

**SPECIAL CAUCUS MEETING
OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF BROOK PARK, OHIO
HELD ON TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 24, 2015**

Council President Patten called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m., the clerk called the roll and the following Members of Council answered:

HIGGINS, TROYER, SALVATORE, MENCINI, BURGIO, POWERS, D'AMICO

Also in attendance were Mayor Coyne, Human Resources Commissioner Sinatra, Assistant Fire Chief Johnson, Police Sergeant Stopiak, Assistant Finance Director Healy, Finance Director Cingle, Law Director Jamison and Building Commissioner Hurst.

SUBJECT: DISCUSSION

1. COMMUNICATIONS PER MAYOR COYNE

Mayor Coyne thanked Members of Council for attending this meeting and provided a cost-analysis handout (that is attached to these minutes). Mayor Coyne continued it's important that the communication/technology needs be addressed. In the permanent appropriations of last March City Council passed aggregate Capital Improvement expenditures for various needs of the city and communications was included in those expenditures. Changes were needed so that there could be more money to pay for the Leslie/Sylvia Watermain Project and in there specific items for City Council as to what the capital operating needs of the city for the various departments. It has been eight years since the city's computer system, information system and backup systems were upgraded and in today's times that is an eternity. The city needs to begin to bring the communications and data processing into the 21st Century and that will require expenditure. The former consultant that worked under the former administration and the new consultant that was brought in basically made the same recommendations. There was a point last year where the police computers had to have monies expended to be able to take the new windows systems because they wouldn't work and couldn't provide backup services. In essence what the city did with the consultant was head up a group of various departments from Finance, Police and Fire to determine what the needs of the city are to begin moving forward and addressing the problems all the way from payroll to basic information and reports for the various department. An aggregate amount I think of \$260,000 was put into the budget to do those upgrades. After Council made the appropriations the employee group began to seek prices on the various commodities that are needed and some of them are proprietary licenses that are owned so it's hard to negotiate prices with them

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

or find vendors that will lock in a price. In the past Council has passed means that the city can take to advantage of state-wide and region-wide competitive bidding on various commodities. Fortunately enough some of the things needed are in that bid group and what was found out in the aggregate rather than take the state purchasing is the other purchasing entity which is NJPA (National Joint Powers Alliance) would result in the city spending probably about \$46,000 less than if the city went with state purchasing; on the handout there are other services outside of that cost and there is legislation to address those. Ms. Sinatra headed up the team that includes Police Sgt. Stopiak, Assistant Fire Chief Johnson as well as Assistant Director of Finance Healy who can each speak on their department needs where backup is needed as well as improved payroll systems. Mayor Coyne clarified if Members of Council received the four ordinances brought over this afternoon; some Members of Council concurred. The reason that this is being done this way is number one to take the time to answer any questions Council may have and number two to get moving on this in the month of December and hopefully get suspension of the rules in order for monies to be saved. Locking in these prices with these different entities is tough because they're always a moving target so if nothing is decided until January or February, 2016 it could add 10% to the costs; that's the only reason that Council is being asked to do that. The first piece of legislation deals with TCC Technologies Solutions that currently have the city contract to provide services to make sure the city's systems are running properly. We are asking to make an addition to this contract for next year that will provide for the installation of all of the various components of the city's information systems as well as provide a data backup service for the city offsite; presently most of the city's items are in the backup facility located at the fire station on Ruple Road. While that is okay but in today's day and age with all the cyber problems that could occur it's good to have an offsite premise for the informational systems and is an operating adjustment that will have to be made in the next year.

Mr. Cingle stated when going through the audit for the fiscal year ending December 31, 2014 and the auditors did make a comment on the growing concern that they have for the city in case of a disastrous event such as city hall burning down. The auditors questioned how does the city continue to operate? The improvements to the backup that would be a Cloud backup is it can't be minimized and is extremely important. The new technology backing up to the Cloud is the current State of the Art and allow the city continue to maintain operations in the event of a disaster and will be reviewed in the audit for 2015; this legislation would be one solution to be provided for such.

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

Mayor Coyne stated the next piece of legislation is to modify the city's finance and payroll system in the amount of \$42,194 and again this is a proprietary engagement that the city has to have.

Mr. Cingle stated currently the city uses a CMI System so this legislation would be upgrading their system and is cheaper than actually purchasing a new payroll and finance system. Mr. Cingle asked Mr. Healy to explain why the department is asking Council to pass legislation to upgrade the city's payroll and finance systems.

