

**PUBLIC MEETING
TO BE HELD ON WEDNESDAY, MAY 7, 2014 AT 6:30 P.M.
PROPOSED CLOSING OF FIRE STATION
NO. 2 ON RUPLE ROAD**

In attendance: Council Members Troyer, Mencini, Powers, Higgins, Burgio, D'Amico, Council President Patten, Mayor Coyne, Recreation Director Fields, Economic Development Commissioner Dolan, Service Director Cayet, Building Commissioner Hurst.

Absent from meeting: Safety Director Byrnes, Fire Chief Maund and Law Director Jamison.

Councilman Salvatore was attending a meeting at Southwest General Health Center.

Verbatim as requested:

Councilman Troyer – We ask that everyone be respectful of others and keep to the subject of the Fire station. I'd like to introduce a few people that are here: President of Council, Dennis Patten; Ward 2 Councilman, Jimmy Mencini; Ward 3 Councilwoman, Jan Powers; Ward 4 Councilman, Brian Higgins; Council At Large, Tony D'Amico and Councilman At Large Carl Burgio and Council at Large, Rick Salvatore couldn't be here tonight. What I'd like to do now is introduce our Mayor, Tom Coyne, who will give you hopefully all the information needed. Tom.

Mayor Coyne – Good evening I want to thank Councilman Troyer and Council President Patten for calling this meeting and I'm pleased to see the response the more you know the easier my job is. It doesn't make decisions difficult or understood most occasions but nonetheless that's why I'm the Mayor. I want to go through with you a couple of things so you understand that this decision wasn't just made because I happen to want to make it but it is my decision nonetheless. And it's a decision made in the context of the total responsibility I have to protect this city and most importantly, it's probably the most important responsibility, I have as Mayor most important to the public. Let me begin by saying is that most people are concerned about response times and there is a national standard for that response time. There is a great debate over that mainly because these times, these minimum times, were established back in 1979 and as we know so many things have changed and most of them changed for the better. Notwithstanding that there are television programs on that leaves the public to believe that everyone should be there in a minute and everyone can have all these various technologies that saved their life, real life is not that true. Let me begin by the standards; the NFPA (National Fire Protection Association) standard puts first responders with AED's (Automated External Defibrillator) on the scene within four (4) minutes of a call and that should be a goal being achieved by an entity that provides emergency medical service 90% of the time. ALS (Advanced Life Support) responses should be within eight minutes 90% of the time for life-threatening issues and that's again a standard that's being debated. I want to go through this dialogue with you and I

usually don't have to read things but I'm going to read them to you because I want you to know the research that I did on this prior to making this decision. You have some physicians...EMS physicians and you have some emergency medical providers across the country challenge the standards medical validity, they amongst themselves argue about these standards. Most, however, feel that in every minute of untreated ventricular defibrillation or cardiac arrest leads to a reduction in survival of up to 10% of the time. So they're saying is of course you should be there as fast as you can; of course you should be there and most importantly and most importantly administering the kind of aid that person, or that individual, needs to receive the kind of care they need and transporting them, hopefully, to the hospital for a physician to look at them. They also set the standard of a turn-out time; one minute for the call and the dispatch and four (4) minutes of the arrival for the arrival of a first responder 90% of the time. Notice none of these say 100% of the time and it's important that you pay attention to those numbers as I go through my explanation. Alright, the National Association of EMS physicians are debating rationale to justify where response intervals should be set. Is this component that was established in 1970's the real standards or should it be based on the community itself and they're willingness to decide for themselves what is acceptable. Okay and I'm saying it's up to us as to what is acceptable and as I go through this presentation you'll understand what I'm saying. Okay, there's reasonable data to show these are from doctors that symptoms until definitive care in the hospital for acute coronary syndromes and stroke are important. They're not aware of any data that shows that in some of these cases that things must be done with great caution, however, in medicine in general and EMS in particular. We have assumed that because of one aspect of the care is dependent on the particular intervention that doesn't mean all of it's going to be successful. Again, you know, you will see and talk about everyone expects lights and sirens like you seen on TV. Our own folks that come and respond to you will tell you it's not the best thing because most times it puts firefighters in danger and doesn't really...doesn't improve the experience for getting there really any faster, okay, and in this standard and this is the important thing as we talk about this, okay. The genesis of the eight minute standard is a good point to clarify in this discussion these are amongst these doctors that are debating this issue. Referenced four (4) minutes to BLS (Bureau of Labor Statistics) with eight minutes to ALS responsible targets has its origin with a paper that was created by Nicky Eisenberg (not sure of spelling) in May of 1979 and that was by the Journal of American Medicine entitled Cardiac Resuscitation on the community; the important and provision and implication for programmed planning. In other words how do you plan your community; how do you respond to all these people with a consistent 90% response throughout the whole community. Not just the West End not just the east end not just in the neighborhoods adjacent to the fire house but the whole community. The definitive care that they were referring to was defibrillation, the AED's that our fire department carries and are in different entities throughout the city; the Rec Center; the baseball fields and other things okay. It was also clear that we know that cardiac response is too long at eight minutes and needs to be four (4) minutes or less but this is for the delivery of the d...and it's going to be hard for me to keep saying this word...for the d-fib operation alright and that is for first responders and it's important that you pay attention to that. Okay, however in all the doctors' review of this there is no one size fits all. What's right for Middleburg

may not be right for Brook Park and what's right for Berea may not be right for Brook Park or likewise, okay. So to push these doctors of raising the standard that was put in 1979. What replaces the eight minute standard for ambulances? What replaces that, alright, and how do we answer in every community what it should be, they're still debating that. Now let's look fire service the majority of our responsibility in the town is responding to EMS calls and there's all kinds of classifications of those calls and I'm not going to get into that this evening. But there is also a standard in responding to fires, okay, and in a race against the house...I'm going to quote an EMS professional here in an article that was done in the Columbus dispatch which do these things. In a race against a house fire which can double in size every minute it burns firefighters should strive to get there in six (6) minutes. That improves their chances of saving lives and property according to a widely accepted national standard. It goes on to say that the National Fire Protection Association wants the departments to get to a fire within six (6) minutes 90% of the times, that's consistent. Times may change but that is not...that stays the same. The fire growth proves that beyond eight minutes it's beyond the room of origin. In other words that fire has spread to a degree that it's going to be difficult for firefighters to deal with that, okay. The fact of the matter is they also talk about well should we have a fire house and we all know that the cost of that is astronomical. I'm going to do a lot of water here as I'm suffering from dry mouth usually I can run on as all of you know for hours at a time but let me take a little break so I don't end up like Marco Ruby okay. Everybody wants to push run to the trucks and drive faster and this is the third leading cause of firefighter death or traffic accidents. So again how fast do they get there really isn't how fast they're driving the vehicles so if you don't see them sometimes with sirens blaring and these kinds of things there's very good reason and again they know the nature of the call. The Boston Globe did a thorough investigation in the State of Massachusetts about fire response things and they said that the biggest factor and I want you to think about all these things so you don't think I made this decision in a vacuum. It's not that I'm an expert on fire response or EMS I'm not but I've researched this before I made my final decision on this. The biggest missing variable in any analysis is the time that elapsed before anyone called the fire department or anyone called the EMS. That was the biggest factor in determining the success of the response of the community no matter what the standard of time was and, again remember, that this is a national standard that's set. There were issues about how the dispatchers handled this and what did they do and how long did it take them the guys to get dressed and get out of there and if you look at our response times they differ at different times of the day because sometimes the firefighters are sleeping. Sometimes we have multiple situations that are involved so again keep that in mind as I finally down to Brook Park, okay, but every situation in the fire is a six (6) minute issue again 90% of the time. Okay, years back when we did the signalization we talked about the ability of our safety forces to control the lights with devices in the vehicles and I'm not certain if that's activated but that's another thing that they responded to in Boston. That was really important for that to happen and I want you to keep that in mind as I talk about as the Councilman said what am I going to do to insure your safety in the future. What are we doing? We're not just sitting here saying I'm closing the fire station; I'm not doing anything, okay, so I want you to keep that in mind. Okay, let me move on next here to the City of Brook Park in particular and again this was all research that I can give to

Council by physicians; by experts, not Mayor Coyne the Mayor of the City of Brook Park. It's important that you understand our history and it's important you understand of where I've always been coming from and been consistent in this issue. As you know I was elected the first time as Mayor in 1982. Prior to that I represented primarily east of the tracks I lived there, at that time, with my family and it was always an issue about access to our folks. And the issue was railroad tracks that cut our city in half in two areas of the city and it limited our ability to access our people, I felt as a Councilman, in a reasonable amount of time the handicapped our firefighters. So at that time City Council I fought to get what they call telemetry units and what are those. They would least tell our firefighters don't go down Holland Road because there's a train there go down Snow Road because the train isn't there or don't go down Snow Road go down Holland Road because the train isn't there, alright. So that was a simple archaic way of letting our firefighters know not to proceed in that fashion so that we could get faster response time. So, lo and behold, in 1982 I ran...in 1981 I ran for Mayor of the City of Brook Park and I said one of my first priorities as Mayor would be to eliminate the access problems that burdened our safety forces; police and fire from a reasonable response time to the city. It never meant building a fire station; it never meant hiring seven more firefighters ever in my wildest imagination. And it's important for you to understand because on some of the blogs I see these issues this is all political. There's been politics aright and politics have been played with people on the east and west side of town mostly by politicians who were either inept or didn't have the courage to confront the situation head-on because they were a little bit concerned. That folks like you might come in this room and disagree with them. As you me over the years plenty of you in this room have supported what I've done and plenty of you have come and you've disagreed and I'm glad for both of you because that makes me proud to be the Mayor of this city that our citizens are here. Because in most cases they wouldn't be here and every time before I've ever done anything is notify people what's going to happen. Whether you like it or not I've always notified you and I have in this case. But what happened in 1981 literally as a cand...this is important sir. I know that you don't think it is but I think it's important that folks understand how these decisions were made and how it affects what's happening right now. Because at that time during the campaign a building was purchased firefighters were hired and a station was opened on the east end of the town that, in my view, wasted valuable resources and manpower into addressing the problem that should have been addressed. That's building the grade separation on Snow Road and it's important that you understand that because in the study that I did about centralizing services this is what began it. So for most of my time I was fighting to do two things; straightening out the access to the West End of the town because all of us that have been there for a long time remember what the old Tank Plant road used to look like, okay, and getting a grade separation built on Snow Road that cost \$6 million dollars. It took me most of my career to do that and without much local money both of those were federal grants. One because of the breakup of Conrail and the other because I had a demonstration project to build a technology park on the West End of town. So it's important that you understand this history because in reality when that station was opened and we still had the station on Smith Road and we had this station and we had the station on the West End of town our forces were depleted. There is not a city our size the square miles of Brook Park that have multiple fire

stations and there's a good reason why they don't but at anyhow it's important that you understand that because for all intensive purposes, to this day, we still have one fire station, we don't have two. I explained to you... and I'll show you later how we deliver services you'll understand. The ideal situation getting back is delivered timely, timely response 90% of the time and that is my goal and has always been my goal to do that out of a central location, okay. Now the overpass is built and if you look at my study back in 2000 when that was built and the traffic access to the West End was dealt with we should converge one station. Even when I was still Mayor, before I retired I tried to buy the property where Goody's is on right now. Why didn't I buy it because there were politics involved and the fact that folks again didn't want to confront you with a reasonable solution in the end that would have better resources for your tax dollars. That's why I'm telling you this history because it's important that you understand that I'm not doing this just to alarm a bunch of folks. I'm doing this because this is the proper way to deliver services in the city for the folks on the West End and everywhere else, so keep that in mind as we move forward. Okay, I've done an analysis of...we've had over the years back in the day we used to send two squads to calls all over the city and while that was impressive was that really the way to manage emergency response, I think not. So what would happen is two would go and if more help was needed two would transport; some would come back they would move here and operations sometimes the West End would have to respond; sometimes the east end would have to respond; all kinds of those things okay. Presently we have this chase vehicle okay and we've had other studies since I've left here and I've looked at them. At the end of the day the ultimate goal of this city from my standpoint in managing this city. Is that we have a central operation to go and send folks out for fire and EMS operations. So in looking at the data I wanted real data that would give me a real gauge so that even though I knew what the best way to manage. I was comfortable that I could sit here and tell you that I believe that I could deliver these services to you in less than the national average time because that's not acceptable to me or you and you won't be comfortable and first of all...second of all you won't believe it. So I had to be convinced myself looking at raw data and I felt the best way to do that was to look at that chase car. And how did that chase car respond because it goes to all of the calls throughout the city that have emergency response no matter what. And the first area I looked at was the West End of the city and the average of that response from that chase car more than 90% of the time was five (5) minutes, that was the average the five (5) minutes. Looking at presently the station on the West End of town what's their response to my street; to your street. It could be two minutes; it could be as much as eight minutes or it can be not at all because it might be responding to someplace else over on the east end of town. What's the rest of the city pretty well comparable, alright; we have responses from this station over to other calls on the eastern part of the city in less than (5) minutes responding. They're coming from that station to help somebody else and, again, these are all records that I've had the opportunity to look at. Because what's important is we have to be able to provide services simultaneously alright. So when the experience is the same from station number three on Holland Road they vary again responses all over the city from anywhere to two minutes to ten. What was some of the governing factors that may have increased the response time? We feel that every response...I live on Woodhill Drive should be to my house in one minute. Why didn't some of those

