

**REGULAR COUNCIL MEETING
OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF BROOK PARK, OHIO
TO BE HELD ON TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 22, 2015**

The meeting was called to order by Council President Pro-Tem D'Amico at 8:00 p.m., the clerk called the roll and the following Members of Council answered:

HIGGINS, TROYER, SALVATORE, MENCINI, BURGIO, POWERS, D'AMICO

Also in attendance were Safety Director Byrnes, Service Director Cayet, Mayor Coyne, Law Director Jamison, Recreation Director Fields, Assistant Tax Director Maykut, Engineer Piatak, Firefighter/Paramedic Wright, Police Chief Foster and Police Captain Ditlevson.

Councilman D'Amico excused Councilman Patten from tonight's meeting.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PRECEDING MEETINGS:

REMARKS FROM THE AUDIENCE ON ANY SUBJECT:

Emil Walentik
4162 Blossom Court
Brunswick, OH

Mr. Walentik stated I would like to take a couple of minutes and talk about the consolidation of the dispatchers to the City of Parma and the City of Brook Park is currently attempting to pass an ordinance in regards to a consolidated communication center with the City of Parma. This communication center will consist of the Cities of Parma, Parma Heights, Brooklyn and Brook Park. I realize the cost-factor is the main pushing force and that's with every city. Like the Mayor stated earlier in 2013 the Brook Park dispatch center costs \$560,000 to run; in 2014 it was \$492,000 and 2015 its projected to be \$485,000. The City of Parma's yearly fee will be \$364,000 and there is a 22% increase, I don't know how that gets divided up, but it can be increased yearly. Now there still will be some added costs the exact amount of the costs I don't know but with the dispatch center going into another city you're city still needs a records clerk. Why you would not retain one of them, two of them or however many you need I don't understand that is the job they do. Why you would bring somebody else over for a higher rate of pay and have to train them from the beginning does not make sense to me; not when you have people that are already trained and have done this job for 15 to 27 years. The city said that one of their concerns is taking care of the employees that they currently have. They were advised to take the civil service test in Parma which they did. For the City of Brook Park thankful that they did because what if the dispatchers has chose not to take that test. They did take the test and after taking such test they were informed that they would

Remarks from the audience on any subject: cont.

go over to the City of Parma, they would carry their seniority over and they would not go into Parma as brand new employees. That is not 100% factually correct because when they do go to Parma they will take their sick time over and Parma will look at their years of service in Brook Park in regards to their vacation time that they have in that city. As far as going over to Parma they will go to the bottom of the seniority list for the Parma dispatch. So when it comes to the seniority list for the City of Parma there will be the City of Parma dispatchers, the Brooklyn dispatchers, Parma Heights dispatchers and Brook Park dispatchers will fall in. Those are dispatchers that have 15 to 27 years of service they now fall to the bottom of that dispatch center. As this process went on the dispatchers had pre-employment interviews, polygraphs and drug testing that was all done on their own time. The dispatchers either had to take time off of work or schedule for their day off. I, myself, think if the city was really making an attempt to make this an easy move over you would somehow work that into their work day. The dispatchers did not ask to make this move to Parma the city did and then the dispatchers were forced to do all this on their own time. In regards to this Council is going to have First Reading tonight with a Second Reading on October 6th but the dispatchers are sworn in October 5th; that's the day before. They are going to be sworn in as City of Parma employees so as Council I really don't know how you can come up with how you're going to vote. Because to me to vote yes is meaningless because they're already Parma employees, the day before you vote. If you vote no you're going to have these dispatchers go to Parma and your dispatch center is empty because they are being sworn in the day before. Mr. Walentik continued Members of Council I am not asking you to vote a certain way but I would like for each of you to take the time and make sure that what is happening is best for the city; not for today but for the future. Also does this consolidation treat these employees that have been with the city 15 to 27 years fairly and in a manner which each and every one of you would like to be treated. Lastly, I would like to say that Brook Park dispatch center for the safety forces for this city has been operating seven days a week, 24 hours a day (24/7) with four dispatchers; think about that, 24 hours a day, seven days a week with four people. They've been working anywhere from eight (8) to 16 hours a day and working their days off and come into work sick? Why do they come into work sick because they know if I call in sick the person that is working now is going to be forced to stay and they don't want to do that. They continue to come to work each and everyday for awhile not knowing where they would be working. The Mayor said this process has been going on for 20 months now they finally know that they will be going to the City of Parma and will be placed on the bottom of the seniority list. These four dispatchers are top-notch quality employees that the city will lose and miss. The city should have them here today thanking them for their hard work and their dedication that they have given to the City of Brook Park and their profession as a safety force dispatcher.

Mayor Coyne asked for Council's consideration to speak on this important issue.

Remarks from the audience on any subject: cont.

Mr. D'Amico allowed the Mayor to respond.

Mayor Coyne stated first of all let me say this has been going on before I became Mayor in the City of Brook Park and with all due respect I met with the dispatchers and conveyed to them the gratefulness of our city for what they've done. There's no one challenging their work and we're not going to lose them and in the initial period they will be handling all of our calls until everyone is cross-trained. I know you have a relationship to one and I understand, appreciate and am grateful for the job you've done for the city but a few things here is that. No other of the operations that we looked at, we were battling with every one of them, as to what they were going to do with transferred employees. They were all going to become new employees and what rights did they have? We spoke with their union, you don't represent them you represent another bargaining unit of the safety department, police division in particular. We met with their union and the last meeting we had they were pretty happy about the situation. So again, when you transfer from one government entity to another state law provides of what can be transferred and what cannot be transferred. So in this case, they would have had to gone somewhere and I believe that this is the best situation for us all together and you are right we are going to have to have people in records. Now records aren't all the job of dispatchers it's part of their job. The city hall employee that you referred to, and I know the importance you placed on years of service, was just recently transferred after more than 11 years as doing the records, support scheduling and everything in the detective bureau; so she was there for 11 years. Initially that is what we're going to do is and we are working on that process right now. If someone else is needed, so if it works out with the people we have there right now. We don't know that it will but I don't think we're going to need two more people there or a part-time person there. So the savings will be greater than what was originally forecasted for the city. So I appreciate your passion plea believe me it is very tough to deal with these issues as the Mayor of this city because it's everyday, constantly all the time, asking employees to accept change in every single department. There's only one isolated one and sooner or later that's going to happen there as well. So at any rate I appreciate your plea and your arguments again, we keep talking about this 22% increase it's not true. It's a 22% sharing of the cost that's what it is, that's what it will be and it would have been in any particular situation that we have. You should know better than anyone that we had tried to bring our neighbors along to do this in a different way. So, again, I'm impressed with what's happening in Parma they may be a better fit for us than the others were to begin with; in our review of what is going on. We're not going to be left without people they are going to be sworn in and are going to be part-time for a period of time until they can absorb what is going on and get people trained in their operations at Parma so we will still have that and finally part of the job was is they became matrons. We're in the process of working out with North Royalton, like other cities they all have the same problem, in having female matrons.; as you know North

Remarks from the audience on any subject: cont.

Royalton is equipped to handle female prisoners. So all of the things that you talked about we have dealt with but I understand your passion because it's personal.

Mr. Walentik stated it's part personal and it's part not because as you said I am very involved in another union in the city but the job that the person did before as far as use of the detective bureau has just about nothing to do with the records clerk in the downstairs area. I just find it amazing that you have four, not saying one or two, you have four candidates that have done that job for 15 to 27 years. To me to have four people that have worked for the city for 15 to 27 years and done that job and now somebody comes in and will be paid more that's a slap in the face.

Mayor Coyne interjected I disagree with you that's totally unfair.

Mr. Walentik continued the 22% I said I did not get into that because I said I don't know the breakdown of the 22% so I'm not going to get into that and that's exactly what I said. To me the whole thing is you have this ball rolling and you say that they're going to be hired in as part-time.

That's only because they're going to work here and like I said you have four dispatchers 24 hours a day seven days a week. How much can they work in Parma? Are you going to ask them to work full-time there too? No you are not so they have to be part-time at first; it's impossible for them to work full-time..

Mayor Coyne interjected we said that.

Mr. Walentik continued and they're part-time over there will be training and eventually they will be full-time. So on October 5th they are employees of the City of Parma and the vote on October 6th is almost meaningless; because they will be in Parma.