Mr. Healy stated some of the major points going to what is called the finance and authority payroll system in part the city will go paperless and will create the city's databases going back farther and allow for easier queries. This upgrade will make it easier to run reports and information will be more readily at hand in a format that they created. A lot of cities in Northeast Ohio have already converted over to this system as well as some of the surrounding communities that have also upgraded to this system. Some of the things created is the system called authority forms that will allow the department to W-2's and 1099's by using blank stock paper so that the department doesn't have to send to the printer; which will cut costs. This upgrade will give the city the ability to do electronic paystubs that can be electronically sent to the employees who can pull up their own. With the city's payroll system this upgrade would create employee portals where employees can log in and print out their own W-2's and paystubs. There are a lot of times the department gets numerous requests for W-2's because an employee is purchasing something and needs the report and has to wait until the next day to get the report; this will allow the employees to pull up their own information by going online. One of the biggest thing with this upgrade will be for the city's accounts payables can be printed on blank paper stock and be more efficient in payroll and accounts payable processing; which will cut down costs and helps with fraud because the stock will be watermarked paper.

Mrs. Powers stated I don't see the urgency of this Council knew last week, last month, six months ago about the Mayor wanting to do this and the city just purchased a lot of different paper stock for thousands of dollars and once again this information was given to Council today; so I don't think that Council needs to be rushing through something.

Mayor Coyne responded it is just the opposite, Councilwoman; I called a special meeting so that Council can take the time to discuss it as long as Council acts before the end of first of the year on these measures. Again, we will spend as much time as you would like this evening and a subsequent

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

Caucus meeting and I don't know what paper stock you are talking about. The fact of the matter is the Administration has been in the planning of this for several months to get the prices and lock up the vendors this is not something that can be done overnight. This is the introduction of discussion of these matters so we are not rushing you and, again, we have information that we will give you but if we don't act before the first of the year these prices are going to move and will cost more money. So for a state of proficiency this is the way I prefer to do things by having individual meetings on the project that the city has to engage in. The team has been hammering out these matters and finalizing these matters and how it had to be done through this purchasing right up until last week to try and get the best prices that the city possibly could for the city. We are not rushing you and the city does need this and with the paper stock issue I have no idea what you are talking about.

Mrs. Powers stated I study the Board of Control reports when they are received but it was very recent that the city spent \$73,000 for office paper stock.

Mr. Cingle stated I don't recall any Board of Control item that would have authorized the purchase of \$73,000 any type of accounts payables checks, W-2's or any type of stock paper used in the Finance Department or City Hall; any purchase over \$50,000 it would had to be competitively bid unless under state purchase but I'm not aware of any purchase made for \$73,000. Perhaps the Councilwoman could review the Board of Control and let us know at the next meeting. What I will say on the payroll in the finance system either we will upgrade now or will be forced to upgrade in the future. As technology changes companies continue to change their products and the system the city is currently under has been enhanced and as Mr. Healy stated. Many communities have already upgraded and purchased the new version of the payroll and finance systems so whether this is done in 2015, 2016, 2017, whatever it may be, the city will have to make the change. Then concern going forward that the version the city currently runs may not be maintained in the future. As more and more communities upgrade the systems they will continue to develop that system and add further enhancements to that system; so the city will fall further and further behind and the cost will increase over time. It's just a matter of technology changing and companies through their efforts continue to change and offer new products and this is cheaper than going out and purchasing a whole new accounting and payroll systems.

Mayor Coyne commented when Council appropriated the Capital Improvements and the itemized Capital Improvements this was in here and,

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

I believe, all Members of Council received a memo outlining the various costs that were thought to be incurred with an explanation of what it was for. Council has had this information since March and it was upgraded in June of this year and if you look for comparison purposes. This was the original projected capital costs listed in this document and what Council is being shown is how the capital costs are going to be implemented that Council has appropriated.

Mr. Cingle stated the committee headed up by Ms. Sinatra spent many, many man-hours going through each line item and I know from experience it is not easy to compare quotes from different vendors. It is very difficult to go through all their contracts, all the items that are had within the contract and make sure that apples to apples or oranges to oranges are being compared in order to get a good comparison. Mr. Cingle thanked the committee for all the hours that they spent and that is one of the reasons why it took some time to go gather all the data to feel comfortable to bring it forward to City Council for review.