calls get there in one minute, well there's a lot of good explanations. Number one we're one fire department operating a satellite operation so sometimes those folks have to help others. Sometimes they transport people to the hospital, okay, so there's a lot of different reasons. So anyone that leads you to believe that they're sitting there all the time just to respond to us they're not nor should they be. Everyone in this city should expect a reasonable amount of time response for most of the time that's what they should expect and that's what I hope to deliver, alright. And again let's get back to fire ideally you'll hear the firefighters talk about minimum manning and we've had battles over that over the years. They were right about some things and the city was right about some things but at the end of the day presently I think I have settled the issues with the firefighters hopefully I have so their folks will all stay working and a ten-men shift, that's what they'll tell you. What does that give us the opportunity to do and again working out of one station? Most of the standards say there should be four personnel and I say men and women because I'm proud to say we have a woman on our department. That four personnel should be on the fire response vehicle whatever that choice may be. You heard me talk about two-man squads; chase vehicles; two ambulances responding. I have always believed and I see I think that's Chief Donnelly out there. I've always believed that we should have three folks on our ambulances. I believe this gives us the greatest ability to care for people whether we need two men in the back. You know before Chief Ramach left he said you know Mayor some of our biggest problems are hoarders. We can't get to folks because there's stuff all over the house some of our older people. So there's a lot of different things at the scene and most of the time when we have two folks there our guys get hurt. You know they have to lift somebody up dead weight doing things. So I, not just today, I've always believed that we should respond with three men or women squads throughout the city. Centralizing the operations will give us the ability to do that and also I think respond to simultaneous operations 90% of the time. I'm not going to tell you 100% there could be fire here; there could be a problem there; who knows. The firefighters and our EMT's (Emergency Medical Technicians) and our paramedics they know what issues come up with things every single day. God help us if there's ever an issue at one of our schools in talking to the chief our triage setup is on Eavenson Blvd. Then you say well why would you do that because the safety of the firefighters. If there's somebody engaged in some firearms and things at the school accept for the paramedic that travels with our...what do you call the specialized unit...the SWAT (Special Weapons and Tactics) unit we can't have firefighters under fire because they can't be protecting people and aiding them if they're under gun fire. So at any rate and in looking at all of this and my decision is that I want to meet that standard and I believe that we can provide all services in our city 90% of the time in five (5) minutes or less responding and why do I say that, what makes me the genius to make that so good. In my report of 2000 that addressed the city's issues one of greatest things in there that hadn't been entertained is you take five or ten years and bring this in and that's the AED's in our police cars. Because...in almost every call but it will be standard procedure in every call that they will respond with the AED's. They don't have to have get ready, get any equipment together they are there in the car and they are patrolling the city all the time. Now I know you'll sit there and tell me you don't see the police cars they're not around we don't see them. Well the fact of the matter is we're going to dedicate...we have two

right now in the city and they'll be dedicated to the far West End of the town and again. I believe and almost no occasion will they really have to do anything except to respond to that thing within one or two minutes of the issue and our folks should be there in five (5) minutes or less 90% of the time. Okay what else are we doing? Centralized dispatch. Why is that important? Most of the things that occur today from the fire standard not only in Brook Park but every place is mutual aid because of a lot of different reasons. The fire components of most cities are not manned to the degree that our firefighters feel comfortable with or chiefs feel comfortable with. Alright, what does that mean? We should hire 40 firefighters put them out there? No because that's not reasonable to do that but we have...we're going to...we have mutual aid with NASA and will get into that particular and with the surrounding departments. I remember when I was Mayor here literally the Brook Park Fire Department put out every major fire in this area. Know what is going on now we are getting mutual aid more to us then we're giving it to anyone else and that's not acceptable to me. Again, I want to operate a fire department out of a central location so that we are sure we can respond to those kinds of things. That doesn't mean mutual aid won't be needed certainly it will. So when we do the new central dispatch what will happen, alright? The fact of the matter is not only will our folks get the call that dispatcher can press two buttons at one time and the mutual aid responders. Our department won't have to call them that we need help it will be done automatically through that central dispatch to modernize things. So from my standpoint I believe that this is the right decision to make and it might not be popular with you. Certainly people can challenge that and will it be my responsibility if something happens? Certainly it would; certainly it would but I am confident that this is the best way to go. Is it perfect yet no it's not. It will be perfect, almost perfect, maybe we'll be 91% of the time when I can relocate our operations to Fry and Snow Roads. Now is that the center of the city? No it's not the uniqueness of Brook Park. I've heard people say we're different from everybody else we're a rectangular. I can't tell you what shape we are because it's unique. Most of our city is gobbled up in the center by the airport for a lot of varying degrees. Most of our city I'd say pretty close to almost a third of our city is Holy Cross Cemetery. Now we don't need to respond there very often but we still do because people get upset. The other part is Ford and we know the plant population of Ford is down but we still have to protect that facility. Another part making up almost a third of our city is NASA Glenn and NASA Glenn does today and will in the future get a response from the Hopkins International Airport and we have worked out with the chief over there. As a matter of fact I can't say he's excited about it but one of the things that any chief will tell you; or any officer will tell you the more the folks deal with these problems the better off they are. It's a bad situation if there aren't fires and we don't want fires at the airport and so you know we have mutual aid. We respond to fires at the airport too so it's not something that they're doing but they will help us respond to the West End and to NASA as well. Now, what's the difference going to be? Presently if Cleveland responds to something; an ambulance for say. Is that they will charge whatever they wish to charge for their service we don't do that. If NASA responds and we determine they should transport they will only charge what we charge from the city and we don't charge anymore than your insurance provides. So I don't know what more I can tell you about this I've researched it thoroughly from not only the standpoint of public management. From a standpoint of those folks that are struggling

to meet a criteria now that's a challenge and it's not a perfect science. I believe that we can deliver less than the national standards when you incorporate everything that is available to us to respond to our people. So I'm going to have a glass of water and if there's any particular questions that you may have I'll be happy to answer them.

Liz Sayers

23065 Cedar Point Road

Ms. Sayers – I have a question when you said centralizing what's it going to cost the city to upgrade the dispatch?

Mayor Coyne – We have a grant of \$900,000 that we've been awarded to incorporate dispatch with the City of Olmsted Falls, Olmsted Township we believe Berea and Middleburg Hts. are coming. We hope to centralize duties right in Southwest General Hospital, so that's going on as we speak. So what is it going to cost us? Actually by centralizing dispatch with the other cities and the capabilities of doing so many things with modern technology we believe it will actually reduce our costs.

Ms. Sayers – Okay now when you were saying that because I'm in the middle of Brook Park also okay. And you read all this stuff about response times and everything else. Now I'm in an area that does not touch Brook Park we touch Cleveland and NASA and whatever boundary lines are there, okay. Now you all know me I went around I had 100 miles an hour in my vet from one place...from one fire department to see how long it would get to my house and you know me I've got a lead foot and I can go, you know. I wouldn't want to be laying in my front yard waiting for somebody to come and take care of me because it would take them longer than you think. It's not I've taken care of people that have heart attacks you name it okay. Now living where I live at I timed a police officer and it took him over 15 minutes to get to our house and it's been 20 minutes and it's been all different kinds of different times. Now the fire department is right there you closed it; you made up your mind it's not going to be a fire department there. Okay and you said that it's going to nine minutes; ten minutes; average of everything. Everybody is different and your times are all different you can't calculate how long somebody is going to come over there. It's just like, you know, I found you in your yard, okay. By the time I call and somebody comes over there I'd better not be waiting I'd better be doing something for you, okay. If you had heart surgery; how would I know if you had heart surgery I can't do CPR on you, you know, or fibulate you or anything like that. So how would you know? Would the police officer know this? Okay, what I'm concerned about is that there are a lot of older people there in that neighborhood. There's people that live alone there, okay.

Now everybody is worried about money and everybody's worried about everything else in the blue book here but did anybody think about the people in that neighborhood. We've got elderly people living there okay. How are they going to call and if they do call well we'll be there it's going to take us about ten minutes because we're on another call.

Mayor Coyne – That's happening right now you know. I don't think you listen to what I said. That's happening...that's occurring right now....

Ms. Sayers – Yeah, I know but you're telling me...

Mayor Coyne – Everyone...okay...

Ms. Sayers – Now wait a minute...

Mayor Coyne – I'm sorry go ahead...

Ms. Sayers – You're telling me the response time with everybody coming there. When that fire department is closed there's no ambulance there's no fire trucks there, okay. Alright, you closed it all up how do think these people behind me feel, they're feeling very insecure. I can't talk about... you know I can't answer for any of them. But I have a boyfriend there that's failing health and everything and you close that place up and that ambulance is off doing its thing somewhere else or anything he's laying there. I'm going to pick up almost a 300 pound man and throw him in my truck to make sure he gets to the hospital, that's how you're making me feel. What happens if you're on the side of the road, you know, or you ran into the gate as NASA and you can call your law department to come and pick you up. You're always covered these people aren't going to be covered. My heart is going out for especially for one of my neighbors especially, okay. I see how long it takes for everybody to get over to that neighborhood. They don't give a rat's butt about that neighborhood they all have attitudes.

Mayor Coyne – Who is they?

Ms. Sayers – The police department; I have the ambulance coming to my house.

Mayor Coyne – I couldn't disagree with you more...

Ms. Sayers – Well, that's fine....

Mayor Coyne – Couldn't disagree with you more...

Ms. Sayers – Well, you know what I've recorded a lot of your employees so you know what I have an attitude because they give me an attitude.

Mayor Coyne – Ma'am they're your employees, they're employed by you.

Ms. Sayers – Well, you know what...

Mayor Coyne – Let me say this to you in the majority of the calls it's the same people, alright, and our dispatchers pretty much know what's going on and they can tell somebody. What I'm saying to you is right now the way we were operating for the whole city including you doesn't give you the consistency. I was shocked to look at these numbers and the time responses. These are real numbers and some of them where time wasn't even indicated, okay. So the fact of the matter is what we think is occurring is not necessarily occurring. So what I'm....

Ms. Sayers – But closing that fire department not having a fire department there or an ambulance service. Like I said why don't you put you in our shoes...

Mayor Coyne – I am ma'am I live there.

Ms. Sayers – I know you live there but...

Mayor Coyne – I'm 64 years old and I have high blood pressure and I take heart medicine so I'm one of them. I can tell you this right now...

Ms. Sayers – Yeah, but you know the difference between you and I.

Mayor Coyne – What's that?

Ms. Sayers – I'll tell you what the difference is between you and I. You can call anybody here and they will come and rescue you.

Mayor Coyne – I can't call anybody...I have to tell you something right now...

Ms. Sayers – You're not telling me...

Mayor Coyne – Well, I'm going to tell you because that statement is ridiculous...

Ms. Sayers – You know why it's ridiculous because it's the truth...

Mr. Patten – Liz, Liz let's keep the quorum in here...

Ms. Sayers – Okay...

Mr. Patten – There's a lot of people here and a lot of people want to address....

Ms. Sayers – Well, let them address but I'm just telling you the response time is horrible there...

Mr. Patten – I understand...

Ms. Sayers – You know what I'm in the medical field I don't want...

Mayor Coyne – Is the response time horrible now?

Ms. Sayers – Yeah, it is...

Mayor Coyne – Okay, thank you.

Ms. Sayers – It is and all your data and all your paperwork and everything. You come over there and sit in my yard and watch how long it takes for somebody...

Mayor Coyne – Okay, I'll be happy too.

Ms. Sayers – Yeah, to rescue me...

Mayor Coyne – I hope you'll never need to have that experience.

Ms. Sayers – I already have and it was a joke.

Mayor Coyne – Well you're here, you're standing here right now, God Bless You.

Ms. Sayers – I have to take care of myself...

Mr. Patten – Okay Liz we're not going to go back through this. Name and address for the record please Nancy.

Nancy Cangey
23328 Cedar Point Road

My name is Nancy my husband Phil and I just want to say that response times were actually fabulous. 2003 my husband had a stroke they were there probably in 3 ½ minutes. Again, I needed them my husband had a heart attack they were there in 2 ½ minutes and then again in another time when his blood pressure just shot out of the roof and they were there again maybe 3 minutes tops. I know you have to make the decisions I'm really sorry that if this fire department does have to be closed because I know personally it has saved my husband's life.