Tom Troyer
Resident of 18352 Kalvin Drive

Mr. Troyer stated I stand at this podium tonight to talk about the Senior Snow Plow Program but first I want to make one thing perfectly clear. During the budget process I voted against the transfer of \$1 million dollars out of the Sound Insulation Fund and stand by that vote and will vote the same today. The reason I voted against taking \$1 million dollars out of what is essentially a savings account to fund noise reduction projects is because our residents' are still plagued with excessive noise levels from trains and planes; so these funds are needed to help our residents' have more peaceful and quiet neighborhoods. Now to tonight's agenda the legislation introduced by Councilman Salvatore to end our snow plow removal service after 37 years on the books. Yes, the legislation on Third Reading tonight if adopted will expressly repeal the snow removal service for our senior citizens that has existed for 37 years. This is

Remarks from the audience on any subject: cont.

one of the same senior services that Mayor Coyne suspended last year even though we have an ordinance on the books right now requiring this service. Now I don't know why Mr. Salvatore chose to help the Mayor out by introducing this legislation to discontinue the snow removal service; or senior citizens so the Mayor doesn't have to worry about not honoring this law of our fine city. But again this legislation on Third Reading tonight, if adopted, will expressly repeal the snow removal service for senior citizens and change it to a convoluted program that will have all the following issues if passed in present form. Physically disabled are not covered in the snow plowing program, higher cost to the city was \$72,000 we appropriated \$80,000 plus cost to implement, much higher cost to the residents around \$200.00 a year based on information given, higher age required 70 years of age versus the old 65, we don't want more calls for EMS service; there are other things to know about this issue. The Mayor has stated that we need to change the way services are provided but this will eliminate the service by the city and shift the cost to the seniors. We have been told by the Mayor that we don't have the manpower to plow seniors' driveways. Why? Because the Mayor laid them off January 1st. In closing I urge a no vote on Ordinance No. 9972-2015 in the form currently presented tonight.

Rich Sholtis

6499 Wedgewood Drive

Mr. Sholtis stated to Mayor Coyne I am the person that keeps leaving those messages and stated I live in the railroad yard over there and want to know what is the status on the no-blow zone at Route 237 and Sheldon Road. The voice mail you left on June 30th said that you spoke with the Mayor of Berea and he was in agreement that the funds were ready in both Berea and Brook Park just had to get federal approval. So I would like to know where we stand three months down the line.

Mayor Coyne responded I believe that Mr. Dolan has talked to you and is handling that matter and as you know it takes a little while for the federal system to roll; so as soon as we can do it. The Mayor of Rocky River convened a meeting of the Mayors affected by the railroad which I thought was kind of interesting; that we get all their railroad traffic converted to us. It's in the process and I am not sure where it is in the City of Berea but I will have Mr. Dolan call you with an update.

Mr. Sholtis continued this matter is moving it's not wishful thinking?

Mayor Coyne responded no we have the money to do it and the City of Berea indicated that they want to do it as well because they are experiencing some problems but as you know the train traffic is increasing.

Mr. Sholtis stated of course as we talked about the decibel limit it is crazy. I've lived on Wedgewood Drive for 44 years and we all know about the little favor done for the Lakeshore Community now they're living in heaven and we're living down below. I've

Remarks from the audience on any subject: cont.

even spoke with Marcy Kaptur's office and got the run around by telling me to mark down these times that the trains are going through; it's all the time. I'm ashamed to have people at my house with the honking of the horns at 2:30 a.m., 4:20 a.m., that constant honking and the decibel limit is way too high. When I moved in 1972 Amtrak used to go down the tracks at Route 237 and you couldn't hear them. It's ironic thing that every time I complain and I'm sure there are other people complaining too; some of these places have calls to the railroad and they're foxy for about a week or two they shut it down and it's like back in the 1970's or 1980's. How coy they are they start back so easy and then bam let you have it again. Sometime these engineers are playing with the horns because their not supposed to blow the horn and one time they will honk it and the train on the other set of tracks is answering; so they're playing games. Kucinich not only ruined those two streets he ruined the whole area and he should be held accountable. As I said before all of us are being good boys and girls by going to work everyday and you know what was happening behind our back.

Mayor Coyne stated one of the things we tried to do is see if we couldn't get a federal regulation because they always pass the federal regulation onto us; even to Members of Congress. The Mayor of Rocky River proposed that they have an electronic control of the horn is not in control of the engineer and that is something we may have to look at; they rejected that out of hand right away. At any rate we're aware of your matter and as you know we have more quiet zones and grade separations per square miles than any city in the United States. So there isn't anything we can do except get the additional quiet zone that is in process and Brook Park has the monies dedicated to do this and will it probably be the last one the city can do because I don't see them giving us the Eastland Road crossing because of how wide it is; we're working on this and keep calling me I enjoy hearing your comments.

Mr. Sholtis stated I have no animosity towards you and have to find out for my own self and I'm sure Dennis Kucinich was the one when the North Shore boys went down there and did business with them, so to speak. When you found out about it how come you didn't let the residents' know anything or did you fight them; or were all the Mayors just pawns to Dennis Kucinich being a U.S. Congressman.

Mayor Coyne gave a little history by saying there was a gentleman by the name of Jack Snow who was with Norfolk-Southern when Conrail was being broke up and he ended up being Secretary of the Treasurer under President Bush. Mr. Snow was having a discussion with Mayor White and back in those days Mayor White and I had tremendous differences so he went to meet with him to offer some money to address some of the noise problems and the Mayor kindly asked him to leave his office and whatever he did was not talk to me. Jack Snow was the type of guy when someone told him something like that he would do the opposite so what happened is he conveyed a meeting with me and said what do you need and my response was the grade separation at Snow Road. That grade separation if it was built 15 years ago the

Remarks from the audience on any subject: cont.

city would have probably saved \$15 to \$20 million in safety costs to our city. I believe it cost \$6 million dollars that we received along with some of the buried money that did all the quiet zones but I also had Mayors that were partners such as the Mayors of Olmsted Falls and Berea; that's how they got their grade separation as well. While that wasn't enough Steve LaTourette was our Congressman and Senator Shelby from Alabama was Chairman of the Appropriation in the Senate and that's how that was funded but it still wasn't enough for us. Dennis Patten and I went and testified before Congress and the Speaker of the House at that time who represented the Chicago area couldn't understand what we were complaining about but he had not been home since the new rules went into effect and called me and said will you come back and testify my citizens' understand exactly what you're talking about. You know what they did they moved the traffic from Lakewood and the North Shore to Brook Park and now the Mayor of Rocky River convenes us because they're having problems with the horns and grade separations.

Mr. Sholtis commented they only have the one track.

Mayor Coyne continued they have numerous neighborhoods that cause traffic problems and are looking at parallel and marginal roads and all kinds of things; so they're getting some of it but they're not getting the traffic. The good thing about that is there are more and more containers that are on the trains and eventually when we get an out build and reuse of the Ford property that will be a draw for people who want to come here. For instance when IKEA was looking at their warehousing operations the city had discussions with them but weren't successful but that was one of the things that attracted them to Brook Park are those train sites and the capabilities we have for trains. This is something that could be added but in the meantime the remedy to your problem is a quiet zone and we think and I don't know why when more and more technology is being used. That we can't equip the trains with electronic sounding devices, like the GE television commercials, that are controlled so that the human doesn't have to lay on the horn. Because that seems to be the biggest problem unless and until we can get more grade separations but I don't see that in the near future.

Jan Powers

16110 Harrison Drive

Mrs. Powers stated from the podium the item that was an addendum to the Caucus meeting tonight and Council withdrew from the meeting. I went over that piece of legislation and last week the Mayor said that I always vote no. Looking over that and he didn't say I vote no some of the time or that I vote no most of the time he said I vote no every time. In looking over that piece of legislation I counted every voting situation and 62 times I voted yes and 43 times I voted no; so in other words 60% of the time I vote yes and just wanted to clear up that little misnomer. Mrs. Powers continued the gentleman who spoke on dispatch I don't know if the rest of you noticed

Remarks from the audience on any subject: cont.

just how many times the Mayor and this gentleman disagreed on their facts. The Mayor started when I asked him about the number of dispatchers he went back to 2013 and started quoting those figures. The Mayor laid-off employees and said that we still have five dispatchers and this gentleman said there are four. The other thing that he said that was very important to me was that the dispatchers lose their seniority. If they lose their seniority and go back to zero that means they're going to lose a lot of money because they accumulated money over all those years. If you start today at x-amount of dollars and are there for 15 or 20 years in that timeframe you accumulate more money per hour; so they have a different set of facts. He said that we are working our people here eight (8) to 16 hours I think there is a state of maybe a federal law that says you cannot work people more than 12 hours in one stretch; I guess that's a OSHA (Occupational Safety and Health Administration) regulation.