Mrs. Powers stated this is more than a \$50,000 contract and as Mr. Cingle stated when more than those monies are spent that contract needs to go out to bid. As far as all of this including the actual costs that comes to \$238,924.00; I think this needs to be put out to bid. If it took Ms. Sinatra and other people many, many hours to come up with this shouldn't Council have a few hours to review this because it is too much to take in when received at the last minute.

Mayor Coyne stated take as much time as needed; ask as many questions as you want. Subsequently, what I'm saying is we would like to move these this forward and you're correct about bidding. Except under the state law the city can take a project like this, an aggregate, and the various components of it subject to state purchasing or sole-source within that project costs. That is according to state law that the city can do that and you will find on these things as Finance Director Cingle pointed out it's much more complex than dealing with the building. With the system currently in the finance department it is cheaper for the city to upgrade that system than purchase a new one. In some cases the city must get new systems and when we move to the next component of this which is the largest expenditure Assistant Fire Chief Johnson and Sgt. Stopiak will explain to Council in the work that they did to get the best prices. I am not asking for Council to make a decision this evening but would like to have this on the next Caucus for more discussion; this is a moving target. The city's budget was slowed down to some degree as well and those are other things that will have to be talked about in the future. This is what should be done is

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

presenting information to you in a work session like this where hours of discussion that are needed. Once again, you had memorandums that were part of the itemized budget so Council had several months to ask questions and the Administration is now telling you how the budget is going to be implemented. In many of these cases the city can't advertise for bids for these things because they indirectly most of these have been advertised for bids through these two consortiums that Council enacted the Administration to use because of competitive bidding on them.

Mrs. Powers continued I understand that but is the city upgrading a system that is obsolete; I have heard that the city's entire computer system is obsolete. So why would the city want to update something that is obsolete that would be throwing good money after bad.

Mayor Coyne responded it is an operating system and the hardware part will be discussed next with timekeeping. It is the operating systems that need to be upgraded and as Mr. Cingle stated it makes sense because the city is using it and it can be upgraded; in some other areas it cannot be. For instance people who have home computers with the old Windows system had to be upgraded because the old system wouldn't do anything, so that is what needs to be done at the city.

Mr. Cingle commented so that Mrs. Powers is aware that payroll and finance software upgrade cannot be bid if the city is going to continue to use the city's current system. If Council deems that they want to purchase a new system for payroll and finance that can be bid; this is a proprietary system that the city is upgrading. One of the reasons why the systems aren't up to the most current technology, as the Mayor stated earlier, they haven't been upgraded in years. So the city wants to take the systems from previous technology to the most current technology and, we believe, this is the most economical way to achieve that goal. In theory, the city could go down the State contract list here – infrastructure upgrades \$36,985.00; Microsoft Office \$25,000.00 just to use those two as examples. The administration has the ability to go out and enter into an agreement to purchase just those two items but looking at in total it is cheaper for the infrastructure upgrades to go through State contract and Microsoft Office 365 email to buy through NJPA so that dollars are being saved as the city is doing this.

Mr. Troyer stated to Law Director Jamison on these two last items is it legal to send these out without public bidding; enter into a contract with these without public bidding?

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

Mr. Jamison clarified if Mr. Troyer is referring to the Finance and Payroll systems?

Mr. Troyer responded TCC and the one being discussed currently.

Mr. Jamison stated as the finance director just related what you're doing is taking an existing system and upgrading what the city has; so that cannot be bid because you're upgrading someone's system that is already in place. So that if you want to get a system with the upgrade that would be consistent with that you would have to go out and rebid the whole system and as the finance director related that would be a substantially higher cost. So the fact that you're taking the existing system in place and purchasing upgrades that is why it can't be bid. As an example if there is company ABC and upgrading their system they're not going to let you go out and bid on top of that ABC's upgrades have to be used to that system; in that sense that is what the city is doing. As far as TCC that is the vendor the city uses for the maintenance for various computer IT work in the city which is a specialized function and state laws allows us to not have to bid that specialized service; the city does that in other areas as well so both of those are in conformity as well.

Mr. Troyer stated to Finance Director Cingle going back to TCC so there is no proprietary information there so we could bid that out and possibly get somebody to do that.