Mr. Cangey – It did.

Mrs. Cangey – Not once, not twice but three times so I hope that maybe you can reconsider and something might be able to work out.

Applause from the audience

Mayor Coyne – Let me make a few points to you and you know what. That's largely because of the folks that are there to respond to you. Make no mistake about it the folks that deliver the service, our paramedics. Let me tell you a few things that interesting okay. Why did this happen? Alright a response on Woodhill in 2013 and I went back a year one of them was 4.7 from the station on Ruple Road; one was 6.33 and that was to my street again; one was 5.2 to Cedar Point; one was 7.7 to Cedar Point, why the variances in times? So what I'm saying to you is what we believe is the case and I'm not telling you these responses are bad I still think they're good. I think we can make them better is what I'm saying to you so everybody thinks are some of them too and I'll give you an example. From this station over here 3/28/13 this station responded to a fire at Greystone or an EMS to Greystone Blvd. You know how long it took them 5.41 that's coming from that station all the way over here. These aren't my numbers these are fire department numbers so what I'm saying to you, again, is I believe we can improve upon these things, alright. So in reality it's not to say that folks aren't there all the time. We have one fire department we don't have two and we didn't have four and we didn't have three. We spread folks around for expediency because no one wanted to deal with the compelling issue and that is this. It is in the best interest of this city and may God strike me dead and maybe some of you feel that way that this is the best decision going forward for this community. So what I'm saying to you is thank God your husband is still here, thank God...

Mrs. Cangey – Well, I’m just saying that I’m extremely thankful...

Mayor Coyne – So what I’m saying is I’m not making this decision in a vacuum, alright. So what is good is for the whole town is doing this and I believe without making the West End suffer at all. Alright, because...

Mrs. Cangey – I understand that but when I...

Mayor Coyne – Because to insure things we will also have a first response from Cleveland Hopkins International Airport’s Fire Rescue to NASA and the West End. So we’ll still have all of that which we help them and respond as well...

Mrs. Cangey – I just don’t feel that we’ll have the same response but I’m...

Mayor Coyne – I know that you don’t but I’m giving you real numbers...

Mrs. Cangey – I’m giving you real numbers too that have happened in real life to us three times and they were all under, way under five (5) minutes. Thank you.

Applause from the audience

Mayor Coyne – Okay, thank you.

Lena Powling
6552 East Vancey Drive

Ms. Powling – Mayor Coyne what you’re telling us is we should be expecting the airport to come and save us when we need it.

Mayor Coyne – No, I didn’t say that. What I said was they’ll respond simultaneously which actually gives you some insurance that the rest of the city does not have, that’s what I’m saying to you. We are going to respond alright. In the event, let’s just say, in the event and look it all these numbers have to...you know no one factors in simultaneous incidents which happen more often then even I realized. So therefore at any given time they may be the responder, they may, but most of time 90% of the time even by these numbers we are going to be there with them at the same time. And you might find they arrive earlier because again you don’t know if someone is being transported; you don’t know what the condition is of that day and what occurs...

Ms. Powling – And we don't know how many trains are on the tracks that surround us.

Mayor Coyne – NASA has nothing to do with the trains and what I'm saying to you...

Ms. Powling – No, but what I'm saying if we need someone from station one to come to our neighborhood and there are trains running simultaneously in both directions, which at 4:50 this afternoon I sat at the train tracks at Sheldon Road watching trains come both directions...

Mayor Coyne – Right...

Ms. Powling – So that means the Eastland tracks were busy...

Mayor Coyne – Correct...

Ms. Powling – And the Sheldon tracks were busy...

Mayor Coyne – Correct....

Ms. Powling – So now the fire department has to go down to Snow Road...

Mayor Coyne – Correct...

Ms. Powling – Up to 237

Mayor Coyne – Correct...

Ms. Powling – Which takes a lot longer..

Mayor Coyne – Not really and that's what they should be doing now....

Mumbles from the audience

Mayor Coyne – No, not really I mean under..look it...the fact of the matter is that's not factual, it's just not factual. In looking at the runs the one time that we exceeded; two times was the fire response coming down Sheldon Road went to Lou Grossa Blvd. because the trains were blocked. If we have the telemetry units working we'll know so that we'll have a quicker response to the area behind Donte's, we'll know. We don't know now and why those units were allowed not to be continued

operable is news to me. What I'm saying to you is they should be going down that's why we made this expense over here to do the overpasses; to do the underpasses; to eliminate that situation. I'll also tell you this, alright, let's just say you lose minutes there. The longest stretch of street in this town without signalization and those responders will tell you signalization is an issue because they have to still stop at those intersections. The longest stretch in this town runs from the IX-Center all the way back to Cedar Point Road, doesn't exist anyplace else. So I can argue if it's a minute and a half to go that way you gain the time going the other way. So this is logistics, okay.

Ms. Powling – Mayor Coyne thank you very much for your time.

Mayor Coyne – Thank you for coming up?

Patricia McCartney
21766 Forestview Circle

Ms. McCartney – I'm sorry I live on Forestview Circle...

Mayor Coyne – Don't be sorry it's a wonderful street...

Ms. McCartney – Anyway, you mentioned centralizing and if Brook Park can't get to us via ambulance that some place else could. And I know years ago I read where the suburbs are changing where if you don't live in their suburb and you use their service that they charge more.

Mayor Coyne – I addressed that before ma'am.

Ms. McCartney – I didn't completely understand what you said.

Mayor Coyne – Okay, what they've agreed to do is they will bill like we bill and we don't bill exceeding what's covered by your insurance.

Ms. McCartney – Well, there was a mix up with my husband's bill...

Mayor Coyne – Okay...

Ms. McCartney – I almost had a heart attack, (*laughter*) I really did.

Mayor Coyne – I can understand that and what I will tell you the final reconciler is the Mayor and I have in the past...

Ms. McCartney – This didn't come from Brook Park...

Mayor Coyne – I know and in the past I am the final decider and we are the ones that charge you. So I have on occasion for people that are indigent or in a financial situation I have determined that they don't have to pay those, okay. Now that could be a legal challenge but that's what I've done in the past. I don't know if that was done when I was gone but that's what I did.

Ms. McCartney – Okay, another thing is the trains. I travel to my daughter's who live in Brook Park from the West End and I take kids back and forth to school and that and I'm going crazy sometimes with the trains. There are trains that sometimes stop on Engle now if you're coming to our area and you happen to go down Engle there's a train there...

Mayor Coyne – Correct...

Ms. McCartney – I mean there's just trains blocking all around.

Mayor Coyne – It ultimately would be nice to know when those trains are blocking those crossings...

Ms. McCartney – It would be nice, on Sheldon Road last Saturday...

Mayor Coyne – Right and what I'm saying to you is we had that capability at one time. So realistically if we could know that and that would happen with the central dispatch. In fact all the Mayors that are going to be involved in this have the same issues. With Olmsted Falls there are train issues...

Ms. McCartney – They are starting to stop and park on Sheldon Road or go very slow because I think there's...

Mayor Coyne – Right, again ideally if we know when the tracks are blocked we should avoid them and, therefore, go down Snow Road and that's the proposal is to build a new station and police station, hopefully, on Snow Road. If you're so kind to give me a few extra dollars we will do that and they will be closer to the overpasses and underpasses that were constructed primarily to avoid this safety issue that we have. Now all the time will they...if we have the telemetry unit they won't have to go there all the time and if we have that aided fire department. For instance why did it take that chase car ten minutes to get to the West

End of town at one time because that vehicle responded going down Sheldon Road...

Ms. McCartney – yeah...

Mayor Coyne – And I'm looking at that asking what the hell is our chase vehicle doing on Lou Grossa Blvd. This is what happened and should not have happened, okay. There are still logistics that have to be worked out but I'm telling you they are man-made and they're manageable and ultimately all the things that you have right now. The quiet zones and all those fundings came through my intercession with the federal government to address those issues. Now has it become paramount to Berea and Middleburg Hts. certainly to us to have another grade separation either at Eastland or Sheldon Road it probably does. It probably does but still what I'm saying to in reviewing all these issues I am still confident that we can deliver what we need delivered to our folks. In less than a standard time nationally and again I told you it's a moveable object that the national standards depends on a lot of conditions that even physicians argue about it as to what the situation is. Myself, like you, because I heard a few laughs about the police with the AED's throughout the country and all our patrolmen are certified on that as well as the officers. Now do I want that to be the major dependable thing for you that they will be there in half the of the national standards and hopefully our ambulance folks, who are the trained professionals will be there in that five (5) minute window, somewhere between four (4) and five (5) minutes. I think if we can do that 90% of the time; not sometimes two and sometimes ten and sometimes seven if we can do that 90% of the time. Then we will have not only met our needs but exceeded our needs and remember things are changing all the time. I had a chief at a meeting and he wasn't ours, believe me, because we're taking the lead on the central dispatch trying to understand how someone from Middleburg Hts. can call a dispatch unit at the hospital and get the same response that he's getting out of Middleburg Hts. We're dispatching drones out of Arizona to Afghanistan all right and we have a mix of folks in this dispatch unit that's going to know our city; know our issues. At the end of the day, ultimately, that's going to be where we need to go and this is the first step that we need to get there. The easiest thing for me to say is you know what I'm not going to tackle this issue let it go on and retire in three years and say ah well it's okay; it's not okay. And I'm going to tell you this. This has nothing to do with money at all, it has nothing to do with it. It has to do with managing a system and delivering results it wouldn't be okay if I had a \$2 million dollar surplus and it's not okay with a \$1.5 million deficit. It's not the

way the department should be operated and anyone who is surprised by that hasn't followed my history as Mayor. From the first day I took office it was important for me to tackle this issue so in totality our citizens have consistent response to their needs. So that is what this is about and nothing else.

Ms. McCartney – Well, all I know is Ruple Road was there in less than five (5) minutes. Holland Road came six (6) minutes later and my husband was in good hands in less than five (5) minutes.

Mayor Coyne – Okay and we trust that will be the case in the future....

Ms. McCartney – We're all older over there...

Mayor Coyne – We trust that will be the case in the future but what I'm saying to you is one of the biggest things was another study was done when we go to the hospital and we're injured. It seems like forever before we get any response...

Ms. McCartney – You're in the hospital you're going to be taken care of.

Mayor Coyne – But even there and if you've been to an emergency room you know what I'm talking about, oh my God it took so long and then...

Ms. McCartney – Yeah, I've been there but you're there...

Mayor Coyne – Alright, what I'm trying to explain to you is a lot of it is impression, how long a time is it and the most important thing is when you get there what happens when they get there.

Ms. McCartney – I'm saying when they came to the house...

Mayor Coyne – What I'm saying to you ma'am there are difference from two minutes to ten minutes. They're not consistent and that's true all over the city and the West End as well. What particular circumstances went into those and most of our calls are not those of heart attacks and things like that. There's a lot of EMS qualifications that are involved here so there's not as many as we think as well. So again all I'm trying to do is assure you and I don't expect you not to be confused or angry to some degree but I didn't just sit here and say I'm going to do this because I want to do it. It is the right thing to do; it was the right thing to do years ago and it's the right thing to do now.

Ms. McCartney – You tell that to all my neighbors that have been there for 47 years and we're all in our 60's and 70 year olds.

Mayor Coyne – I'm 64 and I've lived there for 30 years.

Ms. McCartney – We have never seen EMT's so much as in this past three, four or five years in our neighborhood. So it worries us that they're not going to be there anymore and we're going to be waiting on them.

Mayor Coyne – They're going to be there but coming from a different location and I can argue better prepared to respond to all the needs of the city equally.

Ms. McCartney – Thank you Mayor Coyne.

Mayor Coyne – Thank you.

Ricky Allen
6542 Arden Avenue

Mr. Allen – Myself and probably many others here are having a hard time buying your addition by subtraction here. I don't understand how when you take something away you're going to tell us that we're going to get something that's better. This city used to have three fire departments and I know as you're well aware I believe there were nine men on duty at all times, at that point. Now that the other station has been shut down at best there's seven men on duty right now and you're telling me if we shut down another station. We're going to somehow go from seven up to ten men when it's rumored that we'll go back down to five men for a city of our size. Can you address that?

Mayor Coyne – I sure will because the fact of the matter is that we've had ten men shifts in the city for some time. We used to have a nine man minimum alright?

Mr. Allen – Can you tell me why we don't have ten men on a daily basis in our city?

Mayor Coyne – I'll try because that decision was made before I was here.

Mr. Allen – Correct.

Mayor Coyne – However, having said that what this did is in my view we've always only had one fire station, we've had satellites. Mayor Elliott closed a station on the east end of town and I told you how that came about. Mayor Coyne closed a station on Smith Road and I told you how that came about. Mayor Coyne commissioned a study to centralize fire and EMS operations...