REPORTS FROM STANDING COMMITTEES:**Aviation & Environmental Committee – Chairman, Higgins**

Mr. Higgins stated no report this evening.

Finance Committee – Chairman, D'Amico

Mr. D'Amico stated the Board of Control met earlier this evening and approved seven items.

Legislative Committee – Chairman, Troyer

Mr. Troyer stated the Legislative committee has at least one item on tonight's agenda.

Parks & Recreation Committee – Chairman, Burgio

Mr. Burgio stated a proclamation ceremony was held at the center last Saturday, September 19th, for all the winning baseball teams.

Planning Committee – Chairman, Mencini

Mr. Mencini stated I gave my report at last week's meeting and at the Caucus meeting held earlier Council approved two conditional use permits for CUI Landscaping Services and Earl's Collision Center. The Planning Committee meeting will be on Monday, October 5th at 7:15 p.m.

Safety Committee – Chairman, Salvatore

Mr. Salvatore stated the Safety Committee has one item on the agenda honoring the city's police officers.

Service Committee – Chairwoman, Powers

Mrs. Powers commended Service Director Cayet for a job well done and who has been very responsive to all my requests and this past week there was a dangerous problem at Elm and Smith two days later the site was cleaned up.

Board of Zoning Appeals – Chairman, D'Amico

Mr. D'Amico stated the next meeting will be held on October 5th providing applications are made.

REPORTS FROM SPECIAL COMMITTEES:**Southwest General Health Center – Trustee, Salvatore**

Mr. Salvatore stated no report this evening.

Berea Board of Education – Representative, Mencini

Mr. Mencini stated the board had meetings on September 14th and 21st and Brook Park Memorial will be receiving a new steam boiler replacement at a \$400,000 credit cost which will be \$78,000. Cunningham Paving was awarded improvements for the year 2015 for a cost of \$148 million dollars. The district approved insurance through Liberty Mutual for a cost of \$190,000 and total payments to vendors for month of June was approved at \$1,300,000. Mr. Mencini will be meeting with the Superintendent on October 2nd to ask questions about Brookview and obtaining the bands for Home Days celebration.

Motion by Mr. Salvatore, supported by Mr. Troyer, to go out of the Regular Order of Business to letter N numbers 2 and 3. Members of Council voted AYE. The motion carried.

INTRODUCTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND ORDINANCES: (SECOND READING):

2. RESOLUTION NO. 18-2015 DESIGNATING NOVEMBER 7, 2015 AS THE ANNUAL APPRECIATION DAY FOR POLICE OFFICERS IN THE CITY OF BROOK PARK AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY Introduced by Councilman Salvatore and Council Members Troyer, Mencini, Powers, Higgins, Burgio, D'Amico and Council

President

Patten

Motion by Mr. Salvatore, supported by Mr. Troyer, to suspend.

ROLL CALL: AYES: Salvatore, Troyer, Higgins, D'Amico, Powers, Burgio, Mencini

NAYS: None. The motion carried.

Motion by Mr. Salvatore, supported by Mr. Mencini, to adopt.

ROLL CALL: AYES: Salvatore, Mencini, Burgio, Powers, D'Amico, Troyer, Higgins

NAYS: None. Res. No. 18-2015, has passed under Suspension of the Rules. Adopted.

3. RESOLUTION NO. 19-2015, HONORING THE BEREA-MIDPARK HIGH SCHOOL'S ACADEMIC CHALLENGE TEAM ON WINNING THE NEWS CHANNEL 5 SEASON CHAMPIONSHIP AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY Introduced by Councilman Salvatore and Council Members Troyer, Mencini, Powers, Higgins, Burgio,

D'Amico

Motion by Mr. Troyer, supported by Mr. Burgio, to suspend.

ROLL CALL: AYES: Troyer, Burgio, Mencini, Powers, D'Amico, Higgins, Salvatore

NAYS: None. The motion carried.

Introduction of Resolutions and Ordinances: (Second Reading): cont.

Motion by Mr. Salvatore, supported by Mr. Troyer, to adopt.

ROLL CALL: AYES: Salvatore, Troyer, Higgins, D'Amico, Powers, Burgio, Mencini

NAYS: None. Res. No. 19-2015, has passed under Suspension of the Rules. Adopted.

Mr. Salvatore presented the Resolution to Police Chief Foster and Captain Ditlevson and stated just want to take a moment to say how proud I am of our Brook Park Police Department and have been very proud for the many years I've been around. They are out there helping our residents' and do a great, great job and this is a good opportunity to take a moment and make this presentation that will be held as an annual event on November 7th police officers will be recognized and residents' should do everything they can to show their appreciation for the job that they do especially in these rough times that we are dealing with. In most cases a lot of cities are having a tremendous problem in this area Brook Park has first-class police officers. Mr. Salvatore continued I picked November 7th because I want it to be non-political so that it will be after any election and is also my birthday.

Chief Foster personally thanked Councilman Salvatore and all Members of City Council individually for recognizing our police department and thanked for the support received from the Mayor's office and all the directors of the city. All this support does mean a lot and the Captain and I certainly will accept this resolution on behalf of the quality of police officers, supervisors, jailers, dispatchers, auxiliary police officers and other staff of the police department; we are blessed to have quality personnel for the City of Brook Park and that quality the Captain and I are committed to continue and make it grow. One example shown today is as we all know there are drug problems in the city and throughout the country with heroin being in epidemic proportions right now. Our police department was the first department in Cuyahoga County to carry the drug Narcan which basically treats a heroin overdose. Today the department received a call for a drug overdose, a female was overdosing on heroin, Sgt. Powers was the first on scene to respond, diagnosed that the female was overdosing and administered the drug for the first time in our department history. The female was revived within 30 seconds and the city's fire department transported her to the hospital and she is expected to make a full recover. We appreciate the support and most of all would like to thank the community for the support that is provided to us.

Mr. D'Amico presented the resolution to Academic Challenge coach, Jim Stevens, and congratulated him and the Academic Challenge team for the outstanding academics in their field; the team members are away at college. This is just one more thing with the Berea-Midpark high schools joining together with great academics sports wise.

Mr. Stevens thanked City Council for all of their support during the past season it is much appreciated. The boys are now proud alumni of Berea-Midpark High School and attending Georgetown, the University of Chicago and Case-Western Reserve. The

Introduction of Resolutions and Ordinances: (Second Reading) cont.

\$4,000 grant received from Westfield Insurance for winning the championship is going to set up an electronic library which is a first-time program; with many other schools in the area starting this type of program. This received money will get the program started and I expect will go on for a long time in the future.

Mr. Salvatore commented when researching this resolution it is correct that there was one member from each community of the school district that became the three wise men.

Mr. Stevens concurred and stated Berea, Brook Park and Middleburg Hts. with students that started as freshmen at Berea and Midpark High Schools and when the schools joined together we had a team that won the championship.

Mr. Salvatore stated is it true that the young man from Brook Park gave most of the right answers.

Mr. Stevens responded yes, so go Brook Park.

Motion by Mr. Salvatore, supported by Mr. Mencini, to go back to the Regular Order of Business. Members of Council voted AYE. The motion carried.