Mayor Coyne stated I will tell you exactly what the situation is, presently and the next piece of legislation will be the same way. We have a contract for the \$38,000 with TCC to do the city's normal maintenance and service calls for the city. TCC has helped us analyze and address the city's needs and we would like to keep them, add to their contract. So I can award TCC a contract because it was approved under this Ordinance for that amount because it's less than \$50,000. The city is adding on the backup and the installation because it makes sense to do that with this company; that's why it's being done that way. As Council will see in the next one the aggregate of this project sitting with the Finance Director and Law Department and talking to the Auditor's office this is a project that's why there is legislation some of this that I can go out and contract for but I want Council to see the total project so there is legislation that affirms what the expenditure is for.

Mr. Troyer commented it's great that this Caucus meeting was called to discuss this but Council did not have any information ahead of time except for the general...

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

Mayor Coyne interjected before you go any farther can I interrupt you. We are making a presentation of the information to Council today; this is the beginning of the discussion of this. We are not asking for any action that's the way it supposed to be done...

Mr. Troyer – I don't actually think any action can happen.

Mayor Coyne – I'm not asking you to do any so let's not create straw dogs where they don't exist. I went through this with you several times before the fact is we are presenting this to you for the purpose of our presentation; I could have sent this to you and it wouldn't have meant anything to you. The fact of the matter is this is the beginning of the process; this is what we're asking Council to do. Then after that it's up to Council so nobody is rushing you, nobody is putting anything out there. The fact of the matter is this is our presentation of the information on which Council is being asked to make a determination.

Mr. Troyer – I have to disagree with you on nobody's rushing you...

Mayor Coyne – Of course...

Mr. Troyer – We have two meetings left so without another special meeting there is no way to have three readings, and there should be three readings on something like this.

Mayor Coyne – I disagree but...

Mr. Troyer – We're spending monies especially when we're spending money on non-bid contracts.

Mayor Coyne – You've already appropriated for it...

Mr. Troyer – I just want to mention another thing it's been discussed that we're chasing a cost that keeps going up but we're also chasing technology. As the cost goes up the technology gets better so when buying it at a cheaper price we're stuck with this technology. If we do wait and it does go up most likely we would get better technology, more advanced technology. We're paying for what we're getting and I don't think there's that big of a deal...I'm willing to look at this but there's a few things, like I said, I don't like and I know its capital monies and for the most part do have to say what happens to that. I believe it was June, you mentioned March a couple of times, and that was the original budget. I believe the secondary part of this for Capital Improvements came out around June, and you mentioned March.

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

Mayor Coyne – I also mentioned June...

Mr. Troyer – So now it's the end of November...

Mayor Coyne – What's the point...The point is that you take the time to pass the budget; the aggregate amount was in Capital Improvements in March. As a matter of fact we amended it because I went through other Capital needs whether it turn-out gear or police firearms so we needed to pick up another \$96,000 to pay for the Leslie-Sylvia Road Project and we made the amendments to go forward. Things change and your argument about technology they're not going to change that quickly over that short of period of time and you can't have it both ways. If you fail to act and the price goes up fine but where we are scrambling in the city is for capital costs. So every capital dollar that can be avoided in purchasing, I thought the staff did a good job, it warrants its presentation and there are sometimes that it warrants suspending the rules. If you don't want to dogmatically whether it makes sense or not economic or otherwise, that's your prerogative as a Council Member, that's your prerogative. We will present things to you this is the way we're going to do going forward where we have a meeting with one subject that is important so Council can take their time. So you can take as much time as you want and it is our recommendation, our request is that you consider doing that. If you don't then whenever it gets passed, it gets passed if we incur further costs so be it and we'll have to come back to Council for the change in the price and will start all over again and the city will be behind. If there's not any other questions on this I'd like to move to the next item most importantly the presentation by police and fire and maybe Council can understand why we're asking you to do this. I've only asked you to suspend the rules one other time and that was on Ruple Road repairs.

Mr. Patten stated to Mayor Coyne continue.