Mr. Allen – Which you're quoting things from 1979...

Mayor Coyne – No sir, what I said to you...

Mr. Allen – Response times from 1979 are...

Mayor Coyne – If I may answer your question...

Mr. Allen – The call volume has gone up astronomically since 1979...

Mayor Coyne – No, you didn't understand a word I said...

Mr. Allen – That is exactly what you told us sir...

Mayor Coyne – Okay, let me go back and start from the beginning the standard...

Audience saying no, no, no...

Mayor Coyne – The standard...

Mr. Allen – You're giving us the standard from 1979...

Mayor Coyne – And I explained to you, sir, why that's not applicable today.

Mr. Allen – And I'm telling you why it's not applicable today because our call volume goes up every...

Mayor Coyne – And I agree with that...

Mr. Allen – single year...

Mayor Coyne – Well, it doesn't go up every year on the West End I can assure...

Mr. Allen – It does go up every year...

Mayor Coyne – No it doesn't I can show you the records...

Mr. Allen – No matter the population call volume increases on a yearly basis, sir.

Mayor Coyne – Sir, I can demonstrate to you that the call volume on the West End has declined and half of it....

Mr. Allen – I'm speaking as a city as a whole sir..

Mayor Coyne – Okay what I'm saying to you, yes...

Mr. Allen – If an ambulance is busy on the east end...

Mayor Coyne – Yes and you're making my argument...

Mr. Allen – They're not going to help you on the West End...

Mayor Coyne – You're making my argument for me and you're not allowing me to do so, all right. Now the fact is this the ten man staffing for whatever reason Mayor Elliot decided to do that; financial reasons or whatever it may be that was his decision. And it was his decision to address one satellite closing and not two; for whatever reason he did that God Bless him. Do I think ten men on a shift is enough; it's close to enough. I'm not certain let me finish...

Mr. Allen – So you're telling me that if we close this station...

Mr. Patten – One at a time speak, you will get your chance, just one at a time.

Mayor Coyne – Here's the real number because of vacations; because firefighters getting injured; because of a lot of different variable issues being sick, whatever. You can have seven men on duty that's what governs it. Now, again, the previous Mayor determined that was the proper staffing I'm not certain that it is. I'm not certain that it is but I don't know that but I believe right now with that ten men. Will give us on most days seven and a minimum manning issues choked this city because it wasn't driven by management it was driven by a lot of other factors. At one time we were paying \$600,000 a year in overtime, okay. Did that make any sense I don't' think so but the fact of the matter is

what I'm saying to you. I've said from the very beginning of time as the Mayor of this city the right number of response people in a central location in this city, as close to central as could be, is the best way to deliver these services in this town. I have not changed my mind in 30 years because I believe and think the numbers show that and what I said to you is this. That standard was set in 1979 with EMS Physicians arguing that's not the right standard; doctors; emergency people; what is the standard? What I said was the standard is what is acceptable to this community and it's an ever changing thing as to how you deliver these services. I would have sat there...when I looked at this study from 1979 it accentuated very heavily the importance of AED's in police cars. Do I think the policemen are as talented to deliver the kind of service that folks may require on certain runs as our firefighters? No way in hell, no way in hell am I suggesting that. But even that standard from 1979 said the important thing said is how fast you get an AED there and in most cases 90% of the time. That's their standard not mine and it's not acceptable to me. I know we can approve on that and I will tell you this if I believe that we need to increase personnel to provide the kind of standard that I think is not only acceptable to you but acceptable to me I will do that. I can assure you that I will do that so what I'm saying to you is all of these things are variables and a lot of them are out of your control and my control but even the situation you have right now you're response time varies for very valid reasons. And sometimes it's because the nature of the way we have to operate because of the satellites that we have. I can tell you this if I would have stayed, for better or for worse, we wouldn't be sitting here talking about this issue today. I'd have a fire house on Snow Road so that our guys can get to the track issue quicker. It would be here and I don't know how many men we would have maybe a couple more; maybe the same; I don't know that. But we would have been a lot better off and I can assure I wouldn't have waited to confront you with this issue. I wouldn't have waited because that doesn't serve you well. The biggest thing that's a disservice to you is not taking action because someone to come in the meeting and say listen ladies and gentlemen I know how you feel; I know that you're upset but let me say this to you it is my responsibility. Not anybody else in this room to make sure you're safe and I can tell you this I am confident that with the operations as I've proposed them that we can protect the people of this city as best as can be 90% of the time. I happen to believe it will be 100% of the time unless we have such a disaster and I want to bring our responses once again so that we can provide all services that we possibly can with the minimal amount of assistance from everybody else. Now that's impossible but that is my

goal as the Mayor of this city and before I leave here I hope to attain that.

Jim Astorino
6258 Engle Road

Mr. Astorino – Council President I'd like to thank you for co-hosting this along with Ward 1 Councilman, Tom Troyer. With your permission I've got a few pieces that I'd like to share with Council people.

Mr. Patten – This is your time.

Mr. Astorino, Okay, thank you.

Mayor Coyne – Can I get a copy as well.

Mr. Astorino distributed information to Members of Council and Mayor Coyne.

Mr. Astorino – The main purpose I'm here tonight for you is...As most of you know I was a firefighter in Brook Park for over 32 years but most of that time I served as the local president and also serve as president of the union for the regional area of firefighters. One of the things when they talked about closing the fire station that most of the firefighters felt that they had to do. Is first off I'd like to say that we're very pleased to see that the residents are here, there were some debate amongst the firefighters whether we should show up for this meeting. There are a few of us in the audience the residents that are firefighters we showed up here. But we did not want to make a show of force with firefighters because we felt this is a concern for the residents. We are concerned also but the residents have to show that concern. They told me they felt it was their duty to inform the residents that their safety is going to be negatively impacted by the closing of this fire station. Because as you heard in a fire or medical emergency a quick response time is the key to a favorable outcome and survival for patients. Closing fire station two (2) adds four miles to the distance that the firefighters must travel. In other words if you live on the West End of town; Norwood, Grayland area they're two miles from station number two (2). The distance between station number three (3) and station number two (2) is four (4) miles with the route they have to take because they need to go down Engle Road take Snow Road and go around that adds four (4) more miles. So when I hear the Mayor saying we're going to be there in four (4) or five (5) more minutes I don't know how you're going to travel six (6) miles in

four (4) or five (5) minutes it's just not going to happen. So in closing of the fire station presents a grave and foreseeable danger to the residents back on that end of town. Closing the station means you're going to have to wait longer and the American Heart Association established a standard that says. In the event of a cardiac arrest brain death begins four (4) minutes stops breathing. So if you close it they're going to have to travel an additional four (4) miles; so they're going to have to go six (6) miles which could be up to 12 minutes. So you're going to have to wait longer than four (4) minutes if somebody's stops breathing. If you live in the area that's pretty much between Donte's and Ruple along Sheldon there you're about a half mile to a mile from station two (2) which is approximate two (2) to three (3) minutes. If they close that station you're about two (2) to three (3) miles so they've doubled your travel time or more to get there. You know you hear stuff about NFPA (National Fire Protection Association) and a lot of response time means that food fire that's on top of your stove is going to become a kitchen fire because you hear that a fire doubles every minute. So the longer it takes us to get there that fire gets a little bit bigger and if delayed even longer that room fire becomes a house fire you've now lost your house, and you're going to wait longer. You heard about the reports; the Mayor had a report done in 2000; Mayor Elliott before him had a report done in 2011 and on page three of my handout to you. We go through the leadership solutions study that were done and the recommendation that the west station can only be closed following construction of Expo Center Drive and the construction of a centrally located fire station in the vicinity of Snow and Fry. So you have to build a station there first before you close this station.

Applause and accolades from the audience

Mr. Astorino – Because in that study it identifies time is the issue that is most significantly affects the survival. It also identifies that the ALS response must have a response time of six (6) minutes or less with 90% reliability. If you're going to make a ambulance travel six (6) miles they're not going to get there within the six (6) minutes it's just not possible. You'd have to go 60 miles an hour to get there and we don't travel that fast, it's not safe for us. You heard that traffic accidents are the third major cause of firefighting, we know about traffic safety. So this study and one of the things, if you read the study, and I think it can be provided to you it's a city report it's not presented by the fire fighters; wasn't the union doing it the city paid for this. What they talked about back in 2000 was there should be 15 members per shift to provide the proper protection (*applause from the audience*). So when Mayor Coyne

says it's always his belief it's because he ignored a study that was done for the city. He's ignoring that report and did for all that time and you heard him just before I got up here talking about the overtime. There's also in that report that says if you had more firefighters you wouldn't have that overtime (*applause from the audience*) so you can provide proper service without overtime with manpower. It's also the location that's important the study that was done by Mayor Elliott prior to this talks about travel time and says that anything west of station two (2) is outside the eight (8) minute response time. That study actually recommended leaving station two (2) open and then forming a station at Snow at Smith and Holland in that area and you could close three (3) and four(4). Well that Mayor didn't follow that either he closed station four (4) and left this station over here on Holland Road, so he didn't follow the study. They get this studies done but they do what they want irregardless of what the standards are and irregardless of what the experts actually say. Fire Chief Ramach back in 2010 did an evaluation for the fire department for the city he presented it to the Mayor and that's on page six there's some bullet points. These studies are rather extensive they don't really mean much sometimes to the layperson because it talks a lot of technical stuff. We had our guys go through it and give you bullet points so that you can see that if defibrillation is delayed more than ten minutes survival rates drop to less than five-percent, less than five-percent. So when they talk about you're going to get there within 90% of the time he's talking about city-wide. He's not talking about getting within any amount of time on the West End. You guys are going to be bringing the average down that's our concern. Fire Chief Ramach in his report and evaluation he discusses the size of Brook Park and states it's very similar to the size and shape of Berea and Middleburg Hts. put together. You take those two towns and you put them together and it's the same shape because when you talk about one station for Middleburg and one station for Berea that's because they are rectangular. They can go from one border; they can go from their east border to their west border in a lot closer time. I've gone through some of that and presented that and you can see I provided along those some of the covers of the reports so that you can see that and ask for it. If you don't have them I do and can provide copies but when you talk about going from one end of town you can see from...I did this using MapQuest and it's very simple to do and you don't need to necessarily hire experts in today's world; you can just get on the computer and do it. When you go from West 130th and Bagley Road which is the eastern border of Middleburg to Bagley Road and Eastland which is the western border it's three and a quarter miles from one side to the other. Then from Bagley Road and Eastland Road which is the eastern border of

Berea to Bagley Road and Lewis which is the western border it's 2.74 miles, so the total distance traveled through Middleburg and Berea is six (6) miles and they have two fire stations to cover that area. If you use MapQuest and you go West 130th and Snow Road which is the eastern border of Snow Road and then you take 237 it's 2.74 miles and if you go from 237 to Cedar Point and Ruple which is the western border of Brook Park it's 3.69 miles. So the total distance traveled is 6.43 miles through Brook Park. You can go through both towns Berea and Middleburg in six (6) miles it's longer in Brook Park. That's why we have two stations to cover it and some of the information that was provided tonight. You can see on page nine I gave you the graphic showing Brook Park and its shape. The last page, page 10, shows you it's an overview map of Brook Park and it shows you that in 1986 the one area in the eastern portion of town that area fell outside the response time of the 90% when Mayor Coyne closed station no. 1 back in 1986. Then back in 2012 when they closed station four that area there is east of Middlebrook that fell out of the response time. Because if you read that report they said you're not going to be exposing those residents to any worse response time than any other response time that other residents get. In other words the people that live in the area off of Pemberton and such they get a bad response time over there so now by closing station four some of these other people are going to get it too. So it's okay because you're not treating them any worse you're just treating them bad like the rest of them. Then when you look at the other side and you see in 2014 if you close station two (2) basically the West End is outside the area. So you've now taken almost half of your town and you've reduced the level of services you're providing for ambulance and fire protection and that's not right. When they closed station four (4) we had firefighters standing before Council Members look the people of this town pay for this community; pay for these services they expect these services. The level of service is going to be decreased by this so what does the community expect. It's not what one man expects it's what the community expects and they expect that station to be there because that's what the national standards are. The American Heart Association and the NFPA say if you close that station the City of Brook Park will be outside that standard for those people on that side of town and that's not right. I ask Council to do something because apparently the Mayor has made up his mind and yes I worked for the man for 20 years. Once he makes up his mind it's very difficult to change it but he set a standard too he said it's community expectation. I think by the audience you see tonight community on that side of town expects you to do your job; provide them the protection that this city can afford and this city needs to provide. Thank you. *(applause from the audience)*

Mayor Coyne - Mr. Chairman, if I may respond.