REPORTS FROM BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS:
-----**INTRODUCTION OF RESOLUTIONS OF COMMENDATION:**
-----**REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE MAYOR:**

Mayor Coyne thanked Councilman D'Amico for allowing him to address Mr. Walentik about an important subject. Mayor Coyne continued that we had a Member of Council go down to the microphone and state that Mr. Walentik had different figures from and I think the record will show and the minutes will show that he had exactly the same figures. The real equation that needs to be addressed or used in calculating is 2013 because that's what is really needed to fully dispatch our city; so again I stand by those numbers and he quoted them as well. I think we should know that no one is disparaging the record of the dispatchers, as a matter of fact, his wife is a dispatcher and I am sure she would have like to have been considered in the records center for full-time and we looked at that and there may be in occasion in the future; no one knows what to expect or what the toll of the record work is going to be. As a result of layoffs and reduction in rank that we went through last year we had a young lady who bumped into the detective bureau and has been over at the police station for over a year and is doing payroll and all the work

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

necessary for the detective bureau; this employee had no experience whatsoever and has not missed a beat. The city hall employee Mr. Walentik spoke about was over at that same job for 11 years so I find it hard to believe that she will not be able to simulate in that new position; and both of these employees will become certified so that they can use the CRIS (Current Research Information System) which was a recommendation a long time ago. Realistically it will cost us nothing when we transfer for this so-called backup duties that are necessary. In the event in the future if it is shown that the two of them can't handle being cross-trained then we might have to look at a part-time or full-time person, we don't know that yet. The police department doesn't know it, we don't know it yet because this is a new experience for everybody. I think our city to not go forward into the 21st century in communications would be a tragic mistake at this time. We painstakingly all of these employees, every single one of them, who are valued without issue. We talked with their unions and as far as I know they were pleased with what we did with all their longevity, benefits and vacation time will be accrued into the City of Parma; everyone coming over there are all new employees with the exception of the existing Parma dispatchers will be new employees for the City of Parma. So they will technically all be starting for the most part on an even keel and no one will be threat, I think, to an adverse condition; I think long-term this will be a better solution for them. Also, we will address it this evening with the senior snow plowing and my colleague up here, Mr. Troyer, I always enjoy his explanation of finances because they couldn't be further from correct. You passed a budget with the layoff of 17 people; well I can't say you passed it because I'm not sure you voted for it but the budget was passed with the reduction of 17 people across the board in the city. Some of them have come back but in the service department they have not come back. So we did not have a senior snow plow service last year in the city. Over the last year Councilman Salvatore, Councilman Higgins, in particular, but generally all Members of Council had to find a way to help our seniors that are most in need in getting some relief on this issue. Last year the seniors had to do it themselves and the good thing about it is they gained an appreciation for what it costs. I know all of you have been out walking and all the candidates in the audience are knocking on peoples doors saying we're going to restore senior services, we're going to restore the recreation center. We're going to do all those things and there is nobody sitting up here that doesn't want to do them. The question is how are you going to pay for them? The answer to that question is we are at the right number of employees of this city and can deliver the service in a different way, yes by a private concern. There is not a senior that I have talked to when we put the issue of the tax ballot for this very program there are people sitting up here telling voters not to vote for it; you're the ones that are going to have to answer to them. Because it averages about \$115.00 a person and there is not one of them, even when they cussed at me when I walked to the door, that wouldn't write a check to the city today for that very amount to do that service. So in looking at this originally proposed way back when was to provide assistance to seniors who could not afford to pay for it; that's what the original intent was. To provide that to folks that

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: cont.

couldn't do it and the program is the same. It was expanded for disabled and I'm sure the next thing I'm going to read is the Mayor punishing disabled people. It has been the greatest nightmare for us to enforce in the city over the last 30 years of who is disabled, who is not and who gets a doctor's excuse or how old should they be. You will have drivers who will come back to the department saying I pulled up there and there are six people and there are able-bodied people in the home as well; it is a nightmare to enforce. So the Councilmen, in particular, who worked with me on this and the ones that talked to me about this all felt that we had to provide the greatest assistance to the most people that we probably could. We're going to have to find some other way to address those issues for others but the fact of the matter is that most of the folks that have been on the pre-existing list for snow removal are over 70 years old. We went through to try and fashion this who should receive assistance based on what they earned and provided for that in the legislation. We also provided in the legislation those that do not qualify can take advantage of the contractor(s) price and most of them have always come down \$30.00 and I'm still talking with them. So if Council will consider, again this is a new initiative because times are different than when that legislation was passed so many years ago. We could provide a service to those who need it for, I think, a very competitive cost even with substantial assistance and we'll see where it goes from there. If we can expand it or change it we can do that, Council always has that authority. So a lot of work went into this and I think all the legitimate considerations have been addressed and we hope that Council would enact the legislation this evening. Mayor Coyne continued I hope in the very near future we've had some preliminary discussions with two of the unions already and even though we just passed the contracts for this year we are onto next year because it is quickly becoming November. So we will be starting that and then sitting down with Council to let them know what we think the city has to extract from these contracts and give the general idea of what the employees are asking as well. There will be another town hall meeting and right now we're looking at the second week in October to talk about housing issues which I'm sure all of you are running into. The county grant and how the law and building departments are going to deal with over 300 delinquent or vacant homes located in the city. I think this is timely because all of you are sending memos about your concern on these issues and I think it is a good issue for us to have a discussion on.

Council Remarks:

Mr. Mencini stated to the gentleman who spoke on the train horns and in walking the Middlebrook-Michael area those people get train horns over there. I agree with a lot of what he said but on that everybody gets train horn noise. There was a lot of talk this evening about the layoffs and I come from the service department as well as Mr. Patten, Mr. Higgins and Mr. Cayet. The department has had a lot of layoffs as well as the Recreation Center and no one wanted these layoffs more than me. On that as while walking the streets I'm sending a lot of memos on the streets, curbs, catch-

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: (Council Remarks) cont.

basins and also in my ward I have City Hall, Council Chambers and the Recreation Center. So there is a lot ahead of us such as finances and what you're proposing, what we are looking at here and possibly what will be looked at next year to start looking towards the future. We have to get a lot of these things in order and like I stated before what kind of city do you want? There are going to be some big decisions coming up very quickly that will have to be made and to the Mayor what kind of decisions are we going to be looking at to get some of the problems corrected?

Mayor Coyne responded I think, Councilman, everyone up here is aware of the situation and it's political season and the fact is this city needs more revenue anyway you cut it. I think that we've done a Yeomen's job in getting the cost of delivering service from the operating side and as long as we continue to do this and have good negotiations with our employees...They are going to be seeking a pay raise and quite frankly I think they deserve it and having said that what form does it take and what issues have to be addressed. So on the operating side I think we've done all that we can, there isn't much more that can be done, but the fact of the matter is the streets, the curbs, the catch-basins, the infrastructure of the city without additional revenue you will not be able to address those problems. I don't care who tells you when they come to the door they'll tell you economic development and as you know sitting on the Planning Committee and Mr. D'Amico sitting on the zoning board. There were five new businesses coming to Brook Park last Monday night with nine or ten employees and the new workers at Ford Motor Company generates for the city 200 new workers at \$48,000 a year; that doesn't pay the cost of a clerk.

Mr. Mencini commented doesn't fix my streets.

Mayor Coyne continued it doesn't so the reality is and again it's your issue to discuss when we hit the ground running with whoever is sitting up here in January; the responsibility is not going to change and I will debate this with anybody, anyplace, anywhere that can show me where we have the necessary funds to rebuild this community's infrastructure, I'll be happy to do that. That's the case that is going to be taken to the people and when everybody realizes that and wants to confront the voters with that, I believe, we will be successful but that's what you are going to be facing and we've done everything that we could. There are voices out there that just want to tell people you don't have to do this. I have Finance Director Cingle preparing a narrative for everybody today showing that most of our people won't incur one additional cent. Retirement benefits are not taxed, we will give 100% credit and doing a true comparative cost of what it costs to live in this as opposed to other cities. Mr. Higgins is the service director for the City of Parma just recently closed their outside pools and an assessment had to be made for people to pick up the residents' rubbish; we've never proposed that. I proposed something different that wasn't successful but this is the kind of discussions we're going to have, no matter who is

Reports and Communications from the Mayor: (Council Remarks) cont.

sitting here, and therefore we will be ready to make a presentation to you before January because we are working on this information. It's one of the things we hope to address in the upcoming Town Hall meeting as well and like you said what kind of city do you want to live in, how much are you willing to pay. We could show that they're paying substantially less than the cities around us for a quality of service that I don't think beats ours to be very candid.

Mr. Salvatore stated to Mayor Coyne how close are you to finalizing the negotiations for the senior plowing with the contractors?

Mayor Coyne responded there is going to be four now, another one is going to be licensed, three of them have submitted and will probably have another one by the end of the week then I will bring the four of them in. Law Director Jamison researched this process with the City of Seven Hills and this program has worked well for them for many years. Currently, two of the contractors have come down on their pricing so information will be coming soon.

Mr. Salvatore clarified within a couple of weeks?