Mayor Coyne continued the next issue is also finance related and generally employees; it's a software contract for the city's time clock hardware. The amount in Section 2 is incorrect it should only be \$33,000, not \$55,000. A proposal was made to Assistant Finance Director Healy for the city's timekeeping, scheduling and computing all of this. The system the city currently has is a Kronos that was purchased, I believe, during my first term and needless to say that is a long time ago. So the system has to be upgraded and technically I can contract for this amount based on the appropriations of Council and be within the parameters of the law but we want legislation because it's part of a total project of upgrading the city's

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

informational and technology systems in the city. That's why it is in that form but the amount should be \$33,033.00, not what is shown on the actual cost of \$55,000, because there are a couple of things in the proposal that the city is not interested in. That would involve buying six (6) time clocks at \$1200.00 a piece.

Mrs. Powers stated this speaks to my statement that more time is needed because as the Mayor is talking I looked through all my figures and don't see a \$55,000 cost on any of the paperwork.

Mayor Coyne responded if you have the ordinance in front of you and we were going through this the total aggregate proposal to Assistant Finance Director Healy dated September 11th was \$55,833.00. From the capital side the city has \$25,833.00 and have six time clocks at \$1200.00 that equals \$33,033.00. Technically, I could contract for this right now but again it's an aggregate cost of the project of \$214,000, so therefore, in order, I believe that it will conform to the state law and this is the way we should proceed on this.

Mr. Higgins stated at the next work session all the numbers will be fine-tuned on this because I'm looking at the clocks. This piece says four clocks and you're saying six time clocks.

Mayor Coyne clarified that six time clocks are being purchased at a price of \$1200.00 per unit for a cost of \$7200.00 plus the \$25,833.00.

Mr. Higgins stated to Assistant Fire Chief Johnson I was a little concerned and it looks like you received the quote on that but I was a little concerned with item number two – Microsoft Office email. There is a projected cost of \$20,000.00, state contract was almost \$26,000.00 and the NJPA is only \$7,000.00 one? Any reason why there is a big discrepancy in that dollar amount.

Mayor Coyne interjected Brian, what I want to do is get the time clock done and move to the next one that Mr. Johnson will address. Does anyone have any questions on the time clocks?

No questions came forward.

Mayor Coyne continued the next piece of legislation is the various needs of servers, software programs and all those kinds of things that Assistant Fire Chief Johnson and Sgt. Stopiak worked on.

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

Mr. Higgins stated to Asst. Fire Chief Johnson what I'm concerned about is sometimes when a number is so far off it throws up the red flag to me from my years in the business. I was curious why that state contract price for the Microsoft Office is almost \$26,000 for one and the other one is \$7,000; which is almost a third of that amount.

Mayor Coyne asked Council President Patten to allow Asst. Fire Chief Johnson and Sgt. Stopiak to go through this legislation because this is the largest expenditures in the amount of \$114,000 and some change, to allow them to go through the itemized expenditures for Council and share why some of these things need to be done.

Sgt. Stopiak stated starting with the sheet showing the Infrastructure upgrades is I don't think the city ever truly built a network structure from the ground up as an entire entity. It seems like every time something new came along we added something more, something more and something more and eventually ending up with basic extension cords with lots of cube-taps all over the place. So what needs to be done at this point is to take all of that out and rebuild it properly and upgrade to current standards which are a lot better and faster than what is currently installed. Also, there is hardware pieces that need to be replaced because they've been running by the grace of somebody but not us and at some point they are going to fail. So it's better to plan for and make the necessary repairs that need to be made and upgrade the backbone. Mrs. Powers this will address some of your concerns as far as buying new stuff now as part of the total package; yes, we are trying to do pieces at a time. If we were to come in and say that we're going to wipe everything out and start over these numbers would be astronomical but for today this is a very good start and foundation to begin pushing forward; there are issues that are critical and will be worked on first and will continue to work this project. Moving on that Microsoft Office 365 is a web based mail system and what that means is that there is not a server sitting in some office that is taking all the stuff in and has to be accessed through your local machine. This allows us to be able to touch the Internet get the data needed or get emails without having everything tied to your local machine. So that is a software upgrade that, quite honestly, is very overdue for the city. Mr. Stopiak continued that the fire department's computers are very old and I think they've been living the longest with old machinery; clearly we do need to step forward. We have issues today on the law enforcement side maintaining security issues and can no longer run Windows XP. Our machines pre-date Windows 7 but we upgraded to it and the future is

