency Introduced by Council Members D'Amico, Patten, Higgins, Burgio and Salvatore
-

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS (APPOINTMENTS, CONFIRMATIONS):
-----**INTRODUCTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND ORDINANCES: (FIRST READING):**

1. RESOLUTION NO. 10-2015, HONORING THE BEREA-MIDPARK TITANS BOYS BASKETBALL TEAM FOR THEIR WINNING THE BACK-TO-BACK SOUTHWEST CONFERENCE CHAMPIONSHIP AND DISTRICT RUNNER-UP AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY Introduced by Councilman Burgio and Council Members, Troyer, Mencini, Powers, Higgins, D'Amico, Salvatore, Council President Patten and Mayor Coyne

Mr. Patten stated that Resolution No. 10-2015 has had its First Reading.

2. RESOLUTION NO. 11-2015, REQUESTING THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO LIMIT UTILITY PROVIDER'S ABILITY TO CONDUCT HOME SOLICITATION. Introduced by Councilwoman Powers

Mr. Patten stated that Resolution No. 11-2015 has had its First Reading.

INTRODUCTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND ORDINANCES: (SECOND READING):
-----**THIRD READING OF RESOLUTIONS AND ORDINANCES:**

There being no further business to come before this meeting Council President Patten declared this meeting adjourned at 9:15 p.m.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED *Michelle Blazak*
Michelle Blazak
Clerk of Council

APPROVED *June 2, 2015*

THESE MEETING MINUTES APPROVED BY BROOK PARK CITY COUNCIL ARE A SYNOPSIS, NOT TRANSCRIBED IN THEIR ENTIRETY, ALTHOUGH ACCURATE.