Mr. Patten - Just one minute let the Mayor respond.

Mayor Coyne - I was hoping not to get into to a debate with 1141 of the firefighters union. Quite frankly because his statements were disingenuous at best and most of them are duplicitous.

(audience saying no, no...)

Mayor Coyne - Yeah well...the reality is you don't want to hear that because he's hoping that you don't want to hear that. Let me give the facts Jim has a great talent of taking parts of things and construing them the way he wants. *(illegible remarks from the audience)*. I want to say this from the beginning I'm not disparaging our members that provide you service I'm giving you the practical reality of management because they don't match. First of all let me say this that all of you should understand I believe we concluded negotiations this evening and when I talked to Councilman Troyer and Council President Patten it was my hope to stick to the logistics of meeting out service to folks. It is not acceptable for people on the east end; West End or the center of town to have service levels that do not match what needs to be done. Those same standards that he talked about that's why I went through them to say there's a great deal of debate about those even today. But let me ask you this question; if this is of such concern how can the head of this union propose to me in a union negotiation that they will not oppose this station if I give them certain things in their contract and that's a fact. I'm not making this stuff up so what I'm saying to you it isn't okay if I can give you the money to go away; it isn't okay or acceptable to have brown-outs at stations; it isn't okay ever. So let's just say this that there are issues that are very sincere that the firefighters raise. There are also issues that have been contributing to our ability to deliver services. I want to answer his question because it's important. Now let me say this he refers to all these reports; here's what study did and we study things to death in this town and it takes common sense and managerial experience to address these issues. What this report says, okay, closing any stations or relocations should not be considered until adequate traffic upgrades are in place and functioning. The West End station can only be closed following the rerouting of the traffic adjacent to the airport; it doesn't say anything about building a station on Snow Road, ultimately why is that important? So that they can traverse the grade separations in less time; that's what that is all about and nothing else. So in reality

here the fact of the matter is and you heard me say I don't know if this is the right number of firefighters. They may be right in this study of 15; they may be I don't know that. But the standard has been set over the last 12 years there's been somewhere around ten and you've heard me in negotiations with the firefighters I didn't say I didn't think that was the right number. The fact of the matter is that the West End station and the station on Smith Road used to protect the entire city with the same kinds of problems that we have except most of them have been addressed. Now I was hoping not to get into the logistics...getting into the issue of negotiations whatsoever. I hope we can beyond this situation and again with the right number of firefighters; with a centrally location I don't know where any studies but I've seen enough studies; studies to death; Baldwin-Wallace, this one that one and it all depends on what you want to get out of those studies. As the manager of the city as he said for me to change my mind I'm going to have to see compelling evidence that it's going to be better for somebody. I haven't seen it because right now with what you have the response is somewhere between two and ten minutes; it's not five; it's not four; it's not six 90% of the time and that's the standards set by them. I want it 100% of the time so what you're experiencing right now is not the real situation and the reports because I've looked at those reports.

Mr. Patten – Jim, I don't want...

Mayor Coyne – I'm not going to debate 1141 tonight.

Mr. Patten – Jim, I don't want to get into any negotiations issues here.

Mr. Astorino – I'm not looking to debate but he made some accusations against me and the union and I would just like to say that. Even though he said he didn't want...he was the one that brought up the contract negotiations.

Mayor Coyne – No sir you did...

Mr. Astorino – We didn't...I didn't talk about anything about negotiations my concern is for the safety of this community and the people on the West End of town and we're telling you as the fire experts; as the fire professionals that you hire; you hire us. We're telling you it's not safe and what he's doing is (*applause from the audience*) misrepresenting facts and he's the one that dragged contract negotiations because...

Mr. Patten – Let's not get into the contract...

Mr. Astorino – I don't want to get into it but he did and what I'm telling you is we did not do exactly what he said we did.

Mayor Coyne – Okay.

Mr. Astorino – He'll rebut that but that's what he does...

Mayor Coyne – No I won't but I'll produce the evidence; I'll be happy too.

Mr. Patten – Let's stop at that point and let's go to the next person that's up and wants to give your name and address for the record.

Kevin Knaack
5738 Edgepark

Mr. Knaack – You mentioned with the centralized dispatch coordinating things. I guess my question is that knowing that we can live in our neighborhood that the North Olmsted Fire Station on Lorain is actually 1 ½ miles closer than the one on Holland. Would that potentially be included as part of if we need help from that fire station. The Berea station as well is also closer. Would that be part of...whoever is available and whoever is closest if they're available could come.

Mayor Coyne – Right, it could be but for the West End in particular the fire station at the airport is closer and has 50 men.

Mr. Knaack – Okay, I wasn't aware of the one at the airport so when I was looking I didn't see that. Thank you for your time.

Wade Hampton
6499 West Vancey Drive

Mr. Hampton – Just had one question Mayor Coyne. In my research when given this information about the closing of station no. two (2) made me think that my house value would go down. I could not find any information to support that but in my research I did find that my insurance costs may go double.

Mayor Coyne – For fire suppression issues.

Mr. Hampton – Yes sir, the insurance costs that some of us are not living hand-to-mouth but a budget is a word that is now being tossed around

like it's a buzz word. If my insurance costs should go up because of the closing of the fire station which is a beautiful garage. I've been voting there for over 20 years and so to have the loss of that garage and some of our piece of mind goes away with that. Then to look at an insurance bill that could possibly double I'm just wondering if that was taken into consideration when this was decided.

Mayor Coyne – Yes, and again what we tend to concentrate on is EMS because that is the most of what we do. Actually the way we operate is more critical to fire suppression than the EMS because basically firefighters are going to have to make a choice on how they respond to something. So what I'm saying to you is if somebody is telling you that or you're insurance provider...Can you hear me back there.

Audience – No.

Mayor Coyne – I can't sit along time because of my back. At any rate what I'm saying is if your insurance provider is telling you that we would be more than happy to provide information that your status should not change.

Mr. Hampton – He said it would be put into a computer model because of the proximity of the home to the nearest fire station and he wouldn't have anything to do with it. He couldn't change it; it would just be something that I could complain about but the premiums would probably increase.

Mayor Coyne – What I'm saying to you is we can make submittals to your insurance company to explain what the situation is. One could argue fire suppression with NASA which is responder now for us; but would now become a primary responder along with us. I would suggest you might have improved fire service.

Mr. Hampton – Just in a different municipality.

Mayor Coyne – Well, one could argue that NASA and the airport, and everything once was Brook Park. Actually our original fire station was where Cargill Road right now back in the '50's and '60's when were a village. So what I'm saying is if your insurance company tries to pull that with you please let us know and we will get the proper information.

Mr. Hampton – I'll send you a copy of the bill.

Mayor Coyne – Thank you because if you get one I'll be getting one.

Mr. Hampton – You'll be getting it too.

Mayor Coyne – Yes sir.

Mike Von Duhn
6352 Claudia

Mr. Von Duhn – You made a statement on some fact finding information that you found out about response time in '79.

Mayor Coyne – No sir, the standard that Jim and I both talked about was created...

Mr. Von Duhn – Okay, that standard was set up...

Mayor Coyne – In 1979.

Mr. Von Duhn – In '79 that's when all your firefighters were mandatory to live in the city and be able to respond.

Mayor Coyne – Well, in our town yes...

Mr. Von Duhn – In our town, Middleburg Hts. was the same, Berea was the same they were all there and that's what that study was about; because I remember that study.

Mayor Coyne – Right, it wasn't the study the standard was set by gentleman named Eisenburg in 1979 and what I said with you EMS experts said they don't think it implies today. There wasn't the capabilities of AED's response and things like that. There's a whole other gambit and physicians are debating whether that is the standard to apply; it's the common one that is used. Is it relevant some will say yes and some will say and these are not my reports they're physicians reports and professionals, not mine.

Mr. Von Duhn – What I'm saying that what you're quoting on when the people that lived and worked in the city. If they were needed, I drove that ambulance a couple of times, I drove a fire truck a couple of times without having the proper equipment on; because I got called in. Another thing has the city purchased the property yet to centralize this station.

Mayor Coyne – No we have not sir.

Mr. Von Duhn – Okay, I drove from station three (3) all the way to NASA's gate at 3:00 in the morning with lights and siren and it took 13 minutes.

Mayor Coyne – When was that?

Mr. Von Duhn – It was in 19...I retired in 1990 so it had to be before that.

Mayor Coyne – So that was before IX Center Drive was constructed.

Mr. Von Duhn – Right.

Mayor Coyne – Okay thank you.

Nicholas Opal
6325 Grayton Road

Mr. Opal – I travel that road to come to the recreation center and it takes 15 minutes and I drive not to slow. If I have to go around because the trains blocking the tracks it takes another five minutes. So I'm going the same way you have to go from your fire station, exactly the same way everyday. So you're times are going to be 15 to 20 minutes and maybe longer, who knows.

Mayor Coyne – No they're not but go ahead.

Mr. Opal – Alright, how many vehicles are you going to have for a response for emergencies?

Mayor Coyne – What do you mean EMS units?

Mr. Opal – Are you going to have one (1) or two (2)?

Mayor Coyne – Well we're going to have...we actually have three (3) now and will continue to have three (3).

Mr. Opal – All right.

Mayor Coyne – Mr. Opal has one of the most secluded and beautiful homes in Brook Park and he's the last pioneer on the old frontier from

the airport acquisition, so he's a wonderful resident. I go to work there everyday and what I do is 99% of the time I get to work faster if I go IX Center Drive and I go to the Snow Road overpass. I have traveled those things in my vehicle 61/2 to 7 minutes coming all the way down from home and I'm in the center of the west end; or almost at the end of the west end, no light 61/2 minutes, sometimes 7, sometimes 6 and I'm not coming in an emergency vehicle. So the fact is right now until we do something to get right on Fry and Snow and so you know Fry and Snow is not the center of the city where the Ford plant is. So why don't we build a fire station at the Ford plant; because of the railroad tracks. There has been tens of millions of dollars spent on Snow Road why? Our founding fathers made a lot of good decisions in delivering service because for most of my lifetime here we had a lot of money. They made a drastic mistake in locating the fire house which was to become our only and main fire house on Holland Road. Why did they do that back in 1972; because Snow Road, if you all remember long time residents, Snow Road didn't go through it ended at Smith Road. So we're hearing that the center of town is at Holland and Smith and we should buy all those houses and tear the houses down and things like that. There's also a reasonable list; what is the best way to deliver this service now or in the future. It may be that you don't give this Council and me the ability to have more money in which to solve some of these problems. So we have to stay in the fire house location where it is right now unless we get more revenue somehow but even having said that. I still believe to the west end and again there are varied times from two to ten. If all the runs were at two minutes that would be wonderful, okay but the fact of the matter is that they're not now and a better chance of being more consistent and fighting fires and delivering EMS to work out of that central location as we can right now. And then getting the other measures addressed and these are all things when I come to you and ask you to give us this money here's the kinds of things that we're going use it for. The firefighters for years have wanted a new station and I think that maybe Tony D'Amico and I were the only ones that campaigned said you're damned right they and so does our police department. They are a disgrace if you go in them; they were built 40 years ago, alright, so we need a lot of different things but the fact of the matter is this issue, again, has to be addressed from a logistical standpoint. Not how much it costs; not any other prevailing issues around it but how do we deliver services the best, and again the easy way for me is not to confront this issue. I just settled my matters with 1141 but we got to be honest with everybody here; everybody has different issues and its okay for people to have interests that is just theirs; I can't afford that luxury and I won't and I will not usurp my job

as long as I'm here whether you like it or not....I should say whether you approve it or not. Hopefully that we'll be able to respond to you; continue to save lives and most importantly what we failed to do as a community as well is enlighten our people how to best respond when something happens in their home. Don't wait until Grandpa is lying on the couch if he has chest pains call us right away. Who cares maybe its indigestion; who cares about that alright. These are all things that we have to do in enlightening our community where that hasn't been outreach here to help our community. The other good thing about it is our people are living a lot longer; maybe they don't need more emergency response. I don't know I was at North Park the other day a woman was 101 years old unbelievably healthy. Okay, look at the things we're doing; we used to have many, many more heart attacks, why because people smoke. There's all kinds of issues that are surrounding us that you don't want to equate here alright, but the easiest political bull that I can give you is not do anything and pretend that it is okay, when it's not, okay, so I ask you to at least have that consideration. There's nobody up here is to blame; there's nobody else that has taken part in this decision except myself and the safety director who I happened to hire who probably has as much or more experience in firefighting and EMS as does Jim Astorino. Because Jim was his assistant and moved on to be the head of it so I haven't done this just because Tom Coyne wants to do something. I'm clearly not doing it to be popular alright; so at this point in my career popularity doesn't matter I'm doing this and making the right decision as Mayor. So forgive me if I've angered you please have understanding if I've upset but I believe in the long term it is the right thing to do for this city and I ask you to give me that indulgence; because on most decisions I believe that I've made this city in the end benefited and the people benefited here, with most of the decisions that I've made. There's been a few that that maybe not so good but I think most of the major ones we've been successful and don't think that I'm not going to pursue making more improvements in the rail issues and things like that; you know that they take time. So at any rate I think that's my closing statement Mr. Chairman.