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

Windows 8 or above and our machines can't do it; the fire departments machines are in worse shape. We could lose our ability to function as a police department and fire could lose theirs due to HIPPA (Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act) and federal regulations regarding data and network security; so we have to make these steps baby steps but steps. Wireless upgrade is something both city-wide for various buildings within the city such as a Recreation Center event or Council Chamber event you will be able to get on the network with a laptop, tablet and presentations can be made via Cloud Services. We push stuff off of the city servers out to the Cloud but you need to be able to get back to the Cloud to get the needed data. Microsoft Office 2013 software anyone using Word or Excel programs the city is in Word 2003, only 12 years behind, so it's time to move up. I get emails with attachments that have to be run through a converter program in order to read the attachment; that's how far the city is behind. It's an expense and the world runs on Microsoft and you're pretty much tied down to what Microsoft has to offer and we've done our due diligence in trying to find the best price we can; but Microsoft controls it so it's pretty hard to find sale prices. Internet upgrades this is pretty much the hardware and also the current activity support structure to allow us to reach out and touch web based services, cloud services so we're not having to tie into a server mounted in the basement of the safety building, west end fire station or city hall. As long as we can reach out and touch the Internet, sort of speak, to get the products and stuff needed to use. With that in a plumbing analogy a bigger pipe is needed to move that much more water and in this case more data. So by spreading out the Internet activity throughout the city we can make it easier for everybody to touch at a much more reliable speed and in general a better system. Mr. Stopiak continued with the backup the city needs to have that and currently the city is backing up to the west end fire station and do need to do something because for whatever disaster that may come through the city could be wiped out completely and have absolutely nothing, it's something that hasn't been done. I think the rest of the items on this sheet have been addressed.

Asst. Fire Chief stated on the fire department side, as mentioned, is we are running without data equipment and our computers are eight (8) years old. We're still with Windows 7 and having issues with HIPPA or EMS (Emergency Response System) the department is out of compliance with that for security. Microsoft no longer supports Windows 7 so the department is having security issues associated with this and have come out of compliance. Regarding emails the

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

department is running Office 2003 Outlook and is constantly having issues with emails both internally and externally for us to operate not only in the department within the city but also with surrounding communities and fire departments. There is also a major issue the department has with being very susceptible to viruses and things getting into the system; I get probably on an average anywhere from 100 or so emails a day that are junk mail and that's happening citywide. To hit on Councilman Higgins concern, Brian, I was looking back and a pre-unit cost for the Microsoft 365 state contract and overlooking at with all the users in the city was \$130.00 and the pre-unit cost of the NJPA is \$60.00 and the cost through the state was \$199.00 per licensure, I will double check but the state contract for Microsoft Office was really not much of a discount at all on here compared to the National Joint Purchasing Council; the NJPA is a nationwide consortium so it's a better price.

Mr. Salvatore stated to either the Law or Fire Department, with HIPPA the city is out of compliance now as it relates to the computer systems.

Mr. Johnson responded as it relates to using the department's computers right now with the Windows, we're currently using Windows 7, I've called into the company that the department uses for EMS reporting and they have not officially told me yet but it's at the point without the security issue...The problem you have is once the support is gone with Microsoft Windows then it opens up to a lot of people being able to get in because Microsoft no longer supports the product anymore and are not doing constant upgrades. So we're getting to the point now where we are going to have security issues with that.

Mr. Salvatore stated to Law Director Jamison what risk does the city without being in compliance if it gets to that point in the near future.

Mr. Jamison responded it would have to incumbent on somebody to be able to prove that some type of medical information such as an ambulance run was somehow hacked or pirated out of the city's system. That would take some doing for somebody to figure that out but theoretically that would be possible and I think what Asst. Chief Johnson is saying is that because of the fact the city has an old system. The upgrades needed to secure that to prevent people from hacking or pirating that information is becoming almost impossible if not at all able to be protected. Then that lends itself for someone outside the system to get into it and yes is that a potential liability risk

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

the answer is yes. To be able to prove that it was through the city's negligence of the system that they did it that might be a reach but I think from a proprietary standpoint it makes sense for the city to secure information for a lot of different reasons. Some of it may get back to the city's insurance carrier that we meet with annually and this was a topic of discussion that we had back in the summer; that's where the Cloud came up and the backup discussions started. These all tie together it's not just one thing it's a bunch of threads that go together. So what they're trying to tell you is because of the old system it needs to be upgraded to secure the information that is in the system.

Mr. Salvatore continued so if the city is not in compliance for whatever reason and forget being able to hack into the system. Is there any penalties or fines that could be imposed upon us for not being in compliance?