Mayor Coyne responded hopefully by the end of the week having what the cost is going to be and at the latest next week.

Mr. Salvatore stated all these companies will comply with the city's ordinance providing that they have to...

Mayor Coyne responded they won't be considered unless they have filed under the ordinance that Council passed last year.

**REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM OTHER DEPARTMENTS,
COMMISSIONS, PUBLIC OFFICIALS:****Engineer Piatak**

Mr. Piatak reported with the Smith Road Sewer Project – Phase III the contractor is currently wrapping up landscaping and will be scheduling to pave on Monday so this project is winding down. With the Sylvia-Leslie Drive Project the contractor made the first mainline concrete pour today that was a success; the pavement looks good. The contractor will be following up on Thursday with some under drain installation and hope to start removing the other lane of pavement early next week.

Mr. Mencini stated does the traffic light at West 130th Street and Brookpark Road belong to the City of Brook Park and who maintains this light?

Reports and Communications from other departments, commissions, public officials: cont.

Engineer Piatak: cont.

Mr. Piatak responded I believe that is a shared light with the Cities of Brook Park, Parma and Cleveland and will have to look into that.

Mr. Mencini asked how often is the light assessed for traffic and timing of the lights.

Mr. Piatak responded I'm not sure that may be a question to the police department but can look into it and get back to you.

Mr. Burgio commented that light has always belonged to the City of Cleveland because I have looked into that light quite a few times. Also, traffic analysis are done every once in a while but I'm not sure how often. If it's not working properly that could be a loop detector or something like that because they do miss at times.

Mr. Mencini clarified it's not working for the flow of traffic.

Mr. Burgio stated it depends on what hour because there are different time settings for different times of the day; there are different timings for morning and evening rush hour.

Mr. Troyer stated is the Sylvia-Leslie Drive Project on schedule.

Mr. Piatak responded I anticipate it completing on time.

Service Director Cayet

Mr. Cayet reported that Route 237 is finishing up with the pavement and punch list items. There is a short-term inconvenience because crews have been doing grinding and patching and trying to get the speed bumps off the road on Holland Road between Michael Drive and Middlebrook Blvd. by the railroad tracks. This is a very tight intersection and a lot of traffic travels east to west direction; this will be going on for a few more days.

Mr. Mencini stated thank you from residents for the railroad project and have informed me that the crews are going a good job. I also appreciate the callbacks on the memo updates.

Mr. Troyer thanked Service Director Cayet for repair of the sinkhole on Burton Drive; that was a dangerous situation. Not sure if it's completed yet but I know the cement was put in.

Reports and Communications from other departments, commissions, public officials: cont.**Safety Director Byrnes**

Mr. Byrnes stated I want to add a little bit to the transitional story about the dispatching. First off there was an issue whether there were four or five dispatchers the fact is as of today in the City of Brook Park there are five full-time dispatchers. The one dispatcher is burning off vacation time and will start at the end of September in the City of Lakewood; she is still a city employee and still receiving pay, so that's the mystery between the fourth and fifth dispatcher. Also, when we did this deal with the City of Parma we took the time to verify that if you worked 25 years for the City of Brook Park your pay was equated to the 25-year level of the City of Parma contract; same with longevity and same with other benefits. I went through and compared other benefits including the cost of health care individually for all five people. All five people did make out a little bit financially, some made out more than others, but nobody lost any money and all of them picked up a few \$100 dollars, this was done across the board. When we met with the union the first thing the union official said after the Mayor and I presented this was I don't have any problem recommending this. The only problem we can't solve is the fact where they sit in seniority with the existing City of Parma employees; that's why they are being sworn in early in order to protect their position on this test that they took. They will be ahead of the part-timers and they are being sworn in with other employees and where they fit under a roster that is what their assignment will be. For the initial period they are going to be dispatching on the Brook Park station so I'm sure that the employees who work days will continue to do so and etc. until everybody is cross-trained which could take up to eight or nine months; this is actually the best deal for them, I believe, that we could have come up with. We did keep in mind the entire time I've been here of where those people are, the type of work they do and try to make them as whole as possible and that was accomplished. Also I want to take an opportunity to thank Councilman Salvatore and all Council Members for introducing the legislation about the police department. As Council knows not sure if the people of Brook Park know I have a background in firefighting. Since I came here I got to know the police who work very hard and are very unselfish in their work and put extra duty in. The police have made a lot of contract concessions to help with this year of making ends meet; they are a hard working department from the police chief down to the newest patrolman on the force. The police officers do an excellent job and I very much appreciate that recognition.

Law Director Jamison

Mr. Jamison stated no report this evening.

Recreation Director Fields

Mrs. Fields stated the department is up to 348 new members that have registered at the Recreation center in a total of 17 days so we are increasing.

Mr. Mencini stated is it a good intake of Brook Park residents'?

Reports and Communications from other departments, commissions, public officials: cont.

Recreation Director Fields: cont.

Mrs. Fields responded yes, and there have been an influx of Parma Hts. residents' coming over taking advantage of the discount, but the majority are past members that have decided to come back because they cannot beat the price.

Assistant Tax Director Maykut

Mrs. Maykut stated no report this evening.

OTHER COMMUNICATIONS, PETITIONS, AND VERBAL APPROVAL: (INTRODUCTION OF NEW LEGISLATION):

Other Communications:

1. CORRESPONDENCE FROM RESIDENT

The clerk read the correspondence from a Brook Park resident in its entirety that is available for review in the Council office.

2. CORRESPONDENCE FROM RESIDENT

The clerk read the correspondence from a Brook Park resident in its entirety that is available for review in the Council office.

New Legislation:

1. A Resolution requesting the Mayor to fill the swimming pool inside the John A. Poloyne with water and declaring an emergency. Introduced by Councilwoman Powers. **Placed in Recreation Committee**

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS (APPOINTMENTS, CONFIRMATIONS)

INTRODUCTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND ORDINANCES: (FIRST READING):

1. ORDINANCE NO. 9977-2015, AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH THE CITY OF PARMA TO ESTABLISH A CONSOLIDATED COMMUNICATIONS CENTER IN THE CITY OF PARMA AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY Introduced by Mayor Coyne

Mr. D'Amico stated Ordinance No. 9977-2015 has had its First Reading.

2. ORDINANCE NO. 9978-2015, AMENDING ORDINANCE NO. 9957-2015, THE APPROPRIATION ORDINANCE FOR THE CITY OF BROOK PARK AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY Introduced by Mayor Coyne

Introduction of Resolutions and Ordinances: (First Reading): cont.

Mr. D'Amico stated Ordinance No. 9978-2015 has had its First Reading.

3. ORDINANCE NO. 9979-2015 AUTHORIZING THE FINANCE DIRECTOR TO TRANSFER FUNDS TO THE SPECIFIED ACCOUNT Introduced by Mayor Coyne

Mr. D'Amico stated that Ordinance No. 9979-2015 has had its First Reading.

4. ORDINANCE NO. 9980-2015, AUTHORIZING THE CONSULTING ENGINEER TO PREPARE PLANS AND SPECIFICATIONS FOR THE SNOW ROAD RESURFACING PROJECT (PID 100238) AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY Introduced by Mayor Coyne

Mr. D'Amico stated Ordinance No. 9980-2015 has had its First Reading.

5. RESOLUTION NO. 21-2015, URGING ALL RESIDENTS TO SHOP AND DINE IN THE CITY OF BROOK PARK DURING 'SHOP AND DINE IN BROOK PARK WEEK', DECEMBER 7, 2015 THROUGH DECEMBER 13, 2015 AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY Introduced by Councilman Mencini and Council Members Troyer, Powers, Higgins, Burgio, D'Amico, Salvatore and Council President Patten

Mr. Troyer stated there was discussion about co-sponsors but a vote was never taken, at this time I would like to take a vote for co-sponsors on this legislation.

Mr. Mencini asked for co-sponsors on the legislation.

Mr. D'Amico stated Resolution No. 21-2015 has had its First Reading.

INTRODUCTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND ORDINANCES: (SECOND READING):

1. ORDINANCE NO. 9973-2015 AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT FOR THE SALE OF PERMANENT PARCEL NO. 344-03-055 AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY Introduced by Mayor Coyne

Mr. D'Amico stated Ordinance No. 9973-2015 has had its First Reading.