Mr. Opal – Okay just hope you don't' have a class action suit from all these people.

Mayor Coyne – Well, we can sir and we'll defend those; we have in the past...

Mr. Opal – Yeah...

Mayor Coyne – And the issues that come, as you know, I'm not afraid of a legal challenge and I think again we'll present the evidence.

Mr. Opal – Neither am I.

Mr. Patten – Thanks Nick, next.

Dennis Miller
6557 Christene

Mr. Miller – You had a seven to ten minute response teams out there on the west end and that was the exception rather than the rule.

Mayor Coyne – No I said between two and ten sir, they vary; I didn't say it was the rule.

Mr. Miller – Well, either way my wife in the last ten years I can't tell you how many times we had to call the paramedics. They have never been more than three to four minutes to my house. Now I live close no doubt but from where they're located unless there's some really exceptional things they're going to be there within four (4) or five (5) minutes; and that 10 minutes, seven (7) minutes, six (6) minutes that is just no so; that's got to be the exception. Thank you.

Mayor Coyne – Is your address 6545 Christene?

Mr. Miller – 6557.

Mayor Coyne – Okay, 6545 Christene was three minutes, okay for a response there in 2013.

Woman in audience – From Holland?

Mayor Coyne – That's from the west end. What I'm saying to you is west end response from Station No. 2 varies from two to ten depending on what the circumstances are. So in your case I'm reading you a run on that street that was three (3) minutes. Here's a run from Station No. 2 to Cedar Point 5.2 minutes I don't know what the conditions were there. Here's one to my street on Woodhill from Station No. 2 6.3, so they vary. What I'm saying to you is that there not all two (2) minutes and they're not all 10 and they're not all six (6) and they're not all five (5), okay; they vary for different reasons is what I'm saying.

Mr. Miller – What I'm saying is the higher times is the exception...

Mayor Coyne – Let me give you another set...

Mr. Miller - you're talking about 90% of the time.

Mayor Coyne – Not necessarily so okay; the fact is we have one here to Lucille 7.7 minutes; so what I'm saying is there are other...If everyone is under the impression that there is a squad sitting there all the time it's not.

Mr. Miller – I understand that, I understand that.

Mayor Coyne – Okay, so it could vary because of different conditions that are going. The one that jumped out at me was why was this thing gone for ten minutes; then I looked at the report and saw. What amazed me as well is the response time from that station to Greystone, that past the station that we have right now. Do you know what that time was? 5.4 minutes so what I'm saying to you is the ability...These are real numbers this is not a study; these are real numbers from our dispatch on how they responded. So what I'm saying to you what I believe my goals are with the AED's will be less than four (4) minutes and I'm saying to you that we could improve on our response time. The standard is five and we can do better than that or eight in some cases and we can do better than that, that's what I'm saying to you.

Mr. Miller – I don't you can do it.

Mayor Coyne – Well I believe I can sir.

Julie Ellis
21662 Forestview Circle

Ms. Ellis – I have the same concerns as many people have spoken about this evening. Knowing Mayor Coyne, living here 30 years that I have, if he's made his mind up we're not going to change it. Am I understanding correctly that this is not open for debate at this point? This is going to happen regardless of anything said here.

Mayor Coyne – If I'm shown some compelling evidence that it will not work then I would change my mind; I haven't seen any. The fact of the matter is you coming up here and voicing your opinion, in my view, is for

me to inform you why I have made this decision, okay its why. It's not based on anything other but delivering you better service.

Ms. Ellis – I understand that so with that in mind my questions then would be. When will the train monitoring system be operational again?

Mayor Coyne – That I have the chief working on right now, I don't know that.

Ms. Ellis –So you don't have an answer to that.

Mayor Coyne – I don't have an answer this evening because I wasn't aware until just this week that they weren't functioning. As a matter of fact when we improved the dispatch unit they were in the fire house and they're not functioning. Why did that happen? I don't know, alright, but the good thing about it is now it wasn't an issue being discussed with the central dispatch unit which we believe will be more effective and there has to be some communication for all of us to respond. Particularly because of the dependence of mutual aid that we need to know when all these tracks are blocked; not just the ones in Brook Park, Ohio. So the good thing about something that's not working right we're made aware of it. Why that was allowed to happen or what happened that we can't change the lights...change the traffic lights and things like that. Those are all things that I assumed were functioning and what do we have to do to get those done; so it's not just a case of logistically moving folks. Okay, its equipment what kind of equipment do we need? How do we house it? What do we do? There are all kinds of logistical issues that are involved that we think we have a handle on most of those issues.

Ms. Ellis – I just feel that I would feel a little bit safer knowing that the monitoring system was at least operational and that was being used.

Mayor Coyne – Okay. Thank you.

Ms. Ellis – When will the new station be built? Does it have to be voted on and approved before being built?

Mayor Coyne – What I will do is propose to you; so you know I've had some people raise the issue why doesn't the Mayor put on a levy for the police and fire department; well indirectly I am. The fact is if I put a levy on for the police and fire to fund them totally and eliminate them from the General Fund it would choke you property tax-wise. Here's what is happened in our town and there are some things so you know that I do

agree with Jim Astorino on, by the way. One of the challenges that has always been from our safety forces is why you spend so much money on recreation and I always say because people demand the service of our town. In a town that's what makes us different and that's why people have families here and I was always pretty comfortable in making that statement. I'm not so comfortable anymore because we don't even have a real good handle of our citizens using the rec center; that's why we've opened it up to Olmsted Falls and other areas. So why is that important? Presently we fund senior services and the Brook Park Recreation Center of almost \$1.9 million dollars a year, that's a hell of a subsidy. So if the citizens say yes we want the rec center and yes we're willing to pay for it that frees out of our General Fund that money that we can use to fund all operations of the city; police, fire and service it frees it up, okay. Because I'm going to sit here and tell you the sub-total of the city income tax which will be my proposal and I have to convince Council that; because my campaign will come to you is we're going to rebuild this city. We're going to rebuild sewers and we're going to be rebuilding roads. Take a ride, not so much on the west end, take a ride about some of these roads in this town. So that money is secured for capital improvement and the safety forces don't have to make the challenges of the budget for us to make a decision. The voters will make that decision for me because if you say you don't want to pay for that it's very simple. We'll find somebody else to utilize the building for something and we'll run recreation programs like other substandard cities do without a community center. We can do that but you're going to tell me and you're going to make that decision, you see. So that's what this is...it's not that the Mayor cares about recreation more than I care about my firefighters and despite my arguments over the years with them, okay. I know how valuable they are and we have differences in benefits and costs and things like that and most of the time we agree a lot more than folks think. So, again, I'm not disparaging the situation here with them. I have a plan and have the resources that I'm going to submit to you but ultimately the only one that can make that particular decision is you. But I will tell you that if we don't have the revenue sources you think things are bad right now they're going to be real bad. I've just battled it out with our folks in all of the unions and I believe we have agreements with all of them hopefully. That occurred this evening that we cannot continue to operate in deficits and this is the first time you've heard me talk about this evening. We can't do it the fact of the matter is that right now even with the agreements and concessions the unions have made and I want to praise them all for making concessions with us. We're in dire straits to operate the beginning of next year with revenues to run the city and I'm not talking about providing response times or number of

firefighters or ambulance. I'm talking about closing the doors okay and thankfully and I want to thank Jim Astorino and the firefighters for working with us to meet this situation this year. Again when the time comes that we are successful many of the things that they have enjoyed and worked hard for some of them they'll get back not all of them but some of them. So that is what is going on as we speak here this evening so, again, much of while the decision to consolidate the operations of the city. I know we're focusing on the west end because we're closing a facility but the ultimate decisions on how we consolidate and we operate are going to be made by you at the ballot box. I want to thank Council for August because it segregates the issue; it's for Brook Park only for Brook Park it's nobody else and it's no other issue. So our citizens come out and say alright Mayor this is okay or it's not okay. So that' when you will get to make your decision on how we afford services to the people and believe me it's probably the most important vote you're going to take since I've lived here.

Ms. Ellis – Mayor, would you consider a compromise with leaving the station open until the new one is built. So that the people whom you can obviously see are so upset can have a little bit more piece of mind.

Mayor Coyne – I thought about that, I've thought about that and the reality is again no one is looking at the totality of delivering safety to the whole town and I think the way we operate is not the best in delivering systems to the whole town right now and that's mostly in fire suppression concerns. Even when I read these reports I'm more concerned about it then I was before of the way we operate. Not of the people who work for us; not of the people who deliver the services but the way we operate. So that's not going to change and again from my standpoint we have always had one fire house in this town and I've always thought that our ability has been depleted to protect the whole city because of the satellites and that's not the firefighters fault; that's elected officials' fault. While Jim and I will disagree on things we'll battle things out he knows I've been consistent in this my whole career. So all I'm saying to you is that right now I believe that it is imperative that we move forward and get this accomplished for the overall protection and better situation for all the people of the city.

Ms. Ellis – So a compromise is out of the question?

Mayor Coyne – Well, it's not a question of compromise. What I'm saying I'm making a management decision and it would be wrong for me to sit up here...I think that my position would seem insincere if I didn't follow

through with it just to say okay, you know, the folks came up here tonight and they're a little bit angry with me; or maybe a lot angry whatever you choose to be and I'm going to retreat to a position that's been taken for too long. So it's not a case of compromising it's a case of what is the best way to operate with what exists today and what will exist in the future. So that's what it is, okay, I'm sorry.

Matthew Harman
6415 Leslie Drive

Mr. Hartman – Mr. Mayor a couple of questions for you, I'm not going to argue with you. If you could tell me what are we going to do with the equipment from the closing fire station.

Mayor Coyne – Okay what are we going to do with it?

Mr. Hartman – i.e. the fire truck and squad.

Mayor Coyne – Okay, number one right now presently we're storing more equipment than we have a need for. There was some suggestion that what we should do is sell some fire trucks and use the money to operate. First of all that money must go to capital improvement and the other thing is we have to make a decision. We were one of the first cities to have an aerial ladder and there's debate whether we should have those or not. I'm not inclined to give that up because I still believe that it's going to be needed. So the answer to your question is what the chief will do is do an inventory. Some we will sell and others we will have presently I think we have three squads with a backup at the station over there and I expect we would maintain that. I would expect that we'll have the capabilities if we have ten people on a shift most of the time the capability of running three squads out of that or responding to a fire. So a short answer to your question is we will inventory; we have stuff now that we should have probably gotten rid of sometime ago and buying equipment that we believe, just like the military is saying, there is equipment that we need and there's some stuff that's out there that will give us better capabilities and I've never shirked in my responsibility in presenting that to Council in giving us what we need. So it's a combination of that things so what we have right now is more than adequate and there's some things that should go and there might be some new things that we entertain buying in the future.

Mr. Hartman – Fantastic, I think it's a great idea that we go out with the old and in with the new. Could you tell me what the city's minimum manning will be for the firefighters in the city.

Mayor Coyne – Okay, presently there's a seven-man minimum manning.

Mr. Hartman – Correct.

Mayor Coyne – And that is set by contract and one of the issues that are being debated is should the city agree to a minimum manning standard. I don't believe that we should go below seven men. I'm not inclined to put in a contract that way I believe it should be the fire chief's call to determine. I'm not going to get into the other parts of our negotiations we have a reasonable cap with our union to bring overtime in align and I thank them for doing that for us. There are other issues with vacations and sick time and I applaud them for walking the mile with us, so it's a combination of things. As I said to you I don't necessarily believe that ten is the right number I don't know. I'm going to find that out and if I believe that it's not we will deal with that situation. In some cases as I said in the beginning there's a lot of things that we don't have control over how many firefighters are there. They get hurt, they get sick and lord knows they're entitled to some time off, so those are the things that really govern. Am I sitting here planning to reduce manpower to therefore affect the minimum manning no I am not but if history has taught us anything in this city. We can't get contractually obligated to a minimum man force. With the same study that I have done and made this decision. I will do the same thing as it relates to manning of our men and I'm not inclined to under-man anything and that means every department in the city not just the fire department all of them.

Mr. Hartman – Absolutely, snow plowing, garbage everything and I completely agree.

Mayor Coyne – You got it.

Mr. Hartman – So what will the minimum manning...what will it take to run the fire department?

Mayor Coyne – I believe is having ten firefighters there everyday, some days we won't.

Mr. Hartman – So we're going to have ten?