Mr. Jamison stated I think what Asst. Chief Johnson was saying is that I don't think we had any information from the government saying the city is not in compliance. I think what he's saying is that the city's information was able to be accessed from by an outside source; that would be the violation. I'm not aware of that happening to date but as time keeps going on and the city doesn't make these upgrades we then lend ourselves to being attacked that much more. I don't think, per say, that there's any kind of notice that we've been given. I think what he's saying is the longer the city takes to fix this or upgrade the city's security the greater the risk the city runs that the city could be potentially held responsible for leaking our having that information released.

Mr. Johnson concurred with Mr. Jamison's statements and stated the other issue that I run into is that our EMS Reporting System is web based and by using Windows 7 its getting to the point that they're eventually cut-off giving the department access using the Windows 7 to get into the reporting system; that's the other issue that the department will be running into.

Sgt. Stopiak stated as Mr. Jamison mentioned the longer the city waits and the more vulnerable the system becomes at some point even though the City of Brook Park is little fruit on the tree somebody is going to try and pick it and we do need to make sure that we secure ourselves the best we can. Both by backing up data and having it out of reach from people that mess with it just in case we come in Monday

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

morning to find out that we've been hacked over the weekend and two by putting good doors and locks on the system to begin with to make sure that they can't let them in.

Mr. Salvatore asked if the system has ever been hacked before; have there been any attempts that you are aware of?

Sgt. Stopiak responded I would believe that, at least, on three occasions the city has had some issues where there's been action taken against the city from the outside. They've been poorly organized and it was primarily a denial of service. What they tried to do was just overload the city's system and our firewalls at the time stopped it and shut it down right there; so it never got into the city's system. Could it happen again? Absolutely it could happen tomorrow or it could happen tonight. You always treat as a case of not if but when and we're trying to make sure that when makes it difficult for them to do.

Asst. Fire Chief Johnson stated I can also speak on the fire department's side that we've had a couple of computers already that have had viruses that totally wiped out the hard drive and then restart again. That is by default by all the junk emails that are coming in through the server that people are actually opening up but that's still an avenue for that to come through. Also, the fire department server recently had a virus on there that started deleting files on the fire server back in April.

Mr. Troyer stated my question is and I know we can't be exact on this but how long before the next upgrade is needed?

Mayor Coyne responded it depends and we're going to have to make an annual appropriation just like we do for plow blades, trucks or something like that. Because of the constant state of change and that hasn't been done for a long time because of obvious reasons. So, for example, right now the city is looking at a system for the police department. Rather than having to write up everything the police officer takes the drivers license goes back to the patrol car swipes the license and all the information on that person goes in and prints out a ticket. We're looking at tablets for doing reports onsite to process things so that there is less labor intense for processing reports; so the answer to your question is next year we could be building on these things and appropriating money to constantly upgrade the city's systems. So will there be large expenditures like this, probably not if

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

you keep upgrading. The other thing the city wants to do is electronic purchase requisitions the city still writes out the requisition to go through the process; the city shouldn't have to do that anymore the city should be able to streamline that. So the answer to your question is we believe the system upgrades will be there for a while unless Windows or another program decides to change their systems again.

Mr. Troyer clarified how long can we expect this to last, do we expect this to last; nothing is written in stone.

Mayor Coyne responded the last system lasted eight years so if the city gets eight years out of these upgrades as they are right now and who knows what we're going to have. The desktop computer is just about obsolete so the city may come in five years and say we're going to get tablets for everybody or whatever the latest technology may be. Right now for the city to just be able to operate now sensibly in business like the city has to make some improvements and I don't think this is really an outlandish expenditure and think you can see by the numbers, that our employees did a very good job of putting this together and working these items through.

Mr. Troyer stated to Assistant Finance Director Healy the part of this that you worked on do you believe the city is getting the best deal?

Mr. Healy responded yes I do.

Mr. Troyer stated to Sgt. Stopiak the part of this that you worked on do you believe the city is getting the best deal?

Sgt. Stopiak responded yes I do.

Mr. Troyer stated to Assistant Fire Chief Johnson the part that you worked on do you believe the city is getting the best deal?

Mr. Johnson responded yes I do.

Mr. Troyer stated to Human Resources Commissioner Sinatra the part that you worked on do you believe the city is getting the best deal?