2. RESOLUTION NO. 18-2015 DESIGNATING NOVEMBER 7, 2015 AS THE ANNUAL APPRECIATION DAY FOR POLICE OFFICERS IN THE CITY OF BROOK PARK AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY Introduced by Councilman Salvatore and Council Members Troyer, Mencini, Powers, Higgins, Burgio, D'Amico and Council President Patten

Note: Moved by motion to the beginning of the meeting

Introduction of Resolutions and Ordinances: (Second Reading): cont.

3. RESOLUTION NO. 19-2015, HONORING THE BEREA-MIDPARK HIGH SCHOOL'S ACADEMIC CHALLENGE TEAM ON WINNING THE NEWS CHANNEL 5 SEASON CHAMPIONSHIP AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY Introduced by Councilman Salvatore and Council Members Troyer, Mencini, Powers, Higgins, Burgio, D'Amico and Council President Patten

Note: Moved by motion to the beginning of the meeting.

THIRD READING OF RESOLUTIONS AND ORDINANCES:

1. ORDINANCE NO. 9972-2015, AMENDING CHAPTER 937 OF THE BROOK PARK CODIFIED ORDINANCES ENTITLED 'SENIOR CITIZENS AND PHYSICALLY DISABLED SERVICES' AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY Introduced by Mayor Coyne and Councilman Salvatore and Council Members Mencini, Higgins, Burgio, D'Amico and Council President Patten

Mr. Salvatore stated before moving forward on this and take a vote. I would like to address some comments that were made by Councilman Troyer at the podium under audience participation. I know that you refer to me as the sponsor of this legislation and I want to thank you for labeling me the most powerful man up here; I'm surprised I can get this passed all by myself. Unlike you who doesn't take any time to talk to anybody when you want to get something done, you just come up here and want to criticize and condemn everyone.

Mr. Troyer – Point of Order, Mr. Chairman.

Mr. Salvatore – I have a point, I have the right and I have the floor Mr. Chairman and I'm not going to relinquish it.

Mr. D'Amico – Go ahead Mr. Salvatore, you will have a chance to speak Mr. Troyer.

Mr. Salvatore - He spoke at the podium and I'm not going to do that childish act.

Mrs. Powers – Point of Order.

Mr. Salvatore – This is city business and I'm going.

Mr. Troyer – Point of Order.

Mrs. Powers – Point of Order

Mr. Salvatore – There is no point.

Mr. Troyer – It is against Council Rules to...

Third Reading of Resolutions and Ordinances: cont.

Mrs. Powers – This is not...

Mr. D'Amico – Order Council. At this point in time...

Mr. Salvatore – This is city business Mr. Chairman...

Mr. D'Amico – Mr. Salvatore has the floor Mr. Troyer you spoke under audience participation and so has Mrs. Powers. You both had Council seats up here and relinquished that and went under audience participation; you could have talked up here at that time. Mr. Salvatore continue.

Mr. Salvatore – Thank you Mr. Chairman. You're alluding to the fact that I'm the only one that's doing this and I'm trying to take away the opportunity to participate in helping our senior citizens capture a little relief with a program that they have received no help at all; zero help last year. It took us some time and effort to put this together and I'm proud to be a part of it so that we can actually give something back to these citizens that deserve it. They are the backbone of this community and maybe you don't feel that way but I do. I haven't seen anything from you that can make this any better but would relinquish my time for you to talk if you could tell me how you can improve this, get it done and tell me where the money is going to come from, how you're going to pass this and how you're going to get the votes to do it. I will give you the opportunity to speak when I'm done. This was introduced by Mayor Coyne, Councilman Salvatore, Mencini, Higgins, Burgio, D'Amico and Council President Patten; that's the entire City Council supporting this with the administration. Two people decided not to get on it and if you don't want to support something, like I told you before, you didn't want to even support the resolution for the police department. You had an opportunity to vote no on that...

Mr. Troyer – That's not true.

Mr. Salvatore – It is I have the verbatim minutes and you can read them if you want to take the time. This is so important I can't sit back and say nothing, I usually let people do what they want to say and say what they want to do; I listen to all of it and don't bother anybody. I'm not a grandstander and I'm not grandstanding now but I'm not going to sit up here and let anybody disturb this and take away the opportunity for the citizens of this community, in particular the senior citizens that have an opportunity to capture a little bit of relief. This is just the beginning and I know this is your first term and you don't understand how hard it is to get things done. You think you can criticize everybody, make fun of everything, the easiest thing to do in the world is to vote no, let somebody else do it. You weren't around for the budget hearings you said you guys will figure it out; we'll call special meetings we'll solve it. This is important but I'll wait two weeks, I am the sponsor of this and did bring this forward and have five Members of Council supporting with me; I would appeal to

Third Reading of Resolutions and Ordinances: cont.

them and say we'll give you two weeks. How are you going to get this done, how are you going to get it done for free and who is going to do it? Thank you Mr. Chairman.

Mr. D'Amico – I would like to interject as Councilman at Large although acting as Council President tonight I have a right to speak on legislation, I'm going to. I would like to let the Members of Council, people in the audience and at home that are viewing this understand one thing tonight. There is a two-twelfths ordinance that is in place in this city we have what is called a 'Rainy Day Fund Balance', or however you want to call it, but its fund that have to be two-twelfths of the amounts of money we spend during the course of the year. That are kept because of the fact that we that we have to have Moody's bond rating that is no difference than your house you keep so much money in the bank you go for a mortgage; you have to have a rating for yourself for your credit. We have a credit rating for this city and the Moody's bond rating does that based on our ordinance. We are at this point speaking to the Finance Director \$700,000 before that and, at this point in time, so we understand things. When we go ahead and place legislation on and pass them if they are cost-effective we pass them; of not we have to a good look at whether or not we should. At this point in time although the legislation may not be as we'd like it because I'll have to say I did voice my opinion and did want the legislation to read a younger age. The Mayor did reply and counteract that and at this point in time I do know from the last meeting the Mayor did state that it's this program or no program. We lived this with the ½% tax increase and the Mayor has a veto right and in fact if we don't pass this or we do pass this with amendments the Mayor can come back and veto if he doesn't like the way it's presented. At this point in time I'd like to challenge Mr. Troyer you came to the podium you talked and will have your chance in a minute but what is the perpetual funding mechanism that you have to consistently, as you want to all the time, watch the rainy day fund so that it doesn't get out of whack and we comply with that ordinance of two-twelfths. On the other side you go ahead and take and want to raise costs in the General Fund which then separates our differences in that Rainy Day Fund further apart; you can't have it both ways. So, at this point in time, that's why I'm in favor of this legislation because it's cost-effective at this time or it's no legislation at all because the Mayor probably would veto an amendment because he's the Mayor and can do this and we've lived this. So I'm not saying it's okay I would like to have it changed and we would all like to have legislation that says for the seniors we could give everything for free or what we can do before is present things with services that we can give the seniors everything that they want but it's impossible, at this point, to do both. Stay on the side of the Rainy Day Fund, satisfy the two-twelfths to keep the Moody's bond rating in tact and then go ahead and not raise the General Fund by creating more expenses on the side of trying to give the people more.

Third Reading of Resolutions and Ordinances: cont.

Motion by Mr. Troyer, supported by Mrs. Powers, to amend Section 937.01 by deleting the words 'is hereby amended to read' and eliminate Section 937.01 following.

Mr. Salvatore asked for an explanation on the amendment being proposed.

Mr. Troyer responded this would bring this back to a service and there are other amendments to go with this, but this would bring it back to a service.

Mayor Coyne stated the Chairman this evening, Council President, is the Chairman of the Finance Committee and I couldn't have stated it any better than he did this evening. The only point I disagree with him on is it is not a case of vetoing anything it's the reality of our financial condition; you will not accept that. Presently under the old program we have 1,028 households that were registered and qualified. Under the new legislation 956 of those people will qualify barring their financial assessment. So, therefore, we didn't do this in a vacuum there was a reason that we did it. Those nine employees who did this work would cost the city over \$250,000 to bring back that cannot be done. As the Finance Chairman and the President Pro-tem said you want to have it all ways; you don't want to change funds to fund this. Council painstakingly went through this budget process to fund this right now. As the Finance Chairman and the Chairman this evening said the fact of the matter is we don't have a permanent funding source for this service. So you're statement that you want this brought back as is, is totally out of touch with reality and cannot be done. If Council passed it I wouldn't let the program because I don't have the personnel to do it, pure and simple as that.