Mayor Coyne – If they don't have vacations and they don't get hurt or sick.

Mr. Hartman – If they don't have vacations or sick time...

Mayor Coyne – Right, on one shift I think we may have 11 guys but again that is determined by factors that are not necessarily in my control. Should we go below seven I don't believe we should; but again there might be factors that are not under my control that could occur. Then we have to look at...we have a cap on overtime and there's a provision that we agreed to that how will we determine that. So the answer to your question is do I think we should have less than seven, hopefully not.

Mr. Hartman – That's great I mean seven sounds like a reasonable number to start with. Your words multiple times this evening three squads should have three people.

Mayor Coyne – I said I believe that a squad should have three men on it.

Mr. Hartman – Three men...

Mayor Coyne – Or women.

Mr. Hartman – Or women but you're woman is getting laid-off next week so don't run on that one.

Mayor Coyne – Well sir so you know there's always ongoing discussions and I believe unless something changed. That we reached an agreement today with 1141 that no ones going to get laid-off.

Mr. Hartman – That's fantastic.

Mayor Coyne – Thank you.

Mr. Hartman – Good, I'm glad to see that concessions were made.

Mayor Coyne – On both sides.

Mr. Hartman – On both sides of course.

Mayor Coyne – More them than us and I thank them for that.

Mr. Hartman – If we're going to go down to seven and you would like to see three men squads. You have three squads so you're telling me that they're not all going to be in service at the same time for the city.

Mayor Coyne – No, they may not be or they could be. What's the emergency? Let's say for instance we have a tragedy at the school.

Mr. Hartman – Let's say we have a tragedy at the school.

Mayor Coyne – Well let me answer your question. Let's say hypothetically we do alright. The fact is that we will have everybody go there so it may be all we need are the squads. We don't need any fire apparatus but it might be prudent just to send two squads with three folks and keep somebody back in case we have a fire. That's our dilemma we can't let everybody out but I can't imagine in that instance we wouldn't send everybody out. So the management day to day varies so I think I can answer your question is I have no intention of diminishing the number of folks there. One can argue that some of the things that we've worked out today would have a better chance of us having seven or more on duty then before.

Mr. Hartman – Okay and I'm sure you have looked through the statistics of the fire department to see how many double hits and triple hits the city has gotten per week.

Mayor Coyne – That's exactly why I'm proposing what I'm proposing simultaneously calls, absolutely sir.

Mr. Hartman – Okay.

Mayor Coyne – And they are more than folks realize and as I pointed out to you a squad went over to a central part of the city in about five minutes. So that...what I'm saying is we are capable of delivering these numbers...

Mr. Hartman – Correct...

Mayor Coyne – Over distance.

Mr. Hartman – Good and you also mentioned the west end. Unfortunately I don't live in the west end but not that's a bad neighborhood please don't take that that way.

Mayor Coyne – I lived in your neighborhood most of my life.

Mr. Hartman – You too I did not mean that was a bad neighborhood.

Mayor Coyne – I lived on Sylvia Drive since I was nine years old, so I was there with you.

Mr. Hartman – Okay, you mentioned earlier that we have automatic mutual aid. Is it going to be automatic mutual aid agreements?

Mayor Coyne – We have them now.

Mr. Hartman – We have them now?

Mayor Coyne – We have them now okay.

Mr. Hartman – Okay, so when you have a structure fire in the west end. Can you tell me what fire departments are going to respond to helping us.

Mayor Coyne – Cleveland Fire from the airport right now. As a matter of fact we have mutual aid because we are closing the station they will be a first responder with us and when we get there we will run the fire not them.

Mr. Hartman – You're going to do that for EMS as well?

Mayor Coyne – We're going to do that for EMS as well.

Mr. Hartman – So every EMS call every fire call on the west end Cleveland Hopkins is going to show up to.

Mayor Coyne – That's correct unless they...

Mr. Hartman – And if Cleveland Hopkins is not available then who's coming?

Mayor Coyne – Well, unless they have a plane fire...

Mr. Hartman – Or multiple squad runs and they don't have any squads left.

Mayor Coyne – Correct then our folks will respond but also so you know we respond to issues we respond to issues at the airport with mutual aid for them as well.

Mr. Hartman – Okay.

Mayor Coyne – So what I'm saying to you is today's world is there are more mutual aid issues than not, unfortunately.

Mr. Hartman – Yeah, mutual aid I'm sure as you've seen is being used a lot more often now.

Mayor Coyne – That is correct.

Mr. Hartman – Not just our city but any surrounding city.

Mayor Coyne – That is correct.

Mr. Hartman – And there's been multiple times where we've actually called for mutual aid for the City of Brook Park and were unable to get it from Berea or any of the surrounding communities. We actually had to go two communities cross to get the help we needed.

Mayor Coyne – Right and I think what I've said also was we used to provide more then we had to accept and that's one of the reasons I believe again that centralizing our operations as close as geographically as we possibly can enables us to better respond to the kinds of issues that we have to face. On a given day it may be a fire we respond to and we need your mutual aid for rescue.

Mr. Hartman – Correct.

Mayor Coyne – Or vise-versa, so I'm not disputing.

Mr. Hartman – There may be a time that the city is out on two squad calls and we get a structure fire on the other side of town. It will be really interesting to see what one person's going to be able to do on a fire truck; because if you're at minimum manning and three people on two EMS calls what one guy's going to be able to do in a fire engine.

Mayor Coyne – You're absolutely right I'm not disputing anything you say and because again the standard is 90%. So 10% of the time those things are going to happen. You also know that those things aren't

happen 100% of the time. So I'm not..you're making my argument for me.

Mr. Hartman – Okay, and I have one last question. You've said multiple times through the evening that the NFTA standard 90% of the time and you've also said this evening that's not good enough for you.

Mayor Coyne – That's correct.

Mr. Hartman – That it should be 100% of the time.

Mayor Coyne – I'm going to strive to be 100%...

Mr. Hartman – I think we should always strive to be 100%...

Mayor Coyne – You know that's not achievable.

Mr. Hartman – That is not achievable, you know that is not achievable right?

Mayor Coyne – Correct.

Mr. Hartman – That is not attainable at all.

Mayor Coyne – Correct.

Mr. Hartman – So if we're going to fall below the 90% standards statistically like from today until this time next year. Are you going to reopen the station?

Mayor Coyne – No.

Mr. Hartman – You'll increase the manning so that we have more squads.

Mayor Coyne – Possibly and I said that to you. What I said to you is I'm not sure that this is the right number and what I've said consistently and challenge anybody over 30 years. It's always been centrality of operations and the right number. What is the right number? Okay and as you said almost all departments achieve the right number by mutual aid. I'm saying to you I believe right now unless I'm convinced...If I see that we're not getting close to those numbers or there are problems I will be the first one to come to Council and say we don't have enough firefighters, I'll be the first one to say that. Right now I don't know but I

believe with the...I believe that a lot of runs I've looked at can be improved in response time in reasonable ways and you know that as well, okay. So I'm not disputing what you're saying I'm saying again with the best information available to me and I didn't set those standards and I haven't heard one firefighter tell me that they believe that those standards are the best practices, they haven't told me that and I agree with them. But that is the standard everybody...the only reason I went through that with folks is so they understand when they hear these numbers what they mean and that's why I went through. Our reporting system I'm not happy with as well because it doesn't give folks...This has to be improved and you know what I'm talking about there as well. I should be able if a Councilman calls me up or a citizen I should be able in 45 minutes be able to get them that information, we can't do that.

Mr. Hartman – What information?

Mayor Coyne – No, what I'm saying is different kinds of runs; the reporting system I want to improve as well and we will get that with the central dispatch. Improved reporting systems to help us make those kinds of decisions of course things could change. Let's for instance for whatever reason, as you know too, is location to station is spent primarily on density and activity and there is no more activity in the city then right there across the street on Holland Road, no more. Now we also have on the east end of town two retirement communities over there.

Mr. Hartman – That's correct.

Mayor Coyne – It could be in the future when somebody else is here the whole west end becomes a retirement community somebody buys it. Then you have to look at what the situation is but then again if in that time years from now there's the wherewithal to correct these situations. I wish to God I should have went and got a bond issue in 1982 to build a Snow Road Grade Separation, I made that mistake. Because of all the money that we expended to alleviate that situation in terms of manpower was not the right thing to do. It wasn't the right thing to do and also the other thing is you have to have partners. While they don't make this decision; while they don't make this decision they got to take heat for it. You have to tell the Mayor what to do it's my decision and I'll tell you a story and hopefully we have one more person and move on. There was a Councilman by the name of Rick Johnson and Rick Johnson was a gentleman and the most important thing about it is he could not lie. He wouldn't lie and he couldn't lie so the political expedient thing to do when

I closed the Smith Road station I said Councilman come to the meeting and cut my throat and yell and scream and do whatever you like because your people are going to be mad at me. Don't let them be mad at you because you're a good Councilman and I need your support and he did that in the beginning. Mayor don't do this don't do that and at the end he goes I have one final thing to say. The Mayor is right and I could have killed him, alright. He ran against Jimmy's mom or Jimmy's mom ran against him and he was elected more for telling the people the truth then he was by putting the political spin on it and that's why we've suffered as a town for so long and we had the resources. If you go back to my campaign we had the resources to do more then what was necessary and so, therefore, we never took a view of how we operated; because we go we've got the money and it wasn't right then and it wasn't right now. What is the best way delivering service if I see at anytime there's a better way I'll be the first one to say hey there is a better way that I was mistaken. I don't believe that I am mistaken, I don't believe it. I'll tell you a lot of people don't know one time there was a proposal on this Council by Jim Sullivan, God rest his soul. The issue of the railroad tracks they planned on building a garage on the west side of the Snow Road crossing and on the east side.

Mr. Hartman – We are talking about the fire station, right?

Mayor Coyne – No, I'm talking...listen to what I'm saying this is on Snow Road...

Mr. Hartman – The whole evening is to talk about the fire station, right?

Mayor Coyne – That's correct and what I'm saying to you is I'm giving you history about why we're in this situation that we're in.

Mr. Hartman – Okay.

Mayor Coyne – They had proposed of having that and having a firemen have a tube that could jump from one side to the other. So there's all kinds of things that have been looked at and when I said to you that you have to look in the totality. I'm giving you an explanation of why I made the decision that I've made that's all.

Mr. Hartman – Okay, thank you for your time Mr. Mayor.

Mayor Coyne – Thank you.

Laura Haas
22859 Cedar Point Road

Ms. Haas – Okay, somebody talked about a compromise, you're going to close it, and we all know that you're going to close it but compromise would be you don't have the functionality of a system that tells you that when there is a train. Why aren't you waiting until that's up and running. To me...I'm a bus driver I see these and drive all three cities and I hear the drivers. Train here, train stopped, trains still on there and why we're not doing something with the railroads and fining them to put monies in our coffers is another thing I don't understand. From my understanding oh well they just pay it so we're not going to do anything. Let's just do it then okay...

Mayor Coyne – Right.

Ms. Haas – It doesn't make sense close it but wait until you have that functionality. You said...

Mayor Coyne – What I will do is this if it's not going to be available in a reasonable time I'll reconsider that.

Ms. Haas – What's a reasonable amount of time?

Mayor Coyne – Weeks, months is a reasonable amount of time.

Ms. Haas – So if they can't be up and running in a month the station stays open until they're functioning.

Mayor Coyne – I said I might consider reopening, alright. What I'm saying to you is we're getting into schematics here. The reality is this...

Ms. Haas – No.

Mayor Coyne – Okay, long term no matter what I believe that using the current grade separations that we have that we could supply a service to the west end right now without the telemetry units. This is a call that's made I think standard operating procedures should be; because the police do it right now so you know. They don't go to Sheldon Road; they don't go to Eastland Road; they don't go to Engle Road. They go right down the street to that grade separation and go over Snow and under the underpass on 237 and respond and that's the way they respond.

Ms. Haas – So are they going down Fry or are they going down Engle.

Mayor Coyne – Why would they go down Engle there's railroad tracks there.

Ms. Haas – Well, that's what I'm saying but I was told...

Mayor Coyne – Then you would have to go backwards and come back.

Ms. Haas – Correct.

Mayor Coyne – So they go right down the street...

Ms. Haas – So they're going to take Fry to Snow Road.

Mayor Coyne – That's correct.

Ms. Haas – Okay.

Mayor Coyne – That's correct, so what I'm saying to you is if I believe okay...While I'm not happy that those units aren't functioning I will insist that we have something to deal with that in the central dispatch. Going forward we raised it today and if I believe that situation is going to create anymore time in delivery then I have the option of reopening this station. I don't see that occurring right now but I will look at it.

Ms. Haas – Okay, that's all we can ask. Thank you.

Neal Donnelly
6441 Parkland

Mr. Donnelly – I have the privilege of serving on the fire department since 1970, going back farther then you Mayor.