Ms. Sinatra responded yes I do.

Mr. Burgio stated my thoughts were kind of on the same lines as Mr. Troyer's. What I would like to know is how many total companies

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

were compared to during all the research, how many companies did the city look at?

Mr. Stopiak responded I'll touch on that briefly but I don't have exact numbers. What we started with was when the list of recommendations was given even something as simple as an Internet search of Best Buy or whatever retail is available so that there is some ideas as to where to begin. We knew we had certain purchasing options available to us through state pricing or the NJPA Program; so we explored those. Ultimately, we were able to see that if the city wanted to buy Microsoft Office I can purchase it at Best Buy for \$300.00 off the shelf but we can do better here. So as to how many companies probably one half-dozen (6) back and forth were immediately dismissed because of what they were and because what we were trying to do. Which is a total package so we wanted to find a stronger vendor or stronger price-break that would help everybody instead of playing games with things.

Mr. Johnson commented what we did is have the recommendation from our vendor, TCC, as to what needed to be done infrastructure wise between routers, switches and etc. We then went back as mentioned we looked at different vendors and wrote those prices out based on those routers, switches and etc.; which is in the cost of the infrastructure upgrade.

Mr. Burgio stated as Members of Council we want to make sure we are getting the best deal so we are taking in your research as part of that; if we were to move forward on this. I guess we want to be reassured that this is the best that is out there.

Mr. Stopiak commented it's my city too and I don't want to spend monies that we don't have. We honestly feel we did the best we could and I believe that we did the best that is available to us.

Mayor Coyne commented to Councilman Burgio in both of these purchasing cooperatives do exactly the same thing.

Mr. Higgins stated I'm not sure if everyone is familiar with some of these things. The National Joint Powers Alliance actually bid out all kinds of projects, services, vehicles and all kinds of things nationwide to try and get the best price. With the understanding that whatever company is the lowest bidder will possibly get business from anybody that belongs to their organization. I've used them numerous times in the City of Parma so they are as good as or actually better than maybe

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

some state bid pricing at times because they have a bigger market price. So they can give a bigger discount so that is how that one works and I've had good success a few times using them.

Mr. Mencini commented I don't think we need an expert to tell us how far behind the city is. Just looking in this room it's not computerized but look at the microphones 20 minutes ago they weren't even working. There was a question about Board of Control and I go to the school board meetings and they have laptops sitting in front of them. Any question that is asked can be answered right away; so that's how far back this city is. That's where the city should be and one of my colleagues brought up about always chasing technology that is very true. You will always chase technology you can see it with the cell phones the minute one is purchased the phone is already dated. So in looking at this a lot of these prices, I'm not so sure, but I know the team did a lot of research on it and pretty sure they did their homework and it is something that definitely has to be looked at to start moving ahead to get the system upgraded because the city is dated all the way around.

Mr. D'Amico stated we were talking about it earlier and as Mr. Mencini mentioned about getting laptops or pads or whatever you want to call it. There is a program from being with NOCCA (Northeast Ohio City Council Association) most Council's have the pads and there is a two-year program; they are rotated out and get upgrades all the time. It's a program that is continually paid through by upgrading systems that they get when they buy the program. Is there something with this that we can make sure that this is something similar to that so there's a cost effectiveness later on when there is research for more technology?

Mayor Coyne responded yes. Two things is when we have discussions about what we're going to do in the future doesn't really matter with the cloud system. Wherever we are located because you know with the Board of Zoning Appeals it's embarrassing when people have to make a presentation in our chambers. The answer to your question is yes and I think Council should look at that as part of their capital for this year.

Mr. Troyer thanked the team for working on this, getting these numbers to us and getting us a good deal because you won't be at the next meeting; thank you.

DISCUSSION – COMMUNICATIONS:

Mayor Coyne stated they will be at the next meeting and hopefully Council would consider if there are particular questions as I stated we would like to move this on.

There being no further business to come before this meeting Council President Patten declared this meeting adjourned at 8:03 p.m.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED *Michelle Blazak*
Michelle Blazak
Clerk of Council

APPROVED *December 15, 2015*

THESE MEETING MINUTES APPROVED BY BROOK PARK CITY COUNCIL ARE A SYNOPSIS, NOT TRANSCRIBED IN THEIR ENTIRETY, ALTHOUGH ACCURATE.