Mr. Higgins stated well, since I'm one of the guys that always calls it as I see it; one of two things happened here tonight. Once again we got our explanation as to why we're doing what we're doing and either Mr. Troyer you're not paying attention or you just don't comprehend it. So we've talked about this a number of times and we're going over the same thing that we did before and this is once again election time and I see this as political posturing for our Hometown News article for yourself Mr. Troyer; so I hope you found yourself at the podium a home for yourself after this election.

Mr. Troyer stated the Mayor did mention that it takes nine employees to do this and these are some of the questions that I asked and never got answered but obviously we don't need nine full-time employees because it only snows a few months a year and they are doing other things. I'm sure that it's not going to work out exactly that way and I'm not the service director but the fact of the matter is. It costs us \$72,000 to do this and now it's costing much more; four times that. That's the point here so there's a motion and second I would like to call the roll.

Third Reading of Resolutions and Ordinances: cont.

Mayor Coyne stated all the Members of Council read the budget, you're amazing to me, you're analysis. Let me explain it to you have you ever been a service director? Have you ever delivered city services have you been in charge of a workforce that logistically delivers services; you haven't have you? I have and I want to say this to you again so you understand. The \$1.7 million dollars that got us to the furthest goal of replenishing with the Finance Chairman, Councilman D'Amico, explained to you very thoroughly. We got to that goal by reducing the number of employees primarily in the service department. So when you isolate, you could say grass cutting only costs \$60,000 or \$70,000 that's true. Except you have to employ these people all year long and before you raise the issue we looked at hiring our people who have retired and I'm sure that Councilman Higgins is aware of this. Our present people I've had to find people to drive our buses because any of our former employees that would come back to work on a limited time for these kinds of services. This is where people utilize the part-time we can't do that anymore because PERS (Public Employee Retirement Service) will take their hospitalization benefits away from them. This has occurred to us in the Building Department and the Service Departments both. The other issue is, yes, they were doing something else they were plowing the streets and the other practical matter I will give to you having experienced this. For most of my career the citizens in our town, our senior citizens, do not want to wait 24 or 48 hours go get their driveways plowed they want it now; they want it to be done now whether they go out or not. So you continue to make assertions up here and state facts that you create in your head that don't exist, you can't have it both ways. The fact of the matter is you battled me, the Finance Director and this Council on the way to finance this. Because you're clinging to your head that this money can be used for all kinds of sound problems it cannot. The airport program is over and as you know the railroad crossings are in your ward we have one more. No, you're shaking your head at me the fact of the matter is that we continue over and over to discuss the same things. You're presented the facts and you're just going to say it only costs \$79,000 we can do that. We are not incurring anymore of the costs than the \$80,000 that you appropriated.

Mr. Troyer interjected I know the seniors are.

Mayor Coyne continued correct, but last year they paid for everything and what you don't understand is this. We were giving services that we never paid for my friend. The workers at Ford Motor Company and the workers at NASA paid for these services, not our citizens they never have. The fact is they were given an opportunity to vote for a fund to pay for services that you told them not to vote for. So if it's...

Mr. Troyer – That's not true...

Mayor Coyne – Yes it is true...

Third Reading of Resolutions and Ordinances: cont.

Mr. Troyer – That's not true...

Mayor Coyne – Yes it is true...

Mr. D'Amico – One at a time please.

Mayor Coyne – okay, I have the floor and the whole group that you run with and you're running with now. The fact of the matter is..

Mr. Troyer – Point of Order he's attacking....

Mr. D'Amico – You will have your chance to speak.

Mayor Coyne – Thank you Mr. Chairman. The fact is Councilman it was a simple resolution and I want to say this to you and I was criticized for putting two things (tax levies) on at one time. I wanted a referendum on our recreation operations and our senior services and you may say the voters rejected me, they rejected paying it; it was my responsibility to inform them of what the financial situation is. Finally, your colleague, Mr. Higgins, addressing the real issue. The finances of the city are your responsibility they're not mine. It's my job and the Finance Director's responsibility to inform Council of the financial conditions and how we can address those in a budget. It is you responsibility to provide that funding and pass the laws to implement the policy. The fact of the matter is, we see here again tonight, and I've seen your literature. You're bringing everything back and you're going to do this with no resources, I've read it and I congratulate you at the candidates' night for your presentation. It was a great presentation but nothing you said was factual.

Mr. Troyer – That's your opinion I don't do anything that's not factual, that's your opinion...

Mayor Coyne – No, it's facts.

Mr. Troyer – Like the \$3 million dollar deficit, Mayor?

Mayor Coyne – I explained that to you as well, sir.

Mr. D'Amico – Please...

Mayor Coyne – and you just can't comprehend it, that's correct you can't comprehend it and that's not my responsibility. So for 20 months your colleagues, myself, the finance director and everyone that could has tried to help you along in this; you have a thought process that will not accept the reality. The acting Council President, Finance Chairman, quoted me as correct either we do this or there will be no

Third Reading of Resolutions and Ordinances: cont.

assistance for our people because we don't have the manpower to do the job and we're not going to have the manpower, pure and simple. So you can want it all you want, I wish these people were all working here, I wish we didn't have to do the things that we had to do but I've done everything that I could do short of Councilmatic action. This is a collaborative effort no one is perfect for anybody here at this point in time but it is a beginning of how we can deliver service. You want to equate service with the city providing it and we're a partnership with our residents'. Just like we're trying to do neighborhood improvement that way, just like we're trying to do cross-connections that way. In a partnership with our citizens where they invest in our future along with us, that's the mode we have to go with. Because the equation I will give you to bring back the things you want you're going to take an influx, listen to the number, \$3 million dollars in city income tax coming in more a year. That's never going to happen again in this city's history. There will be small dribbles, there will be minimal growth by maybe \$1 million, maybe \$500,000, maybe a couple of hundred thousand but on the operational side, I hope you're listening to me because I've had a lot of experiences in good and bad times in this town; so that's the reality of the finances. I think the other citizens of the community that are not senior saying what are you spending that kind of money on that for? Why aren't you spending it on Recreation, the seniors will say what are you spending it on Recreation for? The fire department negotiations will ask me why I'm spending it on either one and if you remember at the very beginning of this process I said every single city operation will compete for funding. Every one of them there is nothing sacred anymore because it cannot be. So through this year even with all the things we did even though your thing is I'm closing the Recreation Center one room at a time; I'm saving it one room at a time it's operating. Or we have a piece of legislation to fill the pool without any understanding what it costs and how it can function. So unless and until you understand and your colleague understands nobody is happy with anything that I'm proposing including me but it is a beginning and is something that our senior citizens who need us most can hopefully try to get through this winter. That is the light and conversation that this discussion is taking place with City Council and I thank the majority for their support.

Mr. D'Amico stated Mr. Troyer you have a motion on the floor and I'm going to get to you in a minute and we will call that roll but first we are going to listen to Mr. Mencini, Mrs. Powers and then yourself if you want to rebuttal and then call the roll. I want to make sure all Council Members get the opportunity to speak once around because it's a very important issue.

Mr. Mencini stated this is another area where I came from for 30 years. Was it maybe out of whack when we were doing 1,100 or 1,200 which should have been monitored more the answer is yes. I want to give the seniors everything that they had before and one out of every three homes is a senior but I want to do it where we can do it every year. So this can be done where there is not going to be any problems and

Third Reading of Resolutions and Ordinances: cont.

being out there walking there are a lot of seniors are starting to ask about this program and the sidewalk program. On this piece of legislation I want to give it to them because this is a very good piece that should go through and is very important for a lot of our seniors; especially the physically disabled.