Mayor Coyne – I started with the city in 1970, the same time Chief. Chief Donnelly great guy.

Mr. Donnelly – Just like we graduated yes we have a lot of history. My thoughts was going back for me when I first made Chief of the Fire Department in 1991. You gave a status of the future of the city and what your goals were and at that time in 1991. You mentioned that we got to move this fire station away from the police station. I wasn't sure why but you wanted fire apparatus located at Snow and Fry.

Mayor Coyne – Correct.

Mr. Donnelly – I retired in 1999 giving you almost those ten years to try and get that accomplished. You know my feelings about Fire Station 2 if you didn't have a relocation of that main fire station to give us direct access both ways. Am I incorrect in this so far?

Mayor Coyne – You're pretty close, go ahead you're doing a pretty good job.

Mr. Donnelly – Okay, also that train system that you're talking about I just want to mention that train system went into effect gosh probably 1984 and it was established only for the east side of town. It was only established for the B&O tracks and was located in the fire station because the fire station was doing their own dispatch.

Mayor Coyne – Correct, that is correct.

Mr. Donnelly – So any similar equipment that you're talking about that was utilized was not utilized for the purpose we're talking about tonight.

Mayor Coyne – Yes, it only applied to the east end.

Mr. Donnelly – Well, I'm not sure because Chief Maund probably has looked into it and if they have that same kind of service we should certainly get it. The fire station issue why wasn't it done in the ten years?

Mayor Coyne – I'll explain to you...

Mr. Donnelly – You explained it.

Mayor Coyne – No I didn't, I'll explain to your specific question Chief with all due respect to you I'll tell you why. Because I couldn't get the money to build a grade separation on Snow Road to eliminate those tracks, let me finish. I'm going to tell you how we got the money. No traffic study that was ever done by NOACA (Northeast Ohio Area Coordinating Agency) would justify spending that money. If you recall at the close when I was leaving as Mayor there was the breakup of Conrail and Norfolk Southern and CSX were battling over things and the guy who wasn't our Congressman then, who became our Congressman,

conveniently rerouted trains through the City of Brook Park which doubled.

Mr. Donnelly – Very familiar with that.

Mayor Coyne – Let me finish, there was a gentleman by the name of Jack Snow who at that time was the head of Norfolk Southern and he was trying to get a group of Mayors to support his position on the Conrail issue and he went to Mayor White of the City of Cleveland. At that time they were having some disagreements about a small thing called the airport and in fact he went to Mayor White that he would make improvements to buy houses that he thought was going to be affected by train noise and he needed his support. The Mayor basically told him where to go and said to him these group of suburban Mayors that you're dealing with I'm going to tell you something right now don't be dealing with them and whatever you do don't have an agreement with Mayor, Tom Coyne, of Brook Park, this is important that you all hear this. So, therefore, Mr. Snow called me up like any of us if they said don't talk to Chief Donnelly about this because, well you know what, I'm going to go to talk to Chief Donnelly because there is some reason he don't want me to. So he called me up and said what will it take you to support the issues with Conrail. I said very simply I need a grade separation to be built on Snow Road in Brook Park. How much does it cost? \$6 million dollars. What else do you need? I need Quiet Zones at intersections because my people are getting killed-killed over noise all night long I need those grade separations. What else do you need? I need money for Berea; I need money for Olmsted Falls and why Middleburg never got involved in it I don't know. So what happened was this, as you know, Steve LaTourette became our Congressman and he was on the Transportation Committee of the Congress. Jack Snow happened to go to college and was a roommate of Senator Shelby of Alabama and to give you a lesson in federalism. Not only did Alabama take a lot of work from NASA Glenn he runs the budget of the United States Congress and Steve LaTourette was summoned to his office and said put \$6 million dollars in the budget for the City of Brook Park and for these Quiet Zones and that's how we got the money, Chief, and absent that we wouldn't of had it and I left office before we even got the money and before the plans were done, I was gone. If I would have been here we wouldn't be talking about this today we would have talked about it in 2002, so that's what happened. There was no money available and I certainly couldn't convince Council at that time of hey listen let's go have a \$6 million dollar issue because Council didn't want to deal with this issue then. There's nothing wrong with that, okay, but those are the realities of what

occurred. So, therefore, now how do we get the money to reconfigure Aerospace Parkway, do you know? There was a demonstration project 90% paid for by the Federal Government because it was a demonstration project they never built and Steve LaTourette said are you going to build this thing. I said absolutely I am we'll contribute the engineering and that's how it got built. So those two issues; one wasn't addressed yet and from my mind, again, you couldn't centralize operations until that road was being built when I was Mayor but that other issue was not. As a matter of fact Council even looked at for some time on whether they were going to accept the money or not so that's why this wasn't done, that's why.

Mr. Donnelly – What do you expect is going to be different now to protect the people on the west side for fire protection and EMS services? Which you know I was a paramedic one of the first in the state.

Mayor Coyne – One of the best.

Mr. Donnelly – I was over at your parents' house twice.

Mayor Coyne – Yeah, you were on Sheldon Road. You might be at my house after tonight I might need you. You might be the only one to come and rescue me.

Mr. Donnelly – That's not my intent.

Mayor Coyne – I know Chief, you're a great person.

Mr. Donnelly – You're going on another theory on your response time. Now you...the last individual or the second last individual you talked about having problems with the forms you have to read and try to figure out.

Mayor Coyne – No, I'm not having problems with it, in looking at and doing the research and things I talked about with the Chief today is how we report these issues to give us more readily available information that's more concise to define what was the nature of the EMS call. Chief, they probably haven't changed it since you've been here it says EMS call...

Mr. Donnelly – No actually I probably wrote that...

Mayor Coyne – Well yeah, right.

Mr. Donnelly – There was a place on the form to let you know where the vehicle was dispatched from.

Mayor Coyne – I have that...

Mr. Donnelly – All your times are going from Station 2, yeah, it's a vehicle from Station 2 but that vehicle is sitting over at Station 3 on a train.

Mayor Coyne – No, it's not Station 3...

Mr. Donnelly – So those times definitely get skewed big time and when you close Station 1 I had issues with people I had to save over at Skate land and the whole Brookpark Road area and not being able to get there in time to do it. You don't really appreciate; it seems like, the aspect of trying to do your absolute best.

Mayor Coyne – Are you saying I don't appreciate it?

Mr. Donnelly – I worked under you for nine years Mayor; you got rid of two safety directors during that time and I worked directly under you which was not a pleasure.

Mayor Coyne – I'm sorry to hear that Chief.

Mr. Donnelly – Well, I know you're sorrier than I was. Anyway I do have issues but my issues are safety for the citizens and you're a response time is number one and hasn't changed from when I became a paramedic. Six minutes to start a house; fire, like Jim said, every minute it doubles in size. We need protection; we had protection and I was comfortable with your statement on the future of your plan to put that station on Snow Road. Centrally located response times I personally looked into those response times and those are definitely going to be affected and people lives are going to be lost. Mayor I hope you don't have to take on the burden of that information that you read on one of your reports that we just didn't get there in time. Please reconsider.

Applause from the audience

Mayor Coyne – Thank you Chief and thank you for your service.

Nora Bricker
6543 West Vancey Drive

Ms. Bricker – I was not here at the beginning, if you could please put on the website the studies that you used to make this decision and any trended analysis data that you used on your run times that you cited. Because who knows where you picked those from...

Mayor Coyne – From our Fire Dispatch, ma'am.

Ms. Bricker – I know but if provide the trend analysis.

Mayor Coyne – I will give you the reports as I...

Ms. Bricker – Let me finish for a second, please provide that on the website so that everybody that is confused or came in late because we had prior obligations; because our kids had things scheduled. Didn't get a four day notice schools are more considerate I guess but if you could provide that on the website so everybody can see what you used for your justification. Then we can all speak intelligently about the matter, okay, that would save, I think, a lot of time.

Mayor Coyne – I appreciate that and I gave you a lot more than four day notification.

Ms. Bricker – I got it Monday I'm sorry Sunday evening.

Mayor Coyne – Well, are you talking about the notice from me or the notice from Council.

Ms. Bricker – When was your notice?

Mayor Coyne – I sent mine out probably seven or eight days ago.

Ms. Bricker – Seven or eight days ago, well alright, I have four kids.

Mayor Coyne – We will get you your information.

Ms. Bricker – If you could provide that on the website that would be wonderful and save everybody a lot of time.

Mayor Coyne – I will do my best, thank you.

Ms. Bricker – Thank you.

Robin Stervagi
21030 North Vancey Drive

Ms. Stervagi – I've listened to everything you had to say and one thing that I read from the Baldwin-Wallace report from '05 and you were incorrect when you said that not just the average age, median age, of the public is going up 9% in ten years. Also the frequency of calls for EMS will go up 9% and you said that's not true.

Mayor Coyne – I didn't say that...

Ms. Stervagi – You said that...

Mayor Coyne – What I said was is that increased calls...the calls from the west end have not increased. I'm not disputing that the population is getting older, that's not the issue. The question I asked as I understood it was the calls have been increasing for the west end; they're not they're up over city-wide. A majority of our calls are to the retirement communities and things like that; are multiple calls to the same address. My question as I understood it last year the calls to the west end they were down and they fluctuated and more than half of them came in totality from NASA and from Acadian Lake Apartments.

Ms. Stervagi – According to the same report the median age is 60 years old and what you think 60 years and over that calls for EMS aren't going to be urgent I don't understand. This is a done deal and you've made your decision.

Mayor Coyne – Correct...

Ms. Stervagi – Back in the fall when you were campaigning to get your job back I called you on the phone because I was really upset about some literature that I received at my home. Where you once again called Mr. Astorino this side of a liar; disingenuous his remarks; I called you to tell you that I didn't think that was very professional. I'm going to leave now but I'm going to leave you with the same thing that you told me on the phone you told me I have wasted enough of my time listening to you and you hung up on me. I wasted enough of my time listening...

Mayor Coyne – No, no...

Ms. Stervagi – It happened I talked to Mr. Astorino’s wife afterwards, directly afterwards...

Mayor Coyne – Okay...

Ms. Stervagi – I’ve listened to you I’ve wasted enough of my time; this is a done deal this is all for nothing.

Mayor Coyne – Okay, first of all let me say this to I will respond...I’ve never not responded to a resident...

Ms. Stervagi – You hung up on me, you responded...

Mayor Coyne – Can I finish now okay and there is a point in a conversation everybody we’ve talked it out. This is the issue and we’ve talked it out and that’s a campaign and the things that I outline and I stand by that. The fact of the matter is I don’t ever recall making the statement to any resident...

Ms. Stervagi – I’ve wasted enough of my time...

Mayor Coyne – Let me finish I don’t ever recall making a statement that I’m wasting my time. I may have said this conversation is going nowhere and there’s nothing to add...

Ms. Stervagi – Nope...

Mayor Coyne – At any rate if that’s the impression that you have its okay with me I can’t change that.

Ms. Stervagi – I find it appalling that you’re willing to risk the safety and welfare of the people on the west end, I really do.

Applause from the audience

Ms. Stervagi – If you are tired of the west end annex us because pretty much that’s what you’ve done. You’ve given us now to NASA and the Hopkins Airport people.

Mr. Patten – I want to take a minute to thank everybody for coming here tonight. I want to clarify a few things here that because I had numerous calls. The Council wasn’t notified and I got a notice on the 26th of April.

We got together Councilman Troyer and I and others talked and we put together this meeting. I've asked the Mayor and Councilman Troyer has asked the Mayor to reconsider and after tonight listening to everybody here and all the phone calls that everybody has taken. To reconsider get the telemetry units up and running and run some tests on this plan with Cleveland being the first responder (*applause from the audience*). Show these residents that it will work and bring the confidence back. I think with everybody here and I know mostly everybody here is that you have legitimate concerns. Anybody that calls for an ambulance or for a fire truck or police car wants it and we understand that. I also understand that there maybe times when you call and those units may not be available I understand that; but I would ask for you to reconsider Mayor and get those telemetry units up and lets run those tests from Cleveland as a first responders and lets show these residents that if it will work I don't think you're going to have an issue. I think that they simply want the confidence that they're going to be able to be responded too. So I'm asking you that I represent you; I'm an elected official here and I'm asking on behalf of these people that took hours out of their evening to come here and are passionate about it. I understand and I'm asking you to reconsider that. Councilman Troyer or any other Member of Council have anything to say before we close this up.

Mr. Troyer – Mr. Chairman, again I would like to thank everybody for being here and I'm very happy of the west end, especially Ward One, and I would to ask the Mayor to reconsider until we get studies done and looked at more carefully. Thank you.

Mr. Patten – Okay, we'll close this session up and adjourn for a few moments. Time: 8.51 p.m.