Mrs. Powers stated where to begin...With the costs of the senior snow plowing in the past you said its \$80,000. When you look at these numbers that have been provided with the contractors it's going to cost \$200,000 or \$300,000. We're always good for these history lessons and in 2013 we had a fully functional city, we had senior snow plowing, senior grass cutting for the 2013-2014 year. We came in and the Mayor is trying to apparently make a point that by cutting off everything but in 2013 we had those fully functional programs. Today, we have by the Mayor's statement 11 fewer employees so we have that savings and he alluded to the fact that two of us voted against the budget and I am proud to say I am one of them that voted against the budget. Because we had \$1.5 million dollars more coming in last year and he had cut all those services so that's why I voted against it. It was too much extravagant spending and we took 100,000 out of the sound insulation fund and that's why I voted no but we have all that money; if you go back and look at 2013 we had a lot less money and a lot more services. So for anybody to sit up here and say that we have to have fewer services because of less money that is not true. Because we have more money now than we had last year, we have more money now then we had in 2013 and we have fewer services. So this whole thing that we're arguing about is just ridiculous and if senior snow plowing costs us \$80,000 we can make up a lot of that out of our grass cutting when the city employees go out and cut the grass on city properties. The ball fields are kept in tip-top shape so if they have that kind of time and money that can be transferred to the senior citizens program; because they are going to be doing something this winter in place of grass cutting so it might as well be the senior snow plow.

Mayor Coyne stated that is the most ludicrous statement that I've heard from a member of City Council.

Mrs. Powers interjected I expected you to say something like that.

Mayor Coyne continued of course and, you know, the other thing Mrs. Powers you are Chairman of the Service Committee is that correct?

Mrs. Powers responded right.

Mayor Coyne – Have you ever been to the service department?

Mrs. Powers – No.

Third Reading of Resolutions and Ordinances: cont.

Mayor Coyne – Okay, then maybe you don't understand. The fact of the matter is this how did we arrive truly at this miraculous budget. You agree because you say wasteful spending and I would like to know what that is because there's nothing you're against spending anything on. Because again you and your colleague the city does not have a spending issue it has a revenue issue on the capital side. So everything that was done to reduce our workforce, everything that was done make employees pay more for their benefits we still haven't...As a matter of fact in the consolidation I want to do we would have another \$750,000 for the city this year and you opposed that as well. So the reality is I think, again, you continue to demonstrate a fundamental misunderstanding of the budget and how the city operates on a daily basis. I guess the crack is because I play softball in the parks can you imagine what our parks would look like? It's a city asset thousands of our families' use those parks all the time. What do you want them to look like? Right now I think they are a disgrace because all we do is cut the grass. We don't fix the fences, we don't take care of the weeds, we don't take care of the other conditions that exist; to me they are not to the standard of service delivery that our people are entitled to. There is one worker by the name of John Bernath and see him work it is phenomenal what those guys are doing with a reduced number of people. The barrels you see Mr. Higgins asks when are they barrels going to go away; he knows because he is going through the same thing, so that's the reality. You can't have it both ways you're acting like I'm sitting here planning the demise of our town; I'm doing the exactly the opposite. Because the fact of the matter is as easy for you and your colleague just to tell the people what they want to hear. It's the Mayor doing this, it's the Mayor doing that I'm doing my job. I came into a situation and many Members of this Council including yourself and Mr. Troyer that you did not create, nor did the existing members sitting here create. They did everything that they could they had a buyout, they reduced personnel, they did all those kinds of things it just wasn't enough. You're against subcontracting the rubbish and there are others up here but for different reasons. The fact of the matter is that would take six more employees to do other work that needs to be done such as cleaning sewers and things like that and the citizens of Brook Park wouldn't have noticed one thing; same trucks and in some cases same personnel. Every laid-off person in the service department with the exception of one is reemployed and I hope to bring them back as employees leave. What I'm saying to you, again, is it is easy to say you have no comprehension about this budget and, you know it and probably shouldn't, because you've only been here 20 months it's a little bit more complicated. The fact of the matter is this Council moved \$1 million dollars not \$80,000, not \$50,000 they moved money to go into Economic Development. I read all these pieces of literature that we're going to solve these problems by economic development because this Council, some of the members that are here, had to move economic development money to make the city operate. Mr. Higgins will tell you we were 60/40 tax split; 70/30 on splits for streets and there is one street being done at a cost of \$900,000 this year. That is 10% of the money that is appropriated for capital improvements and looking at next year if there is

Third Reading of Resolutions and Ordinances: cont.

\$300,000 to do a street we're going to be lucky. You know why because we had to buy police cars, there are communication issues to deal with. Those are practical capital costs of this city that you never talk about. So I will say to this to you, Mrs. Powers, I remember being in a meeting with the seniors and your statement to them was the Mayor has too many fund balances. What does that mean...I remember like it was yesterday...As a matter of fact Brian Higgins' mom might have been there and Danny Colonna and I said yes the city has fund balances and there is a reason why; they are 'earmarked' for certain things. So out of that movement that the two of you voted against Council funded the money for neighborhood improvements that you're all talking about. They funded a 50/50 program on eliminating the cross-connections in the city, they funded the senior program and they put money back for us to help attract jobs. Again, I don't like to keep referring to Brian Higgins the City of Parma just brought in a major employer into their town how did they do that? They provided them economic incentives to come in for that payroll tax; you need money to do that. So Council funded all of that did you know that?

Mrs. Powers – Yes.

Mayor Coyne – Okay, then what is amazing tonight is a revelation and I hope everyone at home is watching. Because when I picked up the Hometown News you and Mr. Troyer solved the all the financial problems of this city and you voted against everything that we did. The fact is you did not vote for the transfer of this money and this is a courageous thing that Council is going, the Members of City Council. Because next year once you start a program it's hard to take it away and Council is going to be challenged next year to fund all of these things again. They were taken from a fund that, quite frankly, we had expended everything that we could in resolving those problems and it was available. Just so you know the finance director fought with me a little bit on it but my charge from Council was we want these programs funded and you better present a budget that funds them; that's what I got from the Finance Chairman and that's what I got from Council members. The both of you I offered on many occasions and I keep repeating this so I get these things about bullying you and nothing could be further from the truth. You had a standing meeting with me every Tuesday that we could sit here and work out issues and my challenge to every Member of Council is I want you to understand this budget. You've been here 20 months and it is clear to me that you don't; you just spout off things that feel good to you.

Mr. D'Amico – Mayor, let's close it out.

Mayor Coyne – I'm sorry Mr. Chairman.

Mr. D'Amico – Mr. Troyer you can make a closing statement here if you'd like to remark.

Third Reading of Resolutions and Ordinances: cont.

Mr. Troyer – Thank you Mr. Chairman, where do I begin you know I pride myself on not being a politician; the Mayor is a great politician and speaker. I go off facts and don't like to mislead people I like to go out there and give out the facts as I'm presented with them. The funding for this as the Mayor alluded to is a one-time deal and Mr. Mencini mentioned that he wants to continue this for a lot of years and keep it going but, again, this is a one time deal; this deal is funded one year. Where is it coming from next year and the funny thing is its an election year. Buyouts, a lot of the senior members on this Council did buyouts so we didn't have to lay off people. What happens is after finally paying off those buyouts the new Mayor comes in and lays people off anyway, kind of a waste of money to do those buyouts. It helped those people though but cost us money that was also extra money that should have been shown in our budget, in our appropriations budget. Again, it's just an appropriation budget but our problem is that it was bloated as far as appropriating the money. It should have shown the \$1.7 million dollars for the people that were laid-off and should have shown the \$432,000 from the PERS savings that we didn't have to pay that was what we were looking for; now that money is showing up. The Mayor talked about making the city operate using this million...you know that's not...some of these issues on here are not making the city operate; actually none of them make the city operate they are just things that we're offering. The only difference is the senior snow plowing program...sorry the senior snow plowing service was something that we've had for 37 years and we should keep as is. Thank you.

Mr. D'Amico stated there is a motion on the floor made by Mr. Troyer and properly seconded are questions on the motion; hearing none please call the roll.

ROLL CALL: AYES: Troyer, Powers,
NAYS: Burgio, Mencini, Salvatore, Higgins, D'Amico. The amendment failed by a vote of 2-5. **Failed**

Motion by Mr. Higgins, supported by Mr. Burgio, to adopt.

ROLL CALL: AYES: Higgins, Burgio, Mencini, D'Amico, Salvatore
NAYS: Powers, Troyer. The motion carried with a vote of 5-2.

Adopted.

There being no further business to come before this meeting Council President Pro-Tem adjourned this meeting at 9:50 p.m.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED Michelle Blazak
Michelle Blazak
Clerk of Council

APPROVED October 20, 2015

THESE MEETING MINUTES OF BROOK PARK CITY COUNCIL ARE A SYNOPSIS, NOT TRANSCRIBED IN THEIR ENTIRETY, ALTHOUGH ACCURATE.